## **SPRINGER NATURE** Link

**⊟** Menu

**O** Search

🗁 Cart

Log in

Home > Tax and Corporate Governance > Conference paper

# Financial and Tax Accounting: Transparency and "Truth"

Conference paper

pp 71–92 Cite this conference paper



Tax and Corporate Governance

### Your privacy, your choice

We use essential cookies to make sure the site can function. We, and our 93 **partners**, also use optional cookies and similar technologies for advertising, personalisation of content, usage analysis, and social media.

By accepting optional cookies, you consent to allowing us and our partners to store and access personal data on your device, such as browsing behaviour and unique identifiers. Some third parties are outside of the European Economic Area, with varying standards of data protection. See our **privacy policy** for more information on the use of your personal data. Your consent choices apply to nature.com and applicable subdomains.

You can find further information, and change your preferences via 'Manage preferences'. You can also change your preferences or withdraw consent at any time via 'Your privacy choices', found in the footer of every page.

We use cookies and similar technologies for the following purposes:

- > Store and/or access information on a device
- > Personalised advertising and content, advertising and content measurement, audience research and services development

Accept all cookies

**Reject optional cookies** 

Manage preferences

however, and recent developments in accounting may be increasing divergence rather than reducing it. Despite the strong arguments in favor of conformity, there are also good reasons for some divergences, meaning that the most likely outcome in any system, whatever the starting point, is partial convergence. The problem with a hybrid outcome of this kind is that, at the point of divergence, there can be conceptual confusion and difficulties in integrating and managing two conceptually very different rule systems. Clarity of the relationship between the rules and improved accounting disclosure requirements might be more important than convergence, and might be achieved with less distortion to either tax or financial accounting. The current U.K. position is used to illustrate these points.

The author thanks the organizers and participants of the Symposium on Tax and Corporate Governance at the Max Planck Institute for Intellectual Property,

## Your privacy, your choice

We use essential cookies to make sure the site can function. We, and our 93 **partners**, also use optional cookies and similar technologies for advertising, personalisation of content, usage analysis, and social media.

By accepting optional cookies, you consent to allowing us and our partners to store and access personal data on your device, such as browsing behaviour and unique identifiers. Some third parties are outside of the European Economic Area, with varying standards of data protection. See our **privacy policy** for more information on the use of your personal data. Your consent choices apply to nature.com and applicable subdomains.

You can find further information, and change your preferences via 'Manage preferences'. You can also change your preferences or withdraw consent at any time via 'Your privacy choices', found in the footer of every page.

We use cookies and similar technologies for the following purposes:

#### Store and/or access information on a device

Accept all cookies
Reject optional cookies
Manage preferences



## References

1 KING/ THORNHILL, Niklas Luhmann's Theory of Politics and Law (2003).

## Your privacy, your choice

We use essential cookies to make sure the site can function. We, and our 93 **partners**, also use optional cookies and similar technologies for advertising, personalisation of content, usage analysis, and social media.

By accepting optional cookies, you consent to allowing us and our partners to store and access personal data on your device, such as browsing behaviour and unique identifiers. Some third parties are outside of the European Economic Area, with varying standards of data protection. See our **privacy policy** for more information on the use of your personal data. Your consent choices apply to nature.com and applicable subdomains.

You can find further information, and change your preferences via 'Manage preferences'. You can also change your preferences or withdraw consent at any time via 'Your privacy choices', found in the footer of every page.

We use cookies and similar technologies for the following purposes:

#### Store and/or access information on a device

Accept all cookies
Reject optional cookies
Manage preferences

06.pdf#search=%22staff%20of%20joint%20committee%20on%20taxation%20b ook%20tax%20conformity%22); WALKER, Financial Accounting and Corporate Behavior, Boston Univ. School of Law Working Paper No. 06-05 (2006) (available at SSRN: http://ssrn.com/abstract=894002).

