

[Home](#) > [The Journal of Real Estate Finance and Economics](#) > Article

[Published: 17 July 2008](#)

Commercial Real Estate Valuation: Fundamentals Versus Investor Sentiment

[Jim Clayton](#), [David C. Ling](#)  & [Andy Naranjo](#)

[The Journal of Real Estate Finance and Economics](#)

38, 5–37 (2009)

6237 Accesses | **114** Citations | [Metrics](#)

Abstract

This paper investigates the role of fundamentals and investor sentiment in commercial real estate valuation. In real estate markets, heterogeneous properties trade in illiquid, highly segmented and informationally inefficient local markets. Moreover, the inability to short sell private real estate restricts the ability of sophisticated traders to enter the market and eliminate mispricing. These characteristics would seem to render private real estate markets highly susceptible to sentiment-induced

Your Privacy

We use cookies to make sure that our website works properly, as well as some optional cookies to personalise content and advertising, provide social media features and analyse how people use our site. By accepting some or all optional cookies you give consent to the processing of your personal data, including transfer to third parties, some in countries outside of the European Economic Area that do not offer the same data protection standards as the country where you live. You can decide which optional cookies to accept by clicking on "Manage preferences", where you can also find more information about how your personal data is processed. Further information can be found in our [privacy_policy](#).

Accept all cookies

[Manage preferences](#)

T-bond yields, and lagged adjustments from long run equilibrium.

This is a preview of subscription content, [access via your institution](#).

Access options

Buy article PDF

39,95 €

Price includes VAT (Poland)

Instant access to the full article PDF.

[Rent this article via DeepDyve.](#)

[Learn more about Institutional subscriptions](#)

Notes

Your Privacy

We use cookies to make sure that our website works properly, as well as some optional cookies to personalise content and advertising, provide social media features and analyse how people use our site. By accepting some or all optional cookies you give consent to the processing of your personal data, including transfer to third parties, some in countries outside of the European Economic Area that do not offer the same data protection standards as the country where you live. You can decide which optional cookies to accept by clicking on "Manage preferences", where you can also find more information about how your personal data is processed. Further information can be found in our [privacy policy](#).

Accept all cookies

[Manage preferences](#)

literature.

3. As part of the growing behavioral finance literature, researchers have also begun to carefully explore the impact of “flows” and trading activity on asset prices in public markets. See, for example, Warther ([1995](#)), Edelen and Warner ([2001](#)), Froot et al. ([2001](#)), Brown et al. ([2002](#)), Griffin et al. ([2007](#)), and Fama and French (2007). Clayton ([2003](#)) reviews much of this literature with a focus on the implications for private real estate.
4. Gompers and Lerner ([2000](#)) study the relationship between flow of funds (commitments) into venture capital funds and the valuation of new investments (firms) financed by the venture capital funds. Their findings are consistent with an uninformed demand /sentiment explanation of the link between fund flows and valuations.
5. NOI is assumed to include a reserve for expected capital expenditures and other nonrecurring expenses, such as leasing commissions.
6. State and federal income tax effects also affect property values and, therefore, price/NOI multiples.

Your Privacy

We use cookies to make sure that our website works properly, as well as some optional cookies to personalise content and advertising, provide social media features and analyse how people use our site. By accepting some or all optional cookies you give consent to the processing of your personal data, including transfer to third parties, some in countries outside of the European Economic Area that do not offer the same data protection standards as the country where you live. You can decide which optional cookies to accept by clicking on "Manage preferences", where you can also find more information about how your personal data is processed. Further information can be found in our [privacy_policy](#).

Accept all cookies

[Manage preferences](#)

run, property price fluctuations are driven primarily by changes in expected returns and not expected rents.

8. The specification in Eq. 4 uses the results of Eq. 3 to specify the equilibrium cap rate as a function of the discount rate, r_t , and expected NOI growth, g_t , but does not impose the exact relationship, $R_t = r_t - g_t$, that holds under the constant growth assumption.
9. Several stock market studies find institutions to be informed investors; i.e., “smart money.” See, for example, Chakravarty ([2001](#)), Jones and Lipson ([2004](#)), and Sias et al. ([2006](#)). However, this evidence is tempered by studies that suggest institutions do not outperform individual investors (e.g. Nofsinger and Sias [1999](#), and Kaniel et al. [2005](#)).
10. *Real Estate Report*, Summer 2002.
11. Note that, in theory, cap rate movements are driven by variations in expected net rental income (NOI). We assume that such expectations are highly correlated with expected changes in market rental rates.

