

Bank Failure, Mark-to-market and the Financial Crisis

Amir Amel-Zadeh  Geoff Meeks

First published: 20 September 2013

<https://doi.org/10.1111/abac.12011>

Citations: 42

The authors would like to thank the anonymous reviewer; Yacine Ait-Sahalia, Kristian Allee, John Eatwell, Bill Janeway, Stewart Jones (editor), Wayne Landsman, Lars Norden, Hyun Shin, Geoffrey Whittington; participants at the 2010 American Accounting Association meetings, the 2012 Financial Engineering and Banking Society conference, the Cambridge Finance Conference on Perspectives on the Financial Crisis; seminar participants at Princeton and Cambridge; and members of the Academic Panel of the U.K. Accounting Standards Board for helpful comments and suggestions.

Abstract

This paper is concerned with the allegation that fair value accounting rules have contributed significantly to the recent financial crisis. It focuses on one particular channel for that contribution: the impact of fair value on the actual or potential failure of banks. The paper compares four criteria for failure: one economic, two legal and one regulatory. It is clear from this comparison that balance sheet valuations of assets are, in two cases, crucial in these definitions, and so the choice between 'fair value' or other valuations can be decisive in whether a bank fails; but in two cases fair value is irrelevant. Bank failures might arise despite capital adequacy and balance sheet solvency due to sudden shocks to liquidity positions. Two of the most prominent bank failures cannot, at first sight, be attributed to fair value accounting: we show that Northern Rock was balance sheet solvent, even on a fair value basis, as was Lehman Brothers. The case study evidence is augmented by econometric tests that suggest that mark-to-market accounting has had only a very limited influence on the perceived failure risk of banks.

References

Alexander, K., 'Bank Resolution Regimes: Balancing Prudential Regulation and Shareholder Rights', *Journal of Corporate Law Studies*, Vol. 9, No. 1, 2009.

 | [Google Scholar](#) |

Alexander, K., J. Eatwell, A. Persaud and R. Reoch, *Financial Supervision and Crisis Management in the EU*, European Parliament Committee on Economic and Monetary Affairs, 2007.

 | [Google Scholar](#) |

Adrian, T., and H. S. Shin, 'Liquidity and Financial Contagion', *Banque de France, Financial Stability Review*, Vol. 11, Special Issue, 2008.

[Web of Science®](#) | [Google Scholar](#)

Adrian, T., and H. S. Shin, 'Liquidity and Leverage', *Journal of Financial Intermediation*, Vol. 19, No. 3, 2010.

[Web of Science®](#) | [Google Scholar](#)

Allen, F., and E. Carletti, 'Mark-to-market Accounting and Liquidity Pricing', *Journal of Accounting and Economics*, Vol. 45, Nos 2-3, 2008.

[Web of Science®](#) | [Google Scholar](#)

Altman, E., 'A Further Empirical Investigation of the Bankruptcy Cost Question', *Journal of Finance*, Vol. 39, No. 4, 1984.

[Web of Science®](#) | [Google Scholar](#)

Andrade, G., and Kaplan, S., 'How Costly is Financial (Not Economic) Distress? Evidence from Highly Leveraged Transactions that became Distressed', *Journal of Finance*, Vol. 53, No. 5, 1998.

[CAS](#) | [Web of Science®](#) | [Google Scholar](#)

Avery, R. B., and A. N. Berger, 'Risk-based Capital and Deposit Insurance Reform', *Journal of Banking and Finance*, Vol. 15, No. 2, 1991.

[Web of Science®](#) | [Google Scholar](#)

Badertscher B., J. Burks and P. Easton, 'A Convenient Scapegoat: Fair Value Accounting by Commercial Banks during the Financial Crisis', *Accounting Review*, Vol. 87, No. 5, 2012.

[Google Scholar](#)

Barth, M., and W. Landsman, 'How Did Financial Reporting Contribute to the Financial Crisis?', *European Accounting Review*, Vol. 19, No. 4, 2010.

[Google Scholar](#)

Berger, A. N., R. J. Herring and G. P. Szego, 'The Role of Capital in Financial Institutions', *Journal of Banking and Finance*, Vol. 19, No. 8, 1995.