#### **Google Scholar**

6 See SCHÖN, International Accounting Standards — A "Starting Point" for a Common European Tax Base?, 44 European Taxation 426 (2004); SCHÖN, The Odd Couple: A Common Future for Financial and Tax Accounting?, 58 Tax Law Review 111 (2005); FREEDMAN, Aligning Taxable Profits and Accounting Profits: Accounting Standards, Legislators and Judges, 2 eJournal Tax Research 71 (2004). See also the debate on a Common Consolidated Corporate Tax Base, discussed below.

## Your privacy, your choice

We use essential cookies to make sure the site can function. We, and our 93 **partners**, also use optional cookies and similar technologies for advertising, personalisation of content, usage analysis, and social media.

By accepting optional cookies, you consent to allowing us and our partners to store and access personal data on your device, such as browsing behaviour and unique identifiers. Some third parties are outside of the European Economic Area, with varying standards of data protection. See our **privacy policy** for more information on the use of your personal data. Your consent choices apply to nature.com and applicable subdomains.

You can find further information, and change your preferences via 'Manage preferences'. You can also change your preferences or withdraw consent at any time via 'Your privacy choices', found in the footer of every page.

We use cookies and similar technologies for the following purposes:

#### Store and/or access information on a device

Accept all cookies
Reject optional cookies
Manage preferences

for tax avoidance in the USA, which attempts to isolate only that part of the book-tax gap not attributable to accounting accruals *see* DESAI/DHARMAPALA, Corporate Tax Avoidance and High Powered Incentives, 79 Journal of Financial Economics 145 (2006); DESAI/DHARMAPALA, *supra* note 5. The difficulties involved in producing these figures are discussed in depth in HANLON/SHEVLIN, *supra* note 5.

#### Article Google Scholar

13 See MILLER, supra note 3; HICKS, Maintaining capital intact: a further suggestion, Economica IX 174-79 (1942), cited in: MACDONALD, HMRC v William Grant & Sons Distillers Ltd and Small (Inspector of Taxes) v Mars U.K. Ltd: accountancy practice and the computation of profit, 2007 British Tax Review 366.

### Your privacy, your choice

We use essential cookies to make sure the site can function. We, and our 93 **partners**, also use optional cookies and similar technologies for advertising, personalisation of content, usage analysis, and social media.

By accepting optional cookies, you consent to allowing us and our partners to store and access personal data on your device, such as browsing behaviour and unique identifiers. Some third parties are outside of the European Economic Area, with varying standards of data protection. See our **privacy policy** for more information on the use of your personal data. Your consent choices apply to nature.com and applicable subdomains.

You can find further information, and change your preferences via 'Manage preferences'. You can also change your preferences or withdraw consent at any time via 'Your privacy choices', found in the footer of every page.

We use cookies and similar technologies for the following purposes:

#### Store and/or access information on a device

Accept all cookies
Reject optional cookies
Manage preferences

19 WILSON, *supra* note 17; NOBES, A Conceptual Framework for the Taxable Income of Businesses, and How to Apply it under the IFRS, 38 (2003).

**Google Scholar** 

20 HANLON/ SHEVLIN, *supra* note 5.

**Google Scholar** 

21 For details of the U.S. standard setting structure *see* KNOTT/ROSENFELD, *supra* note 5.

**Google Scholar** 

#### 2.3 Cited in PLESKO/MILLS. supra note 5.

## Your privacy, your choice

We use essential cookies to make sure the site can function. We, and our 93 **partners**, also use optional cookies and similar technologies for advertising, personalisation of content, usage analysis, and social media.

By accepting optional cookies, you consent to allowing us and our partners to store and access personal data on your device, such as browsing behaviour and unique identifiers. Some third parties are outside of the European Economic Area, with varying standards of data protection. See our **privacy policy** for more information on the use of your personal data. Your consent choices apply to nature.com and applicable subdomains.

You can find further information, and change your preferences via 'Manage preferences'. You can also change your preferences or withdraw consent at any time via 'Your privacy choices', found in the footer of every page.

