

A case study of expert judgment: Economists' probabilities versus base-rate model forecasts

Phillip A. Braun, Ilan Yaniv PhD

First published: July/September 1992

<https://doi.org/10.1002/bdm.3960050306>

Citations: 35

Abstract

In this case study of economists' forecasts concerning economic downturn, we examine key issues concerning the psychology of prediction and the controversy surrounding the value of expertise in forecasting. We examine when experts' knowledge promotes forecast accuracy and whether biases found in psychological studies (including underutilization of relevant base rates and tendencies to extreme prediction) occur in these economic forecasts. Experts' forecasts were compared to forecasts derived from base-rate models that relied on the historical frequencies of economic downturns. The performance patterns of the experts and models crossed over the forecast horizon. Experts outperformed models in shorter-term forecasting, whereas models outperformed experts in longer-term forecasting. These results highlight the abilities and limits of experts and models in prediction and the sources of their inaccuracy.

References

Armstrong, J. S. *Long-range Forecasting: From crystal ball to computer*, 2nd edn, New York: Wiley, 1985.

[Google Scholar](#)

Bar-Hillel, M. 'Back to base rates', in R. M. Hogarth (ed), *Insights in Decision making: A tribute to Hillel J. Einhorn*, pp. 200-214, Chicago, IL: University of Chicago Press, 1990.

[Google Scholar](#)

Bar-Hillel, M. and Fischhoff, B. 'When do base rates affect predictions?' *Journal of Personality and Social Psychology*, 35 (1980), 303-314.

[Google Scholar](#)

Blattberg, R. C. and Hoch, S. J. 'Database models and managerial intuition: 50% model + 50% manager', *Management Science*, 36 (1990) 887-899.

[Web of Science®](#) | [Google Scholar](#)

Braun, P. A. and Zarnowitz, V. 'Twenty-two years of the NBER-ASA quarterly economic outlook surveys: Aspects and comparisons of forecasting performance', Working paper, Northwestern University, 1991.

[Google Scholar](#)

Chi, M. T. H., Glaser, R. and Farr, M. *The Nature of Expertise*, Hillsdale, NJ: Erlbaum, 1988.

[Google Scholar](#)

Dawes, R. M. 'The robust beauty of improper linear models in decision making', *American Psychologist*, 34 (1979), 571-582.

[Web of Science®](#) | [Google Scholar](#)

Dawes, R. M. *Rational Choice in an Uncertain World* (Chapter 10), San Diego, CA: Harcourt Brace Jovanovich, 1988.

[Google Scholar](#)

Einhorn, H. J. 'Expert measurement and mechanical combination', *Organizational Behavior and Human Performance*, 7 (1972), 86-106.

[Web of Science®](#) | [Google Scholar](#)

Einhorn, H. J. and Hogarth, R. M. 'Confidence in judgment: Persistence of the illusion of validity', *Psychological Review*, 85 (1978), 395-416.

[Web of Science®](#) | [Google Scholar](#)

Gigerenzer, G., Hell, W. and Blank, H. 'Presentation and content: The use of base rates as a continuous variable', *Journal of Experimental Psychology: Human Perception and Performance*, 14 (1988), 513-525.

[Web of Science®](#) | [Google Scholar](#)

Ginosar, Z. and Trope, Y. 'The effects of base rates and individuating information on judgments about another person', *Journal of Experimental Social Psychology*, 16 (1980), 228-242.

[Web of Science®](#) | [Google Scholar](#)

Kahneman, D. and Tversky, A. 'On the psychology of prediction', *Psychological Review*, 80 (1973), 237-251.

[Web of Science®](#) | [Google Scholar](#)

Kahneman, D. and Tversky, A. 'Intuitive prediction: Biases and corrective procedures', *TIMS Studies in the Management Sciences*, 12 (1979), 313–327.

[Google Scholar](#)

Keren, G. and Wagenaar, W. A. 'Temporal aspects of probabilistic forecasts', *Bulletin of the Psychonomic Society*, 25 (1987), 61–64.

[Web of Science®](#) | [Google Scholar](#)

Kidd, J. B. 'The utilization of subjective probabilities in production planning', *Acta Psychologica*, 34 (1970), 338–347.

[Google Scholar](#)

Kleinmuntz, B. 'Why we still use our heads instead of formulas: Toward an integrative approach', *Psychological Bulletin*, 107 (1990), 296–310.

[CAS](#) | [PubMed](#) | [Web of Science®](#) | [Google Scholar](#)

Knaus, W. A., Wagner, D. P. and Lynn, J. 'Short-term mortality predictions for critically ill hospitalized adults: Science and ethics', *Science*, 254 (1991), 389–394.

