

A systems approach to measuring return on investment for HRD interventions

Greg G. Wang, Zhengxia Dou, Ning Li

First published: 28 May 2002

<https://doi.org/10.1002/hrdq.1024>

Citations: 62

Abstract

This study contributes to the limited methodological literature on HRD program evaluation and measurement. The study explores an interdisciplinary approach for return on investment (ROI) measurement in human resource development (HRD) research and practices. On the basis of a comprehensive review and analysis of relevant studies in economics, industrial-organizational psychology, financial control, and HRD fields, we developed a systems approach to quantitatively measure ROI for HRD programs. The ROI concept for HRD field was defined, and a theoretical systems framework was developed. The applicability of using statistical and mathematical operations to determine ROI and isolate non-HRD program impacts is discussed. Application scenarios are presented to demonstrate the utility of the systems approach in real-world ROI measurement for HRD interventions.

References

Allbee, K. E., & Semple, C. A. (1980). Aircrew training device life-cycle cost and worth of ownership. (CRG TR-3041E). Westlake Village, CA: Canyon Research Group.

Alliger, G. M., & Janak, E. A. (1989). Kirkpatrick's levels of training criteria: Thirty years later. *Personnel Psychology*, 42 (2), 331-342.

This website utilizes technologies such as cookies to enable essential site functionality, as well as for analytics, personalization, and targeted advertising purposes. You may change your settings at any time or accept the default settings. [Privacy Policy](#).

Manage Preferences

Accept All

Barron, J. M., Berger, M. C., & Black, D. D. (1997). How well do we measure training? *Journal of Labor Economics*, *15*, 507–528.

Becker, G. (1962). Investment in human capital: A theoretical analysis. *Journal of Political Economy*, *70* (suppl. 5), part 2, S9-S49.

Becker, G. (1964). *Human capital: A theoretical and empirical analysis, with special reference to education*. New York: Columbia University Press.

Ben-Porath, Y. (1967). The production of human capital and the life cycle of earnings. *Journal of Political Economy*, *75*, 352–365.

Bertalanffy, L. (1968). *General system theory: Foundations, development, and applications*. New York: Braziller.

Bishop, J. (1991). On the job training of new hires. In D. Stern (Eds.), *Market failure in training? New economic analysis and evidence on training of adult employees*. New York: Springer-Verlag.

Bobko, P., & Russell, C. (1991). A review of the role of taxonomies in human resources management. *Human Resource Management Review*, *4*, 293–316.

Boudreau, J. W. (1991). Utility analysis for decisions in human resource management. In M. D. Dunnette (Eds.), *Handbook of Industrial and Organizational Psychology* (2nd ed., vol. 2, pp. 621–745). Palo Alto, CA: Consulting Psychologists Press.

Brandenburg, D. (1982). Training evaluation: What's the current status? *Training and Development Journal*, *36*, 14–19.

This website utilizes technologies such as cookies to enable essential site functionality, as well as for analytics, personalization, and targeted advertising purposes. You may change your settings at any time or accept the default settings. [Privacy Policy](#)

Manage Preferences

Accept All

Brogden, H. E. (1949). When testing pays off. *Personnel Psychology*, 2, 171-183.

Brogden, H. E., & Taylor, E. K. (1950). The dollar criterion: Applying the cost accounting concept to criterion construction. *Personnel Psychology*, 3, 133-154.

Browning, R. F., Ryan, L. E., Scott, P. G., & Smode, A. F. (1977). Training effectiveness evaluation of device 2F 87F, P-3C operational flight trainer. (TAEG report no. 42.). Orlando: Training Analysis and Evaluation Group.

Cascio, W. F. (1992). Assessing the utility of selection decisions: Theoretical and practical considerations. In N. Schmitt (Eds.), *Personnel selection in organizations*. San Francisco: Jossey Bass.

Cascio, W. F. (2000). *Costing human resources: The financial impact of behavior in organizations*. (4th ed.). Cincinnati: South-Western.