We use cookies and similar technologies for the following purposes:

#### Store and/or access information on a device

Accept all cookies
Reject optional cookies
Manage preferences

29 HUGHES, "Former KPMG head calls for fix in system", Financial Times, October 11, 2007.

#### **Google Scholar**

30 See Global Capital Markets and the Global Economy: A Vision From the CEOs of the International Audit Networks (2006) (available at www.deloitte.com/dtt/cda/doc/content/dtt CEOVision110806(2).pdf).

#### **Google Scholar**

31 This seems to be the assumption of the U.K. Government in their consultation papers on Corporation Tax Reform, supporting alignment: Inland Revenue and H.M. Treasury (2002) Reform of Corporation Tax (London); Inland Revenue and H.M. Treasury (2003) Reform of Corporation Tax. London

## Your privacy, your choice

We use essential cookies to make sure the site can function. We, and our 93 **partners**, also use optional cookies and similar technologies for advertising, personalisation of content, usage analysis, and social media.

By accepting optional cookies, you consent to allowing us and our partners to store and access personal data on your device, such as browsing behaviour and unique identifiers. Some third parties are outside of the European Economic Area, with varying standards of data protection. See our **privacy policy** for more information on the use of your personal data. Your consent choices apply to nature.com and applicable subdomains.

You can find further information, and change your preferences via 'Manage preferences'. You can also change your preferences or withdraw consent at any time via 'Your privacy choices', found in the footer of every page.

We use cookies and similar technologies for the following purposes:

#### Store and/or access information on a device

Accept all cookies
Reject optional cookies
Manage preferences

37 Thor Power Tool Co. v Commissioner, 439 US 522 (1979) and see SCHÖN, The Odd Couple, supra note 6.

#### **Google Scholar**

39 For some cases where the courts have not followed accounting practice in assessing taxable income see Minister of National Revenue v Anaconda, [1956] AC 85; Sharkey v Wernher, [1956] AC 58; BSC Footwear Ltd v Ridgway, 1971 2All ER 534 (HL); Willingale v International Commercial Bank Ltd., [1978] 1 All ER 754; however there is debate about the rationale for some of these decisions.

**Google Scholar** 

#### 11 HER7IG Tax versus Commercial Accounting in Germany in THORELL (ed.)

## Your privacy, your choice

We use essential cookies to make sure the site can function. We, and our 93 **partners**, also use optional cookies and similar technologies for advertising, personalisation of content, usage analysis, and social media.

By accepting optional cookies, you consent to allowing us and our partners to store and access personal data on your device, such as browsing behaviour and unique identifiers. Some third parties are outside of the European Economic Area, with varying standards of data protection. See our **privacy policy** for more information on the use of your personal data. Your consent choices apply to nature.com and applicable subdomains.

You can find further information, and change your preferences via 'Manage preferences'. You can also change your preferences or withdraw consent at any time via 'Your privacy choices', found in the footer of every page.

We use cookies and similar technologies for the following purposes:

#### Store and/or access information on a device

Accept all cookies
Reject optional cookies
Manage preferences

46 EUROPEAN COMMISSION: Table on use of IAS in the EU (2006) (*see* http://ec.europa.eu/internal\_market/accounting/docs/ias/ias-use-of-options\_en.pdf).

**Google Scholar** 

47 ASB, Convergence of U.K. standards with IFRS (2006) (*see* www.frc.org.uk/asb/technical/projects/project0072.html).

**Google Scholar** 

49 NORBERG, supra note 43.

**Google Scholar** 

## Your privacy, your choice

We use essential cookies to make sure the site can function. We, and our 93 **partners**, also use optional cookies and similar technologies for advertising, personalisation of content, usage analysis, and social media.

By accepting optional cookies, you consent to allowing us and our partners to store and access personal data on your device, such as browsing behaviour and unique identifiers. Some third parties are outside of the European Economic Area, with varying standards of data protection. See our **privacy policy** for more information on the use of your personal data. Your consent choices apply to nature.com and applicable subdomains.