[Google Scholar](#)

Bernanke, B. S., 'Non-monetary Effects of the Financial Crisis in the Propagation of the Great Depression', *American Economic Review*, Vol. 73, No. 3, 1983.

Bernard, V. L., 'Cross-sectional Dependence and Problems in Inference in Market-based Accounting Research', *Journal of Accounting Research*, Vol. 25, No. 1, 1987.

Bhat, G., R. Frankel and X. Martin, 'Panacea, Pandora's Box, or Placebo: Feedback in Bank Mortgage-backed Security Holdings and Fair Value Accounting', *Journal of Accounting and Economics*, Vol. 52, Nos 2-3, 2011.

Bhattacharya, S., and A. Thakor, 'Contemporary Banking Theory', *Journal of Financial Intermediation*, Vol. 3, No. 1, 1993.

Bowen, R., U. Khan and S. Rajgopal, 'The Economic Consequences of Relaxing Fair Value Accounting and Impairment Rules on Banks during the Financial Crisis of 2008-2009', Working Paper, Foster School of Business, University of Washington, available at: <http://ssrn.com/abstract=1498912>, 2010.

Bradley, M. G., C. A. Wambeke and D. A. Whidbee, 'Risk Weights, Risk-based Capital and Deposit Insurance', *Journal of Banking and Finance*, Vol. 15, No. 2, 1991.

Brown, S. J., and J. B. Warner, 'Measuring Security Price Performance', *Journal of Financial Economics*, Vol. 8, No. 3, 1980.

Brunnermeier, M. K., 'Deciphering the Liquidity and Credit Crunch 2007-2008', *Journal of Economic Perspectives*, Vol. 23, No. 1, 2009.

Chambers, R., *Accounting, Evaluation and Economic Behaviour*, Prentice-Hall, 1966.

Cifuentes, R., G. Ferrucci and H. S. Shin, 'Liquidity Risk and Contagion', *Journal of the European Economic Association*, Vol. 3, Nos 2-3, 2005.

Clarke, F. L., G. W. Dean and K. G. Oliver, *Corporate Collapse: Regulatory Accounting and Ethical Failure*, Cambridge University Press, 1997.

[Google Scholar](#)

Cornett M. M., Z. Rezaee and H. Tehranian, 'An Investigation of Capital Market Reactions to Pronouncements on Fair Value Accounting', *Journal of Accounting and Economics*, Vol. 22, Nos 1-3, 1996.

[Web of Science®](#) | [Google Scholar](#)

Diamond, D., and R. Rajan, 'Liquidity Shortages and Banking Crises', *Journal of Finance*, Vol. 60, No. 2, 2005.

[Web of Science®](#) | [Google Scholar](#)

Enria A., L. Cappiello, F. Dierick, S. Grittini, A. Haralambous, A. Maddaloni, P. Molitor, F. Pires and P. Poloni, 'Fair Value Accounting and Financial Stability', *European Central Bank Occasional Paper Series*, No. 13, 2004.

[Google Scholar](#)

Epstein R. A., and M. T. Henderson, 'Marking To Market: Can Accounting Rules Shake the Foundations of Capitalism?', John M. Olin Law & Economics Working Paper No. 458, 2009.

[Google Scholar](#)

Friedman, M., *Essays in Positive Economics*, University of Chicago Press, 1953.

[Google Scholar](#)

Gorton, G., and L. Huang, 'Liquidity, Efficiency and Bank Bailouts', *American Economic Review*, Vol. 94, No. 1, 2004.

[Google Scholar](#)

Gorton, G., and A. Metrick, 'The Run on Repo and the Panic of 2007-2008', NBER working paper No. 15223, 2009.

[Google Scholar](#)

Goudie, A., and G. Meeks, 'The Exchange Rate and Company Failure in a Macro-Micro Model of the UK Company Sector', *Economic Journal*, Vol. 101, No. 409, 1991.

[Google Scholar](#)

Goudie, A., and G. Meeks, 'Company Failure and Hysteresis', in I. Begg and S. Henry, eds, *Applied Economics and Public Policy*, Cambridge University Press, 1998.

[Google Scholar](#)

G20, 'Leader's Statement from the London Summit on 2 April 2009', available at <http://www.g20.org/documents/>, 2009.