Cronbach, O. L., & Gleser, G. G. (1965). *Psychological tests and personnel decisions*. (2nd ed.). Urbana: University of Illinois Press.

Dearden, J. (1969). The case against ROI control. *Harvard Business Review*, 47, 124-134.

Dickinson, K. P., Johnson, T. R., & West, R. W. (1987). An analysis of the sensitivity of quasi-experimental net impact estimates of CETA programs. *Evaluation Review*, 11, 452-472.

Doppelt, J. E., & Bennett, G. K. (1953). Reducing the cost of training satisfactory workers by using tests. *Personnel Psychology*, 6, 1-8.

This website utilizes technologies such as cookies to enable essential site functionality, as well as for analytics, personalization, and targeted advertising purposes. You may change your settings at any time or accept the default settings. [Privacy Policy](#).

Manage Preferences

Accept All

Ehrenberg, R., & Smith, R. (1994). *Modern labor economics: theory and public policy*. (5th ed.). New York: HarperCollins.

Feuer, M., Glick, H., & Desai, A. (1987). Is firm-sponsored education viable? *Journal of Economic Behavior and Organization*, 8, 121–136.

Fitz-enz, J. (1984). *How to measure human resources management*. New York: McGraw-Hill.

Fraker, T., & Maynard, R. (1987). The adequacy of comparison group designs for evaluations of employment-related programs. *Journal of Human Resources*, 22, 194–227.

Friedlander, D., & Robins, P. (1991). Estimating the effects of employment and training programs: Assessment of some nonexperimental techniques. New York: Manpower Demonstration Research.

Fusch, G. E. (2001). What happens when the ROI model does not fit? *Performance Improvement Quarterly*, 14 (4), 60–76.

Geroy, G., & Swanson, R. (1984). Forecasting training costs and benefits in industry. *Epsilon Pi Tau*, 10, 15–19.

Gilbert, T. (1978). *Human competence: Engineering worthy performance*. New York: McGraw-Hill.

Gujarati, D. N. (1988). *Basic econometrics*. (2nd ed.). New York: McGraw-Hill.

Heckman, J. J. (1979). Sample selection bias as a specification error. *Econometrica*, 47, 286–293.

This website utilizes technologies such as cookies to enable essential site functionality, as well as for analytics, personalization, and targeted advertising purposes. You may change your settings at any time or accept the default settings. [Privacy Policy](#)

Manage Preferences

Accept All

Heckman, J. J., Hotz, V. J., & Dabos, M. (1987). Do we need experimental data to evaluate the impact of manpower training on earnings? *Evaluation Review*, 11, 395-427.

Holton, E. F. (1996). The flawed four-level evaluation model. *Human Resource Development Quarterly*, 7, 5-21.

Hotz, V. J. (1992). Designing and evaluation of the Job Training Partnership Act. In C. F. Manski (Eds.), *Evaluating welfare and training programs*. Cambridge, MA: Harvard University Press.

Jacobs, R. L., Jones, M. J., & Neil, S. (1992). A case study in forecasting the financial benefits of unstructured and structured on-the-job training. *Human Resource Development Quarterly*, 3, 133-139.

Judge, G., Hill, R., Griffiths, W., Lutkepohl, H., & Lee, T. (1988). *Introduction to the theory and practice of econometrics*. (2nd ed.). New York: Wiley.

Kachigan, S. K. (1986). *Statistical analysis: An interdisciplinary introduction to univariate and multivariate methods*. New York: Radius Press.

Kaufman, B. E. (1994). *The economics of labor markets*. (4th ed.). Fort Worth: Dryden Press.

Kaufman, R., & Keller, J. M. (1994). Levels of evaluation: Beyond Kirkpatrick. *Human Resource Development Quarterly*, 5, 371-380.

Kirkpatrick, D. (1959). Techniques for evaluating training programs. *Journal of the American Society for Training and Development*, 13, 3-9.