You can find further information, and change your preferences via 'Manage preferences'. You can also change your preferences or withdraw consent at any time via 'Your privacy choices', found in the footer of every page.

We use cookies and similar technologies for the following purposes:

#### Store and/or access information on a device

Accept all cookies
Reject optional cookies
Manage preferences

(2003) and EUROPEAN COMMISSION, Summary report on results of consultation (2003) (both to be found on www.europa.eu.int/comm/taxation\_customs/taxation/consultations/ias.htm); Communication from EU Commission (2003) (COM 2003 726 final) An Internal Market without company tax obstacles: achievements, ongoing initiatives and remaining challenges (*see* http://europa.eu.int/eurlex/en/com/cnc/2003/com2003\_0726en01.pdf).

**Google Scholar** 

57 Commission Non-Paper to informal Ecofin Council, September 10 and 11, 2004, A Common Consolidated EU Corporate Tax Base (*see* http://ec.europa.eu/taxation\_customs/resources/documents/taxation/company\_ tax/common\_tax\_base/CCTBWPNon\_Paper.pdf).

## Your privacy, your choice

We use essential cookies to make sure the site can function. We, and our 93 **partners**, also use optional cookies and similar technologies for advertising, personalisation of content, usage analysis, and social media.

By accepting optional cookies, you consent to allowing us and our partners to store and access personal data on your device, such as browsing behaviour and unique identifiers. Some third parties are outside of the European Economic Area, with varying standards of data protection. See our **privacy policy** for more information on the use of your personal data. Your consent choices apply to nature.com and applicable subdomains.

You can find further information, and change your preferences via 'Manage preferences'. You can also change your preferences or withdraw consent at any time via 'Your privacy choices', found in the footer of every page.

We use cookies and similar technologies for the following purposes:

#### Store and/or access information on a device

Accept all cookies
Reject optional cookies
Manage preferences

proposals to further align capital gains taxation with corporation tax. These proposals have not been adopted to date.

**Google Scholar** 

63 For an example *see* the Finance Act 2006 definition of funding leases which goes beyond the accounting definition of finance lease: CARSON, Traditional Equipment Leasing, The Tax Journal, October 23, 2006, 11.

**Google Scholar** 

65 For a more detailed history of the introduction of this provision *see* FREEDMAN, *supra* note 6.

**Google Scholar** 

## Your privacy, your choice

We use essential cookies to make sure the site can function. We, and our 93 **partners**, also use optional cookies and similar technologies for advertising, personalisation of content, usage analysis, and social media.

By accepting optional cookies, you consent to allowing us and our partners to store and access personal data on your device, such as browsing behaviour and unique identifiers. Some third parties are outside of the European Economic Area, with varying standards of data protection. See our **privacy policy** for more information on the use of your personal data. Your consent choices apply to nature.com and applicable subdomains.

You can find further information, and change your preferences via 'Manage preferences'. You can also change your preferences or withdraw consent at any time via 'Your privacy choices', found in the footer of every page.

We use cookies and similar technologies for the following purposes:

#### Store and/or access information on a device

Accept all cookies
Reject optional cookies
Manage preferences

**Google Scholar** 

73 [2006] STC 69.

**Google Scholar** 

74 For some examples of such cases *see* FREEDMAN, *supra* note 6. On the question of the capital/revenue divide being a question of law *see* the unequivocal statement of Lord Denning in *Heather v P E Consulting Group Ltd*, [1972] 48TC293: "The courts have always been assisted greatly by the evidence of accountants. Their practice should be given due weight; but the courts have never regarded themselves as being bound by it. It would be wrong to do so. The question of what is capital and what is revenue is a

## Your privacy, your choice

We use essential cookies to make sure the site can function. We, and our 93 **partners**, also use optional cookies and similar technologies for advertising, personalisation of content, usage analysis, and social media.