Your Privacy

We use cookies to make sure that our website works properly, as well as some optional cookies to personalise content and advertising, provide social media features and analyse how people use our site. By accepting some or all optional cookies you give consent to the processing of your personal data, including transfer to third parties, some in countries outside of the European Economic Area that do not offer the same data protection standards as the country where you live. You can decide which optional cookies to accept by clicking on "Manage preferences", where you can also find more information about how your personal data is processed. Further information can be found in our [privacy_policy](#).

Accept all cookies

[Manage preferences](#)

13. The NCREIF property index is comprised of the same class of properties and investors as the RERC survey. The quarterly “constant liquidity” version of the NPI is developed in Fisher, Geltner and Pollakowski (2007). The authors recognize that private, relatively illiquid asset markets adjust through both changes in prices and liquidity; observed transaction prices are conditional on overall market liquidity at the time of sale (i.e., price and liquidity are jointly determined). A “constant liquidity value” of a property is the value assuming no change in the level of market transaction activity; all adjustment takes place through price. The difference between the constant liquidity and hedonic value index, based on observed transaction prices that implicitly reflect time variation in liquidity, provides a calibration of commercial property liquidity. The TBI, including its constant liquidity version, are available at the MIT Center for Real Estate website.

14. Dokko et al. (1999) provide an overview of alternative explanations for real estate cycles that includes the potential role of mortgage flows. Pavlov and Wachter (2006) suggest that the underpricing

Your Privacy

We use cookies to make sure that our website works properly, as well as some optional cookies to personalise content and advertising, provide social media features and analyse how people use our site. By accepting some or all optional cookies you give consent to the processing of your personal data, including transfer to third parties, some in countries outside of the European Economic Area that do not offer the same data protection standards as the country where you live. You can decide which optional cookies to accept by clicking on "Manage preferences", where you can also find more information about how your personal data is processed. Further information can be found in our [privacy_policy](#).

Accept all cookies

[Manage preferences](#)

15. Baker and Stein ([2004](#)) develop a theoretical model in which aggregate liquidity acts as an indicator of the relative presence of sentiment-based traders in the market place and therefore the divergence of asset price from fundamental value. Abnormally high aggregate liquidity (high turnover and/or low bid-ask spreads) is evidence of overvaluation and in fact forecasts a downturn in stock prices.
16. The lagged cap rate change was initially included to expand the dynamic adjustment process. However, it was dropped from the analysis because in no specification was its estimated coefficient statistically significant.
17. An alternative approach would be to estimate a structural equation system. However, this would require identifying restriction assumptions and would also be problematic given the non-stationary and cointegrated nature of our data.
18. See, for example, Baker and Stein ([2004](#)). Yu and Yuan ([2007](#)) also find that irrationality is more prevalent in rising markets.

10. The version of the CLN sentiment index used here is

Your Privacy

We use cookies to make sure that our website works properly, as well as some optional cookies to personalise content and advertising, provide social media features and analyse how people use our site. By accepting some or all optional cookies you give consent to the processing of your personal data, including transfer to third parties, some in countries outside of the European Economic Area that do not offer the same data protection standards as the country where you live. You can decide which optional cookies to accept by clicking on "Manage preferences", where you can also find more information about how your personal data is processed. Further information can be found in our [privacy_policy](#).

Accept all cookies

[Manage preferences](#)

capital, and property markets. *Real Estate Finance Fall*, 7–14.

Baker, M., & Stein, J. (2004). Market liquidity as a sentiment indicator. *Journal of Financial Markets* 7, 271–299.

Baker, & M., Wurgler, J. (2006). Investor sentiment and the cross-section of stock returns. *Journal of Finance* 61(4), 1645–1680.

Baker, M., & Wurgler, J. (2007). Investor sentiment in the stock market. *The Journal of Economic Perspectives* 21, 129–151.

Barberis, N., Shleifer, A., & Wurgler, J. (2005). Comovement. *Journal of Financial Economics* 75, 283–317.