[Google Scholar](#)

Guerrera, F., B. White and H. Sender, 'Banks Under Pressure to Follow \$30bn Merrill Cut-price Debt Sale', *Financial Times*, 30 July, 2008.

[Google Scholar](#)

Guttentag, J., and R. Herring, 'Emergency Liquidity Assistance for International Banks', in R. Portes and A. K. Swoboda, eds, *Threats to International Financial Stability*, Cambridge University Press, 1987.

[Google Scholar](#)

IASB Expert Advisory Panel, *Measuring and Disclosing the Fair Value of Financial Instruments in Markets That Are No Longer Active*, IASB, 2008.

[Google Scholar](#)

Jackson, T., 'Bankruptcy, Nonbankruptcy Entitlements, and the Creditors' Bargain', *Yale Law Journal*, Vol. 91, No. 5, 1982.

[CAS](#) | [Web of Science®](#) | [Google Scholar](#)

Jaffe, J. F., 'Special Information and Insider Trading', *Journal of Business*, Vol. 47, No. 3, 1974.

[Web of Science®](#) | [Google Scholar](#)

Janeway, W., 'Lessons from the Crisis: Financial Economics is Not a Branch of Physics', invited speech at the conference on Perspectives on the Financial Crisis, University of Cambridge, 3 December, 2008.

[Google Scholar](#)

Jensen, M., 'Agency Costs of Free Cash Flow, Corporate Finance, and Takeovers', *American Economic Review* 76, Papers and Proceedings, 1986.

[CAS](#) | [Google Scholar](#)

Kaletsky, A., 'Five Golden Rules for Regulating the Banks; The Government's Financial Plans Have Worked – So Far. But the devil is in the Detail and Much of That is Still to be Fixed', *The Times*, 9 July, 2009.

[Google Scholar](#)

Kane, E., 'Dangers of Capital Forbearance: The Case of the FSLIC and "Zombie" S&Ls', *Contemporary Policy Issues*, Vol. 5, No. 1, 1987.

[CAS](#) | [Google Scholar](#)

Kane, E., *The S&L Mess: How Did it Happen?*, Urban Institute Press, 1989.

[Google Scholar](#)

Laux, C., and C. Leuz, 'The Crisis of Fair-value Accounting: Making Sense of the Recent Debate', *Accounting, Organizations and Society*, Vol. 34, Nos 6–7, 2009.

[Web of Science®](#) | [Google Scholar](#)

Laux, C., and C. Leuz, 'Did Fair Value Accounting Contribute to the Financial Crisis?', *Journal of Economic Perspectives*, Vol. 24, No. 1 (Winter), 2010.

[CAS](#) | [Google Scholar](#)

Lev, B., S. Radhakrishnan and W. Zhang, 'Organisation Capital', *ABACUS*, Vol. 45, No. 3, 2009.

[Web of Science®](#) | [Google Scholar](#)

Meeks, G., and J. G. Meeks, 'Self-fulfilling Prophecies of Failure: The Endogenous Balance Sheets of Distressed Companies,' *ABACUS*, Vol. 45, No. 1, 2009.

[Web of Science®](#) | [Google Scholar](#)

Michael, I., 'Accounting and Financial Stability', *Financial Stability Review*, No. 16, Bank of England, 2004.

[Google Scholar](#)

Morris, S., and H. S. Shin, 'Financial Regulation in a System Context', *Brooking Papers on Economic Activity*, Fall, 2008.

[Google Scholar](#)

Plantin, G., H. Saprà and H. S. Shin, 'Marking-to-market, Liquidity, and Financial Stability', *Monetary and Economic Studies*, Special Edition, October, 2005.

[Google Scholar](#)

Plantin, G., H. Saprà and H. S. Shin, 'Marking-to-market: Panacea or Pandora's Box?', *Journal of Accounting Research*, Vol. 46, No. 5, 2008.

[Google Scholar](#)

Pulvino, T., 'Do Asset Fire Sales Exist? An Empirical Investigation of Commercial Aircraft Transactions', *Journal of Finance*, Vol. 53, No. 5, 1998.

[Google Scholar](#)

Revsine, L., *Replacement Cost Accounting*, Prentice-Hall, 1973.

[Google Scholar](#)

Ronen, J., 'To Fair Value or Not to Fair Value: A Broader Perspective', *ABACUS*, Vol. 44, No. 2, 2008.