By accepting optional cookies, you consent to allowing us and our partners to store and access personal data on your device, such as browsing behaviour and unique identifiers. Some third parties are outside of the European Economic Area, with varying standards of data protection. See our **privacy policy** for more information on the use of your personal data. Your consent choices apply to nature.com and applicable subdomains.

You can find further information, and change your preferences via 'Manage preferences'. You can also change your preferences or withdraw consent at any time via 'Your privacy choices', found in the footer of every page.

We use cookies and similar technologies for the following purposes:

#### Store and/or access information on a device

Accept all cookies	
Reject optional cookies	
Manage preferences	

case?, The Tax Journal, April 9, 2007, 6, their Lordships made the case seem so simple that they left us with a real problem to understand why it ever got as far as it did; this suggests some over-simplification of the issues.

#### **Google Scholar**

80 [1956] AC 85.

#### **Google Scholar**

81 Following this decision, LIFO was rarely considered to be good accounting practice either: contrast the U.S. where LIFO appears to have been used for tax reasons and attempts to limit this by a statutory conformity requirement failed because everyone accepted that this figure would be tax driven and accounts provided additional information in other ways: see SHAVIRO. The

## Your privacy, your choice

We use essential cookies to make sure the site can function. We, and our 93 **partners**, also use optional cookies and similar technologies for advertising, personalisation of content, usage analysis, and social media.

By accepting optional cookies, you consent to allowing us and our partners to store and access personal data on your device, such as browsing behaviour and unique identifiers. Some third parties are outside of the European Economic Area, with varying standards of data protection. See our **privacy policy** for more information on the use of your personal data. Your consent choices apply to nature.com and applicable subdomains.

You can find further information, and change your preferences via 'Manage preferences'. You can also change your preferences or withdraw consent at any time via 'Your privacy choices', found in the footer of every page.

We use cookies and similar technologies for the following purposes:

#### Store and/or access information on a device

Accept all cookies
Reject optional cookies
Manage preferences

85 As explained by Lightman J [2005] STC 958 at para. 39.

**Google Scholar** 

86 [2005] STC 958 at para. 36.

**Google Scholar** 

87 See supra note 74.

**Google Scholar** 

88 See TRUMAN, supra note 82.

Google Scholar

## Your privacy, your choice

We use essential cookies to make sure the site can function. We, and our 93 **partners**, also use optional cookies and similar technologies for advertising, personalisation of content, usage analysis, and social media.

By accepting optional cookies, you consent to allowing us and our partners to store and access personal data on your device, such as browsing behaviour and unique identifiers. Some third parties are outside of the European Economic Area, with varying standards of data protection. See our **privacy policy** for more information on the use of your personal data. Your consent choices apply to nature.com and applicable subdomains.

You can find further information, and change your preferences via 'Manage preferences'. You can also change your preferences or withdraw consent at any time via 'Your privacy choices', found in the footer of every page.

We use cookies and similar technologies for the following purposes:

#### Store and/or access information on a device

Accept all cookies	
Reject optional cookies	
Manage preferences	

which comes close to the accounting treatment. 93 Finance Act 2006, Schedule 8 amending Capital Allowances Act 2001.

**Google Scholar** 

94 For examples of such a response under the present system, *see*, in addition to *Gallagher v Jones*, the cases on "judicial gap filling" discussed in FREEDMAN, *supra* note 6, at 87 *et seq*.

**Google Scholar** 

95 KING/ THORNHILL, *supra* note 1, at 26–27; NOBLES/SCHIFF, A Sociology of Jurisprudence (2006).

**Google Scholar** 

### Your privacy, your choice

We use essential cookies to make sure the site can function. We, and our 93 **partners**, also use optional cookies and similar technologies for advertising, personalisation of content, usage analysis, and social media.

By accepting optional cookies, you consent to allowing us and our partners to store and access personal data on your device, such as browsing behaviour and unique identifiers. Some third parties are outside of the European Economic Area, with varying standards of data protection. See our **privacy policy** for more information on the use of your personal data. Your consent choices apply to nature.com and applicable subdomains.