Barberis, N., & Thaler, R. (2003). Chapter 18: A survey of behavioral finance. In: Constantinides G. M., Harris M., Stulz R. (eds) *Handbook of the Economics of Finance*, pp 1053–1128. vol. 1. Elsevier, Amsterdam.

Your Privacy

We use cookies to make sure that our website works properly, as well as some optional cookies to personalise content and advertising, provide social media features and analyse how people use our site. By accepting some or all optional cookies you give consent to the processing of your personal data, including transfer to third parties, some in countries outside of the European Economic Area that do not offer the same data protection standards as the country where you live. You can decide which optional cookies to accept by clicking on "Manage preferences", where you can also find more information about how your personal data is processed. Further information can be found in our [privacy_policy](#).

Accept all cookies

[Manage preferences](#)

Brown, S., Goetzmann, W., Hiraki, T., Shiraishi, N., & Watanabe, M. (2002). Investor sentiment in Japanese and U.S. Daily Mutual Fund Flows. Yale Working Paper.

Campbell, J., Shiller, R. (1998). The dividend-price ratio and expectations of future dividends and discount factors. *Review of Financial Studies* 1, 195–228.

Chakravarty, S. (2001). Stealth-trading: Which trader's trades move stock prices? *Journal of Financial Economics* 61, 289–307.

Chen, J., Hudson-Wilson, S., & Nordby, H. (2004). Real estate pricing: Spreads and sensibilities: Why real estate pricing is rational. *Journal of Real Estate Portfolio Management* 10, 1–21.

Chichernea, D., Miller, N., Fisher, J., Sklarz, M., & White, R. (2008). A cross sectional analysis of cap rates by MSA. *Journal of Real Estate Research* 30(3) (forthcoming).

Clayton, J. (2003). Capital flows and asset values: A

Your Privacy

We use cookies to make sure that our website works properly, as well as some optional cookies to personalise content and advertising, provide social media features and analyse how people use our site. By accepting some or all optional cookies you give consent to the processing of your personal data, including transfer to third parties, some in countries outside of the European Economic Area that do not offer the same data protection standards as the country where you live. You can decide which optional cookies to accept by clicking on "Manage preferences", where you can also find more information about how your personal data is processed. Further information can be found in our [privacy_policy](#).

Accept all cookies

[Manage preferences](#)

De Long, J. B., Shleifer, A., Summers, L. H., & Waldmann, R. J. (1990). Noise trader risk in financial markets. *Journal of Political Economy* 98(4), 703–738.

Dokko, Y., Edelstein, R., Lacayo, A., & Lee, D. (1999). Real estate income and value cycles: A model of market dynamics. *Journal of Real Estate Research* 18(1), 69–96.

Downs, A. (2004). Some aspects of the real estate outlook. Retrieved from <http://www.anthonydowns.com>.

Edelen, R. M., & Warner, J. B. (2001). Aggregate price effects of institutional trading: A study of mutual fund flow data and market returns. *Journal of Financial Economics* 59(2), 195–220.

Engle, R., & Granger, C. W. J. (1987). Cointegration and error correction: Representation estimation and testing. *Econometrica* 55, 251–276.

Your Privacy

We use cookies to make sure that our website works properly, as well as some optional cookies to personalise content and advertising, provide social media features and analyse how people use our site. By accepting some or all optional cookies you give consent to the processing of your personal data, including transfer to third parties, some in countries outside of the European Economic Area that do not offer the same data protection standards as the country where you live. You can decide which optional cookies to accept by clicking on "Manage preferences", where you can also find more information about how your personal data is processed. Further information can be found in our [privacy_policy](#).

Accept all cookies

[Manage preferences](#)

Fisher, J., Geltner, D., & Pollakowski H. (2007) A Quarterly Transactions-based Index of Institutional Real Estate Investment Performance and Movements in Supply, and Demand. *Journal of Real Estate Finance and Economics* 34(1), 5–33.

Froot, K. A., O'Connell, P. G. J., & Seasholes, M. S. (2001). The portfolio flows of international investors. *Journal of Financial Economics* 59(2), 151–194.

Geltner, D. M., Miller, N. G., Clayton, J., & Eicholtz P. (2007). *Commercial Real Estate Analysis and Investments*, 2nd edn. South-Western Publishing, Cincinnati, OH.