This website utilizes technologies such as cookies to enable essential site functionality, as well as for analytics, personalization, and targeted advertising purposes. You may change your settings at any time or accept the default settings. [Privacy Policy](#)

[Manage Preferences](#)

[Accept All](#)

Kirkpatrick, D. (1983). Four steps to measuring training effectiveness. *Personnel Administrator*, 28, 19–25.

Kirkpatrick, D. (1998). *Evaluating training programs: The four levels*. (2nd ed.). San Francisco: Berrett-Koehler.

Koehle, D. A. (2000). Investing in workforce training improves financial success. *Training & Development*, 54, 73–74.

Koontz, H., O'Donnell, C., & Weihrich, H. (1984). *Management*. (8th ed.). New York: McGraw-Hill.

LaLonde, R. (1986). Evaluating the econometric evaluations of training programs with experimental data. *American Economic Review*, 76, 604–620.

LaLonde, R., & Maynard, R. A. (1987). How precise are evaluations of employment and training programs? Evidence from a field experiment. *Evaluation Review*, 11, 428–451.

Latham, G. P., & Whyte, G. (1994). The futility of utility analysis. *Personnel psychology*, 47, 31–46.

Law, K. S., & Myers, B. (1999). A modification of Raju, Burke, and Normand's (1990) new model for utility analysis. *Asia Pacific Journal of Human Resources*, 37, 39–51.

Maddala, G. S. (1983). *Limited-dependent and qualitative variables in econometrics*. New York: Cambridge University Press.

This website utilizes technologies such as cookies to enable essential site functionality, as well as for analytics, personalization, and targeted advertising purposes. You may change your settings at any time or accept the default settings. [Privacy Policy](#).

Manage Preferences

Accept All

methodology and policy. Brookfield, VT: Ashgate.

McLagan, P. (1989). *The models*. Alexandria, VA: American Society for Training and Development.

McLinden, D., & Trochim, W. (1998). Getting to parallel: Assessing the return on expectations of training. *Performance Improvement Journal*, 37, 21–25.

Mincer, J. (1962). On-the-job training: Costs, returns, and some implications. *Journal of Political Economy*, 70, part 2, S50–S79.

Mincer, J. (1994). Investment in U.S. education and training: Levels and changes since the 1960s. (Working paper no. 4844.). Cambridge, MA: National Bureau of Economic Research.

Moffitt, R. (1991). Program evaluation with nonexperimental data. *Evaluation Review*, 15, 291–314.

Myers, R. (1996). Metric wars. *CFO*, 12, 41–50.

Naylor, J. C., & Shine, L. C. (1965). A table for determining the increase in mean criterion score obtained by using a selection device. *Journal of Industrial Psychology*, 3, 33–42.

Neter, J., Wasserman, W., & Kutner, M. H. (1990). *Applied linear statistical models: Regression, analysis of variance, and experimental designs*. Boston: Irwin.

Nicholson, W. (1990). *Microeconomic theory: Basic principles and extensions*. (5th ed.). Fort Worth: Dryden Press.

This website utilizes technologies such as cookies to enable essential site functionality, as well as for analytics, personalization, and targeted advertising purposes. You may change your settings at any time or accept the default settings. [Privacy Policy](#)

Manage Preferences

Accept All

Parsons, D. (1990). The firm's decision to training. In R. Ehrenberg (Ed.), *Research in Labor Economics*, vol. 2. Greenwich, CT: JAI Press.

Perry, C. (1975). *The impact of government manpower programs*. Philadelphia: University of Pennsylvania.

J. Phillips (Ed.). (1994). *In action: Measuring return on investment*, vol. 1. Alexandria, VA: ASTD.

Phillips, J. (1997a). *Handbook of training evaluation and measurement methods*. (3rd ed.). Houston: Gulf.

Phillips, J. (1997b). *Return on investment in training and performance improvement programs*. Houston: Gulf.