[CAS](#) | [PubMed](#) | [Web of Science®](#) | [Google Scholar](#)

Lichtenstein, S., Fischhoff, B. and Phillips, P. 'Calibration of probabilities: The state of the art to 1980', in D. Kahneman P. Slovic and A. Tversky (eds), *Judgement under Uncertainty: Heuristics and biases*, pp. 306–334, New York: Cambridge University Press, 1982.

[Web of Science®](#) | [Google Scholar](#)

McCloskey, D. N. 'The limits of expertise: If you are so smart, why ain't you rich?' *The American Scholar*, Summer (1988), 393–406.

[Google Scholar](#)

McNees, S. K. 'The role of judgment in macroeconomic forecasting accuracy', *International Journal of Forecasting*, 6 (1990), 287–299.

[Web of Science®](#) | [Google Scholar](#)

Meehl, P. E. *Clinical versus Statistical Prediction: A theoretical analysis and a review of the evidence*, Minneapolis: University of Minnesota Press, 1954.

[Google Scholar](#)

Murphy, A. H. 'A new vector partition of the probability score', *Journal of Applied Meteorology*, 12 (1973), 595–600.

[PubMed](#) | [Web of Science®](#) | [Google Scholar](#) |

Murphy, A. H. and Brown, B. G. 'A comparative evaluation of objective and subjective weather forecasts in the United States', *Journal of Forecasting*, 3 (1984), 369–393.

[Web of Science®](#) | [Google Scholar](#) |

Murphy, A. H. and Winkler, R. L. 'Reliability and subjective probability forecasts of precipitation and temperature', *Journal of Royal Statistical Society*, 26 (1977), 41–47.

[Google Scholar](#) |

Oskamp, S. 'Overconfidence in case-study judgments', in D. Kahneman, P. Slovic and A. Tversky (eds), *Judgment under Uncertainty: Heuristics and biases*, pp. 287–293, New York: Cambridge University Press, 1982.

[Google Scholar](#) |

Russo, J. E. and Schoemaker, P. J. H. 'Managing overconfidence', *Sloan Management Review*, in press.

[Google Scholar](#) |

Wallsten, T. S. 'Physician and medical student bias in evaluating diagnostic information', *Medical Decision Making*, 2 (1981), 145–164.

[Google Scholar](#) |

Wallsten, T. S. and Budescu, D. V. 'Encoding subjective probabilities: A psychological and psychometric review', *Management Science*, 29 (1983), 151–173.

[Web of Science®](#) | [Google Scholar](#) |

Weber, E. U., Böckenholt, U., Hilton, D. J. and Wallace, B. 'Determinants of hypothesis generation: Effects of information, base rates, and expertise', manuscript submitted for publication, 1992.

[Google Scholar](#) |

Winkler, R. L. and Murphy, A. H. "'Good" probability assessors', *Journal of Applied Meteorology*, 7 (1968), 751–758.

[Google Scholar](#) |

Yaniv, I. and Foster, D. A. 'Graininess of judgment: An accuracy-informativeness tradeoff', manuscript submitted for publication, 1991.

[Google Scholar](#)

Yaniv, I. and Hogarth, R. M. 'Judgmental versus statistical prediction: Information asymmetry and combination rules', manuscript submitted for publication, 1992.

[Google Scholar](#)

Yaniv, I., Yates, J. F. and Smith, J. E. K. 'Measures of discrimination skill in probabilistic judgment', *Psychological Bulletin*, 110 (1991), 611-617.

[Web of Science®](#) | [Google Scholar](#)

Yates, J. F. *Judgment and Decision Making*, Englewood Cliffs, NJ: Prentice-Hall, 1990.

[Google Scholar](#)

Yates, J. F. and Curley, S. P. 'Conditional distribution analysis of probabilistic forecasts', *Journal of Forecasting*, 4 (1985), 61-73.

[Web of Science®](#) | [Google Scholar](#)

Zarnowitz, V. 'Rational expectations and macroeconomic forecasts', *Journal of Business and Economic Statistics*, 3 (1985), 293-311.

[Web of Science®](#) | [Google Scholar](#)

Zarnowitz, V. and Lambros, L. A. 'Consensus and uncertainty in economic prediction', *Journal of Political Economy*, 95 (1987), 591-621.

[Web of Science®](#) | [Google Scholar](#)

Citing Literature



[Download PDF](#)

[Terms of Use](#)

[About Cookies](#)

[Manage Cookies](#)

[Accessibility](#)

[Wiley Research DE&I Statement and Publishing Policies](#)

[Developing World Access](#)

HELP & SUPPORT

[Contact Us](#)

[Training and Support](#)

[DMCA & Reporting Piracy](#)

OPPORTUNITIES

[Subscription Agents](#)

[Advertisers & Corporate Partners](#)

CONNECT WITH WILEY

[The Wiley Network](#)

[Wiley Press Room](#)

Copyright © 1999-2025 John Wiley & Sons, Inc or related companies. All rights reserved, including rights for text and data mining and training of artificial intelligence technologies or similar technologies.

WILEY