Geltner, D., & Mei J. (1995). The present value model with time-varying discount rates: Implications for commercial property valuation and investment decisions. *The Journal of Real Estate Finance and Economics* 11(2), 119–135.

Gompers, P., & Lerner, J. (2000). Money chasing deals? The impact of fund inflows on private equity valuations. *Journal of Financial Economics* 5, 281–295.

Your Privacy

We use cookies to make sure that our website works properly, as well as some optional cookies to personalise content and advertising, provide social media features and analyse how people use our site. By accepting some or all optional cookies you give consent to the processing of your personal data, including transfer to third parties, some in countries outside of the European Economic Area that do not offer the same data protection standards as the country where you live. You can decide which optional cookies to accept by clicking on "Manage preferences", where you can also find more information about how your personal data is processed. Further information can be found in our [privacy policy](#).

Accept all cookies

[Manage preferences](#)

from 46 countries. *The Review of Financial Studies* 20(3), 905–951.

Hamilton, J. D. (1994). *Time series analysis*. Princeton University Press, Princeton.

Hendershott, P. H., & MacGregor, B. (2005a). Investor rationality: Evidence from U.K. Property Capitalization Rates. *Real Estate Economics* 26, 299–322.

Hendershott, P. H., & MacGregor, B. (2005b). Investor rationality: An analysis of NCREIF commercial property data. *Journal of Real Estate Research* 26, 445–475.

Hirshleifer, D. (2001). Investor psychology and asset pricing. *Journal of Finance* 56, 1533–1597.

House, G. C. (2004). Demand for Real Estate: Capital Flows, Motivations, and the Impact of Rising Rates. Institute for Fiduciary Education.

Jones, C. M., & Lipson, M. (2004). Are retail orders different? Working Paper, Columbia University.

Your Privacy

We use cookies to make sure that our website works properly, as well as some optional cookies to personalise content and advertising, provide social media features and analyse how people use our site. By accepting some or all optional cookies you give consent to the processing of your personal data, including transfer to third parties, some in countries outside of the European Economic Area that do not offer the same data protection standards as the country where you live. You can decide which optional cookies to accept by clicking on "Manage preferences", where you can also find more information about how your personal data is processed. Further information can be found in our [privacy_policy](#).

Accept all cookies

[Manage preferences](#)

Ling, D. C. (2005). A random walk down main street: Can experts predict returns on commercial real estate. *Journal of Real Estate Research* 27(2), 137–154.

Ling, D. C., & Naranjo A. (2003). The dynamics of REIT capital flows and returns. *Real Estate Economics* 31, 405–434.

Ling, D. C., & Naranjo, A. (2006). Dedicated REIT mutual fund flows and REIT performance. *Journal of Real Estate Finance and Economics* 32(4), 409–433.

McGough, T., & Tsolacos, S. (2001). Do yields reflect property market fundamentals? Working Paper, City University Business School.

Nofsinger, J. R., & Sias, R. W. (1999). Herding and feedback trading by institutional and individual investors. *Journal of Finance* 59, 2263–2295.

Bayley, A. D., & Wechter, S. M. (2006). Underpriced

Your Privacy

We use cookies to make sure that our website works properly, as well as some optional cookies to personalise content and advertising, provide social media features and analyse how people use our site. By accepting some or all optional cookies you give consent to the processing of your personal data, including transfer to third parties, some in countries outside of the European Economic Area that do not offer the same data protection standards as the country where you live. You can decide which optional cookies to accept by clicking on "Manage preferences", where you can also find more information about how your personal data is processed. Further information can be found in our [privacy_policy](#).

Accept all cookies

[Manage preferences](#)

Plazzi, A., Torous, W. N., & Valkanov, R. (2008). The cross-sectional dispersion of commercial real estate returns and rent growth: time variation and economic fluctuations. *Real Estate Economics* (in press).

Riddiough, T. (2008). On the addictive properties of cheap and easy debt capital. *PREA Quarterly*, Winter issue, 30–37.

Shilling, J. D. (2003). Is there a risk premium puzzle in real estate? *Real Estate Economics* 31(4), 501–525.