You can find further information, and change your preferences via 'Manage preferences'. You can also change your preferences or withdraw consent at any time via 'Your privacy choices', found in the footer of every page.

We use cookies and similar technologies for the following purposes:

#### Store and/or access information on a device

Accept all cookies
Reject optional cookies
Manage preferences

100 HUBBARD (panel member), Presentation on Tax Accounting versus Commercial Accounting, IFA Congress 2006.

**Google Scholar** 

101 KNOTT/ ROSENFELD, *supra* note 5, Part II, discuss the issues of publication of tax returns and the Schedule M-1 reconciliation of book and tax accounts. *See* also MANZON/PLESKO, The Relation Between Financial and Tax Reporting Measures of Income, 55 Tax Law Review 175 (2002); LENTER/SLEMROD/SHACKLEFORD, Public Disclosure of Corporate Tax Return Information: Accounting, Economics and Legal Perspectives, 56 National Tax Journal 803 (2003).

**Google Scholar** 

### Your privacy, your choice

We use essential cookies to make sure the site can function. We, and our 93 **partners**, also use optional cookies and similar technologies for advertising, personalisation of content, usage analysis, and social media.

By accepting optional cookies, you consent to allowing us and our partners to store and access personal data on your device, such as browsing behaviour and unique identifiers. Some third parties are outside of the European Economic Area, with varying standards of data protection. See our **privacy policy** for more information on the use of your personal data. Your consent choices apply to nature.com and applicable subdomains.

You can find further information, and change your preferences via 'Manage preferences'. You can also change your preferences or withdraw consent at any time via 'Your privacy choices', found in the footer of every page.

We use cookies and similar technologies for the following purposes:

#### Store and/or access information on a device

Accept all cookies	
Reject optional cookies	
Manage preferences	

## **Copyright information**

© 2008 Springer-Verlag Berlin Heidelberg

## About this paper

## **Cite this paper**

Freedman, J. (2008). Financial and Tax Accounting: Transparency and "Truth". In: Schön, W. (eds) Tax and Corporate Governance. MPI Studies on Intellectual Property, Competition and Tax Law, vol 3. Springer, Berlin, Heidelberg. https://doi.org/10.1007/978-3-540-77276-7\_6

#### <u>.RIS↓ .ENW↓ .BIB↓</u>

## Your privacy, your choice

We use essential cookies to make sure the site can function. We, and our 93 **partners**, also use optional cookies and similar technologies for advertising, personalisation of content, usage analysis, and social media.

By accepting optional cookies, you consent to allowing us and our partners to store and access personal data on your device, such as browsing behaviour and unique identifiers. Some third parties are outside of the European Economic Area, with varying standards of data protection. See our **privacy policy** for more information on the use of your personal data. Your consent choices apply to nature.com and applicable subdomains.

You can find further information, and change your preferences via 'Manage preferences'. You can also change your preferences or withdraw consent at any time via 'Your privacy choices', found in the footer of every page.

We use cookies and similar technologies for the following purposes:

#### Store and/or access information on a device

Accept all cookies
Reject optional cookies
Manage preferences

## **Navigation**

Find a journal

Publish with us

Track your research

### Your privacy, your choice

We use essential cookies to make sure the site can function. We, and our 93 **partners**, also use optional cookies and similar technologies for advertising, personalisation of content, usage analysis, and social media.

By accepting optional cookies, you consent to allowing us and our partners to store and access personal data on your device, such as browsing behaviour and unique identifiers. Some third parties are outside of the European Economic Area, with varying standards of data protection. See our **privacy policy** for more information on the use of your personal data. Your consent choices apply to nature.com and applicable subdomains.

You can find further information, and change your preferences via 'Manage preferences'. You can also change your preferences or withdraw consent at any time via 'Your privacy choices', found in the footer of every page.

We use cookies and similar technologies for the following purposes:

#### Store and/or access information on a device

Accept all cookies
Reject optional cookies
Manage preferences