

Impact Factor: **1.3**

5-Year Impact Factor:

 Contents More

## Abstract

This study assesses rating agencies (CRA) Enron in December paper evaluates imp

By clicking “Accept Non-Essential Cookies”, you agree to the storing of cookies on your device to enhance site navigation, analyze site usage, and assist in our marketing efforts. [Privacy Policy](#) [Cookie Policy](#)

[Manage Cookies](#)[Accept Non-Essential Cookies](#)[Reject Non-Essential Cookies](#)

Commission (SEC) staff report by using evidence from empirical research studies, and suggests many promising subjects for future research. The analysis given in this paper, and the results of the suggested research (when available), should be of particular interest to lawmakers and regulators who are responsible for determining whether and to what extent the credit rating industry should be subject to statutory and regulatory oversight. Although little rigorously gathered empirical evidence supports the criticisms, many issues remain unresolved. Powerful tests related to potential conflicts of interest and alleged unfair practices are exceptionally difficult to design, and the alleged deficiencies of rating agencies' disclosure practices have yet to be analyzed. Finally, many criticisms are based on subjective benchmarks that are difficult to quantify and open to question. To date, however, accounting researchers have played only a minor role in the debate. Because they are well-versed in such areas as disclosure analysis, capital market tests, and the operation of financial intermediaries and external auditors, these researchers potentially have much to add in this regard.



## Get full access to this article

View all access and purchase options for this article.

[Get Access !\[\]\(3342c215b2a8b663596a81468d5dc314\_img.jpg\)](#)

## References

AFP (Association for Financial Professionals). 2004. *2004 Credit Rating Agency Survey—Report of Survey Results* (October). Bethesda, MD. Available at [www.afponline.org](http://www.afponline.org) (accessed June 2004).

[Google Scholar](#)

Altman E.I. 2002. “*Revisiting Credit Scoring Models in a Basel 2 Environment*”. Working Paper (May). Stern School of Business New York University.

[Google Scholar](#)

Altman E.I., Bharath S.T., Saunders A. 2002. “Credit Ratings and the BIS Capital Adequacy Reform Agenda”. *Journal of Banking & Finance*, 26 (5): 909–921.

[Crossref](#)

[Web of Science](#)

[Google Scholar](#)

Altman E.I., Saunders A. 2001. “An Analysis and Critique of the BIS Proposal on Capital Adequacy and Ratings”. *Journal of Banking & Finance*, 25 (1): 25–46.

[Crossref](#)

[Web of Science](#)

[Google Scholar](#)

Antonov I. 2000. “Crafting a Market Landscape: Quantitative vs. Judgmental Credit Risk-Rating Systems”. *The Journal of Lending & Credit Risk Management* (February): 34–40.

[Google Scholar](#)

Ashbaugh-Skaife H., Collins D.W., LaFond R. 2006. “The Effects of Corporate Governance on Firms' Credit Ratings”. *Journal of Accounting and Economics* (June): 203–243.

[Crossref](#)

[Web of Science](#)

[Google Scholar](#)

Beaver W.H., Shakespeare C., Soliman M.T. 2006. “Differential Properties in the Ratings of Certified vs. Non-Certified Bond Rating Agencies”. *Journal of Accounting and Economics* (December): 303–334.

[Crossref](#)

[Web of Science](#)

[Google Scholar](#)

Bhanot K., Mello A.S. 2006. “Should Corporate Debt Include a Rating Trigger?” *Journal of Financial Economics*, 79 (1): 69–98.

[Crossref](#)

[Web of Science](#)

[Google Scholar](#)

BIS (Bank for International Settlements). 2000. *Credit Ratings and Complementary Sources of Credit Quality Information*. Basel Committee on Banking Supervision Working Papers, No. 3 (August). Basel, Switzerland.

[Google Scholar](#)

BIS (Bank for International Settlements), Basel Committee on Banking Supervision. 2004. *International Convergence of Capital Measurement and Capital Standards—A Revised Framework* (June). Basel, Switzerland.

[Google Scholar](#)

Blume M.E., Lim F., MacKinlay A.C. 1998. "The Declining Credit Quality of U.S. Corporate Debt: Myth or Reality?" *The Journal of Finance*, LIII (August): 1389–1413.