[Web of Science®](#) | [Google Scholar](#)

Santos, J. A. C., 'Bank Capital Regulation in Contemporary Banking Theory: A Review of the Literature', *Financial Markets, Institutions and Instruments*, Vol. 10, No. 2, 2000.

[CAS](#) | [Web of Science®](#) | [Google Scholar](#)

Schipper, K., and R. Thompson, 'The Impact of Merger-related Regulations on the Shareholders of Acquiring Firms', *Journal of Accounting Research*, Vol. 21, No. 1, 1983.

[Web of Science®](#) | [Google Scholar](#)

Schnabel, I., and H. S. Shin, 'Liquidity and Contagion: The Crisis of 1763', *Journal of the European Economic Association*, Vol. 2, No. 5, 2004.

[Web of Science®](#) | [Google Scholar](#)

Schwert, W. G., 'Using Financial Data to Measure Effects of Regulation', *Journal of Law and Economics*, Vol. 24, No. 3, 1981.

[Google Scholar](#)

Shin H. S., 'Reflections on Northern Rock: The Bank Run that Heralded the Global Financial Crisis', *Journal of Economic Perspectives* Vol. 23, No. 1, 2009.

[Web of Science®](#) | [Google Scholar](#)

SRM, SRM Global Masters Fund & ors v HM Treasury, High Court of Justice (Queen's Bench division), Divisional Court Judgement, Case No: CO/4342/4715/4351/2008, 13 February, available at <http://www.judiciary.gov.uk/media/judgments/2009/northern-rock>, 2009.

[Google Scholar](#)

Stiglitz, J., 'Some Aspects of the Pure Theory of Corporate Finance: Bankruptcies and Take-overs', *Bell Journal of Economics and Management Sciences*, Vol. 3, No. 2, 1972.

[Web of Science®](#) | [Google Scholar](#)

Thakor, A. V., 'Capital Requirements, Monetary Policy, and Aggregate Bank Lending: Theory and Empirical Evidence', *Journal of Finance*, Vol. 51, No. 2, 1996.

[Google Scholar](#)

Valukas, A. R., *In re Lehman Brothers Holdings Inc.*, United States Bankruptcy Court Southern District of New York, Chapter 11 Case No. 08-13555 (JMP), 2010.

[Google Scholar](#)

Webb, D., 'An Economic Evaluation of Insolvency Procedures in the United Kingdom', *Oxford Economic Papers*, Vol. 43, No. 4, 1991.

[Web of Science®](#) | [Google Scholar](#)

Weiss, L., and K. Wruck, 'Information Problems, Conflicts of Interest, and Asset Stripping: Chapter 11's Failure in the Case of Eastern Airlines', *Journal of Financial Economics*, Vol. 48, No. 3, 1998.

[Web of Science®](#) | [Google Scholar](#)

White, M., 'Insolvency and Bankruptcy', in P. Newman, M. Milgate and J. Eatwell, eds, *The New Palgrave Dictionary of Money and Finance*, Macmillan, 1992.

[Google Scholar](#)

Whittington, G., 'Fair Value and the IASB/FASB Conceptual Framework Project: An Alternative View', *ABACUS*, Vol. 44, No. 2, 2008.

[Web of Science®](#) | [Google Scholar](#)

Zingales, L., 'Causes and Effects of the Lehman Brothers Bankruptcy', Testimony before the Committee on Oversight and Government Reform, United States House of Representatives, 6 October, 2008.

[Google Scholar](#)

ABOUT WILEY ONLINE LIBRARY

[Privacy Policy](#)

[Terms of Use](#)

[About Cookies](#)

[Manage Cookies](#)

[Accessibility](#)

[Wiley Research DE&I Statement and Publishing Policies](#)

[Developing World Access](#)

HELP & SUPPORT

[Contact Us](#)

[Training and Support](#)

[DMCA & Reporting Piracy](#)

OPPORTUNITIES

[Subscription Agents](#)

[Advertisers & Corporate Partners](#)

CONNECT WITH WILEY

[The Wiley Network](#)

[Wiley Press Room](#)

Copyright © 1999-2025 John Wiley & Sons, Inc or related companies. All rights reserved, including rights for text and data mining and training of artificial intelligence technologies or similar technologies.

WILEY