Shilling, J. D., Sing, T. F. (2007). Do institutional real estate investors have rational expectations? Working Paper.

Sias, R., Starks, L. T., & Titman, S. (2006). Changes in institutional ownership and stock returns: Assessment and methodology. *Journal of Business* 79, 2869–2910.

Sivitanidou, R., & Sivitanides, P. (1999). Office capitalization rates: Real estate and capital market influences. *Journal of Real Estate Finance and*

Your Privacy

We use cookies to make sure that our website works properly, as well as some optional cookies to personalise content and advertising, provide social media features and analyse how people use our site. By accepting some or all optional cookies you give consent to the processing of your personal data, including transfer to third parties, some in countries outside of the European Economic Area that do not offer the same data protection standards as the country where you live. You can decide which optional cookies to accept by clicking on "Manage preferences", where you can also find more information about how your personal data is processed. Further information can be found in our [privacy_policy](#).

Accept all cookies

[Manage preferences](#)

Wheaton, W. (1999). Real estate cycles: Some fundamentals. *Real Estate Economics* 27, 209–230.

Yu, J., & Yuan, Y. (2007). Investor sentiment and the mean-variance relation. Working Paper, Wharton School, University of Pennsylvania.

Acknowledgement

We thank David Barker, Bob Edelstein, David Geltner, Norm Miller, Tobias Muhlhofer, Larry Souza, Alan Ziobrowski and participants in the Cambridge-Maastricht-MIT Symposium in Boston (2007), the ASSA/AREUEA session in New Orleans (2008), the UC-Irvine Center for Real Estate Winter Symposium on Urban Research (2008), the USC Lusk Center for Real Estate Annual Research Symposium (2008), the Homer Hoyt session in North Palm Beach (2008), and the Georgia State Department of Real Estate research seminar (2008) for helpful comments and suggestions.

We also thank the Real Estate Research Institute for providing partial funding for this project and Ben Scheick

Your Privacy

We use cookies to make sure that our website works properly, as well as some optional cookies to personalise content and advertising, provide social media features and analyse how people use our site. By accepting some or all optional cookies you give consent to the processing of your personal data, including transfer to third parties, some in countries outside of the European Economic Area that do not offer the same data protection standards as the country where you live. You can decide which optional cookies to accept by clicking on "Manage preferences", where you can also find more information about how your personal data is processed. Further information can be found in our [privacy_policy](#).

Accept all cookies

[Manage preferences](#)

**Department of Finance, Insurance, and Real
Estate, Hough Graduate School of Business,
University of Florida, Gainesville, FL, 32611-7168,
USA**

David C. Ling & Andy Naranjo

Corresponding author

Correspondence to [David C. Ling](#).

Rights and permissions

[Reprints and Permissions](#)

About this article

Cite this article

Clayton, J., Ling, D.C. & Naranjo, A. Commercial Real Estate Valuation: Fundamentals Versus Investor Sentiment. *J Real Estate Finance Econ* **38**, 5–37 (2009).
<https://doi.org/10.1007/s11146-008-9130-6>

Published	Issue Date
17 July 2008	January 2009

DOI
<https://doi.org/10.1007/s11146-008-9130-6>

Keywords

Your Privacy

We use cookies to make sure that our website works properly, as well as some optional cookies to personalise content and advertising, provide social media features and analyse how people use our site. By accepting some or all optional cookies you give consent to the processing of your personal data, including transfer to third parties, some in countries outside of the European Economic Area that do not offer the same data protection standards as the country where you live. You can decide which optional cookies to accept by clicking on "Manage preferences", where you can also find more information about how your personal data is processed. Further information can be found in our [privacy policy](#).

Accept all cookies

[Manage preferences](#)

Search by keyword or author



Navigation

Find a journal

Publish with us

Your Privacy

We use cookies to make sure that our website works properly, as well as some optional cookies to personalise content and advertising, provide social media features and analyse how people use our site. By accepting some or all optional cookies you give consent to the processing of your personal data, including transfer to third parties, some in countries outside of the European Economic Area that do not offer the same data protection standards as the country where you live. You can decide which optional cookies to accept by clicking on "Manage preferences", where you can also find more information about how your personal data is processed. Further information can be found in our [privacy_policy](#).

Accept all cookies

[Manage preferences](#)