[Crossref](#)

[Web of Science](#)

[Google Scholar](#)

Bolger R.M. 2005. *Testimony of Rita M. Bolger, Managing Director and Associate General Counsel, Standard & Poor's, Before the Capital Markets, Insurance, and Government Sponsored Enterprises Subcommittee of the House Financial Services Committee, United States House of Representatives* (June 29). Available at <http://financialservices.house.gov> (accessed August 2005.).

[Google Scholar](#)

Boot A.W.A., Milbourn T.T., Schmeits A. 2006. "Credit Ratings as Coordination Mechanisms". *Review of Financial Studies*, 19 (1): 81–118.

[Crossref](#)

[Web of Science](#)

[Google Scholar](#)

Butler A.W., Rodgers K.J. 2003. *"Relationship Rating: How Do Bond Rating Agencies Process Information?"* Working Paper (June 27). New York University and Rice University.

[Google Scholar](#)

Cantor R. 2001. "Moody's Investors Service Response to the Consultative Paper Issued by the Basel Committee on Bank Supervision 'A New Capital Adequacy Framework.'" *Journal of Banking & Finance*, 25 (1): 171–185.

[Crossref](#)

[Web of Science](#)

[Web of Science](#)

[Google Scholar](#)

Cantor R. 2004. "An Introduction to Recent Research on Credit Ratings". *Journal of Banking & Finance*, 28 (11): 2565–2573.

[Crossref](#)

[Web of Science](#)

[Google Scholar](#)

Cantor R., Mann C. 2003. *Measuring the Performance of Corporate Bond Ratings—Special Comment* (April). Moody's Investors Service.

[Google Scholar](#)

Cantor R., Packer F. 1994. "The Credit Rating Industry". *Federal Reserve Bank of New York Quarterly Review* (Summer/Fall): 1–26.

[Google Scholar](#)

Cantor R., Packer F. 1996. "Determinants and Impact of Sovereign Credit Ratings". *Economic Policy Review—Federal Reserve Bank of New York* (October): 37–53.

[Google Scholar](#)

Cantor R., Packer F. 1997. "Differences of Opinion and Selection Bias in the Credit Rating Industry". *Journal of Banking and Finance*, 21 (10): 1395–1417.

[Crossref](#)

[Web of Science](#)

[Google Scholar](#)

Carron A., Dhrymes P.J., Beloreshki T.N. 2003. *Credit Ratings for Structured Products: A Review of Analytical Methodologies, Credit Assessment Accuracy, and Issuer Selectivity among the Credit Ratings Agencies* (November 6). National Economic Research Associates (NERA). New York and Boston.

[Google Scholar](#)

Chung K., Frost C.A., Kim M. 2007. *The Information Value of Credit Watches*. Working Paper (June). State University of New York at Buffalo.

[Google Scholar](#)

Committee of European Securities Regulators, The. 2004. *Call to CESR For Technical Advice on Possible Measures Concerning Credit Rating Agencies—Call for Evidence*. Ref: CESR/04-394 (July 28). Paris, France.

[Google Scholar](#)

Covitz D.M., Harrison P. 2003. "Testing Conflicts of Interest at Bond Rating Agencies with Market Anticipation: Evidence that Reputation Incentives Dominate". Board of Governors of the Federal Reserve System (U.S.). Finance and Economics Discussion Series No. 2003-68. Washington, DC (December).

[Google Scholar](#)

Dale R.S., Thomas S.H. 1991. "The Regulatory Use of Credit Ratings in International Financial Markets". *The Journal of International Securities Markets* (Spring): 9–18.

[Google Scholar](#)

Dallas G. 1997. "The Role of Ratings in Public and Private Debt Markets". In *Ratings en Ratios*. Edited by F.D.K. Bosch, chapter 4. The Haag, The Netherlands: Delwel.

[Google Scholar](#)

Dichev I.D., Piotroski J.D. 2001. "The Long-Run Stock Returns Following Bond Ratings Changes". *The Journal of Finance* (February): 173–203.

[Crossref](#)

[Web of Science](#)

[Google Scholar](#)

Economist, The. 2002. "Quant Argue With That" (February 16): 69–70.