Pritchard, R. D. (1992). Organizational productivity. In M. D. Dunnette (Eds.), *Handbook of industrial and organizational psychology*. (2nd ed.). Palo Alto, CA: Consulting Psychologists Press.

Raju, N. S., Burke, M. J., & Normand, J. (1990). A new approach for utility analysis. *Journal of Applied Psychology*, 75, 3-12.

Rothwell, W., & Sredl, H. (1992). *The ASTD reference guide to professional human resource development roles and competencies*. (2nd ed.). Amherst, MA: HRD Press.

Schmidt, F. L., Hunter, J. E., & Pearlman, K. (1982). Assessing the economic impact of personnel programs on workforce productivity. *Personnel Psychology*, 35, 333-347.

This website utilizes technologies such as cookies to enable essential site functionality, as well as for analytics, personalization, and targeted advertising purposes. You may change your settings at any time or accept the default settings. [Privacy Policy](#)

Manage Preferences

Accept All

Stewart, G. B., & Stern, J. M. (1991). *The quest for value: the EVA management guide*. New York: Harper Business.

Stigler, G. J. (1950). The development of utility theory. *Journal of Political Economy*, 59 part 1, 307-327;

The development of utility theory. *Journal of Political Economy*, 59 part 2, 373-396.

Sturm, R. (1993). *How do education and training affect a country's economic performance? A literature survey*. Santa Monica, CA: RAND.

Swanson, R. A. (1992). Demonstrating financial benefits to clients. In H. D. Stolovitch (Eds.), *Handbook of human performance technology*. San Francisco: Jossey-Bass.

Swanson, R. A., & Gradous, D. B. (1988). *Forecasting financial benefits of human resource development*. San Francisco: Jossey-Bass.

Swanson, R. A., & Holton, E. F. (2001). *Foundations of human resource development*. San Francisco: Berrett-Koehler.

Taylor, H. C., & Russell, J. T. (1939). The relationship of validity coefficients to the practical effectiveness of tests in selection. *Journal of Applied Psychology*, 23, 565-578.

Thode, W. F., & Walker, R. A. (1983). A model for comparing training costs in a complex military training system. (NPRDC technical report EA 015809.). San Diego: Navy Personnel Research and Development Center.

This website utilizes technologies such as cookies to enable essential site functionality, as well as for analytics, personalization, and targeted advertising purposes. You may change your settings at any time or accept the default settings. [Privacy Policy](#).

Manage Preferences

Accept All

Wang, G. (2002). Control group methods for HPT program evaluation and measurement. *Performance Improvement Quarterly*, 15 (2), forthcoming.

Wolf, M. G. (1991). Review of costing human resources: The financial impact of behavior in organizations. *Personnel Psychology*, 45, 881–882.

Yan, J. (2000, Apr. 16). Personal contact. Pan American Health Organization, World Health Organization.

Citing Literature



[Download PDF](#)

ABOUT WILEY ONLINE LIBRARY

[Privacy Policy](#)
[Terms of Use](#)
[About Cookies](#)
[Manage Cookies](#)
[Accessibility](#)
[Wiley Research DE&I Statement and Publishing Policies](#)
[Developing World Access](#)

HELP & SUPPORT

[Contact Us](#)
[Training and Support](#)
[DMCA & Reporting Piracy](#)

OPPORTUNITIES

[Subscription Agents](#)
[Advertisers & Corporate Partners](#)

CONNECT WITH WILEY

This website utilizes technologies such as cookies to enable essential site functionality, as well as for analytics, personalization, and targeted advertising purposes. You may change your settings at any time or accept the default settings. [Privacy Policy](#).

[Manage Preferences](#)

[Accept All](#)

This website utilizes technologies such as cookies to enable essential site functionality, as well as for analytics, personalization, and targeted advertising purposes. You may change your settings at any time or accept the default settings. [Privacy Policy](#)

Manage Preferences

Accept All