[Google Scholar](#)

Elton E.J., Gruber M.J., Agrawal D., Mann C. 2001. "Explaining the Rate Spread on Corporate Bonds". *The Journal of Finance* (February): 247–277.

[Crossref](#)

[Web of Science](#)

[Google Scholar](#)

Elton E.J., Gruber M.J., Agrawal D., Mann C. 2004. "Factors Affecting the Valuation of Corporate Bonds". *Journal of Banking & Finance*, 28 (11): 2747–2767.

[Crossref](#)

[Web of Science](#)

[Google Scholar](#)

Frost C.A., Kim M. 2006. "Credit Rating Agency Practices Before and After Enron". Working Paper (January). State University of New York at Buffalo.

[Google Scholar](#)

Gande A., Parsley D. 2005. "News Spillovers in the Sovereign Debt Market". *Journal of Financial Economics*, 75(March): 691–734.

[Crossref](#)

[Web of Science](#)

[Google Scholar](#)

Gilpin K.N. 1999. "Justice Department Inquiry on Moody's is Over, With No Charges Filed". *The New York Times*, March 13, C3.

[Google Scholar](#)

Gonzales F., Haas F., Johannes R., Persson M., Toledo L., Violi R., Wieland M., Zins C. 2004. *Market Dynamics Associated with Credit Ratings—A Literature Review*. European Central Bank Occasional Paper Series. No. 16 (June).

[Google Scholar](#)

Goh J.C., Ederington L.H. 1993. "Is a Bond Rating Downgrade Bad News, Good News, or No News for Stockholders?" *The Journal of Finance* (December): 2001–2008.

[Crossref](#)

[Web of Science](#)

[Google Scholar](#)

Goh J.C., Ederington L.H. 1999. "Cross-Sectional Variation in the Stock Market Reaction to Bond Rating Changes". *The Quarterly Review of Economics and Finance*, 39: 101–112.

[Crossref](#)

[Google Scholar](#)

Griep C., De Stefano M. 2001. "Standard & Poor's Official Response to the Basel Committee's Proposal". *Journal of Banking and Finance*, 25 (1): 149–169.

[Crossref](#)

[Web of Science](#)

[Google Scholar](#)

Griep C., Parisi F. 2001. *Outlook Proves Reliable Indicator of Companies' Default Probability* (October 25). Standard & Poor's Ratingsdirect.

[Google Scholar](#)

Hamilton D.T., Cantor R. 2004. *Rating Transitions and Defaults Conditional on Watchlist, Outlook and Rating History—Special Comment* (February). Moody's Investors Service Global Credit Research.

[Google Scholar](#)

Hand J.R.M., Holthausen R.W., Leftwich R.W. 1992. "The Effect of Bond Rating Agency Announcements on Bond and Stock Prices". *The Journal of Finance* (June): 733–752.

[Crossref](#)

[Web of Science](#)

[Google Scholar](#)

Healy P.M., Palepu K.G. 2003. "The Fall of Enron". *Journal of Economic Perspectives*, 17(Spring): 3–26.

[Crossref](#)

[Web of Science](#)

[Google Scholar](#)

Hill C.A. 2004. "Regulating the Rating Agencies". *Washington University Law Quarterly*, 82 (43): 43–95.

[Google Scholar](#)

Holthausen R.W., Leftwich R.W. 1986. "The Effect of Bond Rating Changes on Common Stock Prices". *Journal of Financial Economics*, 17 (1): 57–89.

[Crossref](#)

[Web of Science](#)

[Google Scholar](#)

Hull J., Predescu M., White A. 2004. "The Relationship Between Credit Default Swap Spreads, Bond Yields, and Credit Rating Announcements". *Journal of Banking and Finance*, 28 (11): 2789–2811.

[Crossref](#)

[Web of Science](#)

[Google Scholar](#)

IMF (International Monetary Fund). 1999. *International Capital Markets: Developments, Prospects, and Key Policy Issues* (September). World Economic and Financial Surveys.

[Crossref](#)

[Google Scholar](#)

IOSCO (International Organization of Securities Commissions), The Technical Committee. 2003a. *Report on the Activities of Credit Rating Agencies* (September). Madrid, Spain.

[Google Scholar](#)

IOSCO (International Organization of Securities Commissions), The Technical Committee. 2003b. *IOSCO Statement of Principles Regarding the Activities of Credit Rating Agencies* (September 25). Madrid, Spain.

[Google Scholar](#)

IOSCO (International Organization of Securities Commissions). 2004a. *IOSCO Issues Consultation Report on Code of Conduct Fundamentals for Credit Rating Agencies*. Press Release (October 7). Madrid, Spain.

[Google Scholar](#)

IOSCO (International Organization of Securities Commissions). 2004b. *Code of Conduct Fundamentals for Credit Rating Agencies - A Consultation Report of the Chairman's Task Force of the Technical Committee of*

the International Organization of Securities Commissions (October). Madrid, Spain.

[Google Scholar](#)

Investment Company Institute. 2003. *Comments on the United States Securities and Exchange Commission Concept Release Regarding Rating Agencies and the Use of Credit Ratings under the Federal Securities Laws (File No. S7-12-03)*. Letter from Amy B.R. Lancellotta, Senior Counsel (July 28). Available at <http://www.sec.gov/rules/concepts/s71203/alancellotta072803.htm> (accessed June 2004.).

[Google Scholar](#)

John K., Lynch A.W., Puri M. 2003. "Credit Ratings, Collateral, and Loan Characteristics: Implications for Yield". *Journal of Business*, 76 (3): 371–409.

[Crossref](#)

[Google Scholar](#)

Johnson R. 2003. "An Examination of Rating Agencies' Actions Around the Investment-Grade Boundary". Federal Reserve Bank of Kansas City Research Division. RWP 03-01 (February).

[Crossref](#)

[Google Scholar](#)

Jorion P., Liu Z., Shi C. 2005. "Informational Effects of Regulation FD: Evidence from Rating Agencies". *Journal of Financial Economics*, 76 (2): 309–330.

[Crossref](#)

[Web of Science](#)

[Google Scholar](#)

Jorion P., Shi C., Zhang S. 2007. "Tightening Credit Standards: The Role of Accounting Quality". Working Paper (March). University of California at Irvine.

[Google Scholar](#)

Kliger D., Sarig O. 2000. "The Information Value of Bond Ratings". *The Journal of Finance* (December): 2879–2902.

[Crossref](#)

[Web of Science](#)

[Google Scholar](#)

Linnell I. 2001. "A Critical Review of the New Capital Adequacy Framework Paper Issued by the Basel Committee on Banking Supervision and its Implications for the Rating Agency Industry". *Journal of Banking & Finance*, 25 (1): 187–196.

[Crossref](#)

[Web of Science](#)



[Google Scholar](#)

Longstaff F.A., Schwartz E.S. 1995. "A Simple Approach to Valuing Risky Fixed and Floating Rate Debt". *The Journal of Finance* (July): 789–819.

[Crossref](#)

[Google Scholar](#)

Moody's Investors Service-Global Credit Research. 2003. *The Role and Function of Rating Agencies: Evolving Perceptions and the Implications of Regulatory Oversight: Special Report* (February 10). New York.

[Google Scholar](#)

Morris J. 2002. "Investors Turn Cool on the Ratings Game". *Euromoney* (January): 38–40.

[Google Scholar](#)

Nazareth A.L. 2003. *Testimony of Annette L. Nazareth, Director, Division of Market Regulation, United States Securities and Exchange Commission, in Hearings Before the United States House of Representatives, Committee on Financial Services, Subcommittee on Capital Markets, Insurance, and Government Sponsored Enterprises—Concerning Rating the Rating Agencies: The State of Transparency and Competition* (April 2). Washington, D.C. Available at <http://sec.gov/news/testimony/ts040203aln.htm> (accessed September 2003).

[Google Scholar](#)

Norden L., Weber M. 2004. "Informational Efficiency of Credit Default Swap and Stock Markets: The Impact of Credit Rating Announcements". *Journal of Banking & Finance* (August): 2813–2843.

[Crossref](#)

[Web of Science](#)

[Google Scholar](#)

Oxley M.G. 2005. *Opening Statement by Chairman Michael G. Oxley, Financial Services Committee, Subcommittee on Capital Market, Insurance, and Government Sponsored Enterprises—Legislative Solutions for the Rating Agency Duopoly* (June 29). Available at <http://financial-services.house.gov> (accessed August 2005).

[Google Scholar](#)

Partnoy F. 1999. "The Siskel and Ebert of Financial Markets? Two Thumbs Down for the Credit Rating Agencies". *Washington University Law Quarterly*, 77: 619–714.

[Google Scholar](#)

Partnoy F. 2005. *Testimony of Frank Partnoy in Hearings before the United States House of Representatives, Committee on Financial Services, Subcommittee on Capital Markets, Insurance, and Government Sponsored Enterprises—Legislative Solutions for the Rating Agency Duopoly* (June 29). Available at <http://govt-aff.senate.gov> (accessed August 2005).

[Google Scholar](#)

Poon W.P.H. 2003. "Are Unsolicited Credit Ratings Biased Downward?" *Journal of Banking & Finance*, 27 (4): 592-614.

[Crossref](#)

[Web of Science](#)

[Google Scholar](#)

Pulliam S., Solomon D. 2002. "Uncooking the Books: How Three Unlikely Sleuths Discovered Fraud at WorldCom". *The Wall Street Journal*, October 30, A1, A6.

[Google Scholar](#)

Reiter S.A., Ziebart D.A. 1991. "Bond Yields, Ratings, and Financial Information: Evidence from Public Utility Issues". *The Financial Review* (February): 45-73.

[Crossref](#)

[Google Scholar](#)

Robbe P., Mahieu R. 2005. "Are the Standards Too Poor? An Empirical Analysis of the Timeliness and Predictability of Credit Rating Changes". Working Paper (January 31). RSM Erasmus University.

[Crossref](#)

[Google Scholar](#)

SEC (U.S. Securities and Exchange Commission). 2003a. *Report on the Role and Function of Credit Rating Agencies in the Operation of the Securities Markets As Required by Section 702(b) of the Sarbanes-Oxley Act of 2002* (January). Washington, D.C.

[Google Scholar](#)

SEC (U.S. Securities and Exchange Commission). 2003b. *Hearings on the Current Role and Function of the Credit Rating Agencies in the Operation of the Securities Markets, Friday, November 15, 2002* (revised January 15). Washington, D.C.: Diversified Reporting Services, Inc. Available at <http://www.sec.gov/new/s/extra/credrate/credrate111502.txt> (accessed September 2003).

[Google Scholar](#)

SEC (U.S. Securities and Exchange Commission). 2003c. *Concept Release: Rating Agencies and the Use of Credit Ratings under the Federal Securities Laws*. Release Nos. 33-8236; 34-47972; IC-26066; File No. S7-12-03 (June 4). Washington, D.C. Available at <http://www.sec.gov/spotlight/ratingagency> (accessed September 2003).

[Google Scholar](#)

SEC (U.S. Securities and Exchange Commission). 2005a. *Credit Ratings Agencies—NRSROs* (modified March 21). Available at <http://www.sec.gov/answers/nrsro.htm> (accessed July 2005).

[Google Scholar](#)

SEC (U.S. Securities and Exchange Commission). 2005b. *Proposed Rule - Definition of Nationally Recognized Statistical Rating Organization*. Release Nos. 33-8570; 34-51572; IC-26835; File No. S7-04-05 (April 19). Washington, D.C.

[Google Scholar](#)

S&P (Standard & Poor's). 2005. *Corporate Ratings Criteria 2005*. New York: Standard & Poor's. Available at [www.standardandpoors.com](http://www.standardandpoors.com) (accessed July 2005).

[Google Scholar](#)

Stevens P.S. 2005. *Statement of Paul Schott Stevens, President - Investment Company Institute Before the Committee on Financial Services, United States House of Representatives on H.R. 2990—Credit Rating Agency Duopoly Relief Act of 2005* (November 29). Available at <http://financialservices.house.gov> (accessed November 2005).

[Google Scholar](#)

Stumpp P.M. 2001. *The Unintended Consequences of Rating Triggers* (December). New York: Moody's Investors Service—Global Credit Research.

[Google Scholar](#)

Tafara E. 2005. *Speech by SEC Staff: Remarks for the International Organization of Securities Commissions Annual Conference Panel on the Regulation of Credit Rating Agencies* (April 6). Colombo, Sri Lanka.

[Google Scholar](#)

U.S. House of Representatives, Committee on Financial Services. 2003. *Hearing Entitled: Rating Agencies: the State of Transparency and Competition* (April 2). Washington, D.C. Available at <http://financialservices.house.gov> (accessed August 2005).

[Google Scholar](#)

U.S. House of Representatives, Committee on Financial Services. 2004. *Hearing Entitled: The Ratings Game: Improving Transparency and Competition Among the Credit Rating Agencies* (September 14). Washington, D.C. Available at <http://financialservices.house.gov> (accessed August 2005).

[Google Scholar](#)

U.S. House of Representatives, Committee on Financial Services. 2005a. *"Oxley Schedules Field Hearing on The Credit Rating Agency Duopoly Relief Act of 2005"*. Press Release (November 22). Available at <http://financialservices.house.gov> (accessed November 2005).

[Google Scholar](#)

U.S. House of Representatives, Committee on Financial Services. 2005b. *Hearing Entitled: Legislative Solutions for the Rating Agency Duopoly* (June 29). Washington, D.C. Available at <http://financialservices.house.gov> (accessed August 2005).

[Google Scholar](#)

U.S. House of Representatives, Committee on Financial Services. 2005c. *Hearing Entitled: Reforming Credit Rating Agencies: The SEC's Need for Statutory Authority* (April 12). Washington, D.C. Available at <http://financialservices.house.gov> (accessed August 2005).

[Google Scholar](#)

U.S. Senate, Committee on Governmental Affairs. 2002. *Financial Oversight of Enron: The SEC and Private-Sector Watchdogs—Report of the Staff to the Senate Committee on Governmental Affairs* (October 8). Washington, D.C.

[Google Scholar](#)

U.S. Senate, Committee on Governmental Affairs. 2003. *Staff Report: Enron's Credit Rating: Enron's Bankers' Contacts with Moody's and Government Officials*. Washington, D.C., U.S. Government Printing Office.

[Google Scholar](#)

Veverka F. 2003. "S & P Offers Analytic Tools for Risk Rating by Banks". *Financial Times*, December 9, 14.

[Google Scholar](#)

Watts R. 1998. "Implications of Contracting for Financial Accounting Research". *Asia-Pacific Journal of Accounting*, 5(June): 1–24.

[Crossref](#)

[Google Scholar](#)

Watts R. 2003. "Conservatism in Accounting Part I: Explanations and Implications". *Accounting Horizons*, 17: 207–221.

[Crossref](#)

[Google Scholar](#)

Watts R., Zimmerman J. 1986. *Positive Accounting Theory*. Englewood Cliffs, NJ: Prentice Hall.

[Google Scholar](#)

#### Similar articles:



Restricted access

[A hard nut to crack: Regulatory failure shows how rating really works](#)

Show Details ▾



Restricted access

['Who Rates the Raters?' The Regulation of Credit Rating Agencies in the EU](#)

Show Details ▾



Free access

[The Credit Rating Agencies — Are They Reliable? A Study of Sovereign Ratings](#)

Show Details ▾

[View More](#)

Sage recommends:

**SAGE Knowledge**

Entry

[Corporate Governance](#)

Show Details ▾

**SAGE Knowledge**

Entry

[Financial Intermediaries](#)

Show Details ▾

**SAGE Knowledge**

Entry

[Conflicts of Interest in Science](#)

Show Details ▾

[View More](#)

You currently have no access to this content. Visit the [access options](#) page to authenticate.

[Download PDF](#)

Also from Sage

CQ Library

Elevating debate

Sage Data

Uncovering insight

Sage Business Cases

Shaping futures

Sage Campus

Unleashing potential

## Sage Knowledge

---

Multimedia learning resources

## Sage Research Methods

---

Supercharging research

## Sage Video

---

Streaming knowledge

## Technology from Sage

---

Library digital services