

Critical appraisal of the literature on economic evaluations of substitution of skills between professionals: a systematic literature review

Angelique T. M. Dierick-van Daele, Cor Spreeuwenberg, Emmy W. C. C. Derckx, Job F. M. Metsemakers, Bert J. M. Vrijhoef

First published: 09 July 2008

<https://doi.org/10.1111/j.1365-2753.2008.00924.x>

✉ Angelique T. M. Dierick

Department of Integrated Care

University Hospital Maastricht

PO Box 5800

6202 AZ Maastricht

the Netherlands

E-mail: angeliquedierick@orange.nl



Abstract

Objective Substitution of skills has been introduced to increase health service efficiency, but little evidence is available about its cost-effectiveness. This systematic review aims to identify economic evaluations of substitution between professionals, to assess the quality of the study methods applied and to value the results for decision making.

Methods Publications between January 1996 and November 2006 were searched in Medline, Cochrane, Cinahl, database of Health Technology Assessments, EPOC and Embase. Randomized controlled trials (RCTs), cost-benefit analysis, interrupted time series design and systematic reviews were selected. The methodological quality of the papers was reviewed, using the critical appraisal of Drummond and the EPOC list.

Results Eleven studies were finally included of 7605 studies: three cost-effectiveness studies, three cost-minimization studies and five studies related to partial economic evaluations. Small numbers

This website utilizes technologies such as cookies to enable essential site functionality, as well as for analytics, personalization, and targeted advertising. You may change your settings at any time or accept the default settings. You may close this banner to continue with only essential cookies. [Privacy Policy](#)

Manage Preferences

Accept All

Reject Non-Essential

1 World Health Organization. (2000) *The World Health Report, 2000 – Health Systems: Improving Performance*. Geneva: World Health Organization.

[Google Scholar](#) 

2 Buchan, J. & Dal Poz, M. R. (2002) Skill mix in the health care workforce: reviewing the evidence. *Bulletin of the World Health Organ*, 80 (7), 575–580.

[PubMed](#)  | [Web of Science®](#)  | [Google Scholar](#) 

3 Reay, T., Golden-Biddle, K. & Germann, K. (2003) Challenges and leadership strategies for managers of nurse practitioners. *Journal of Nursing Management*, 11 (6), 396–403.

[CAS](#)  | [PubMed](#)  | [Google Scholar](#) 

4 McKenna, H., Richey, R., Keeney, S., Hasson, F., Sinclair, M. & Poulton, B. (2006) The introduction of innovative nursing and midwifery roles: the perspective of healthcare managers. *Journal of Advances in Nursing*, 56 (5), 553–562.

[CAS](#)  | [PubMed](#)  | [Web of Science®](#)  | [Google Scholar](#) 

5 Richardson, G. (1999) Identifying, evaluating and implementing cost-effective skill mix. *Journal of Nursing Management*, 7 (5), 265–270.

[CAS](#)  | [PubMed](#)  | [Google Scholar](#) 

6 Kernick, D. & Scott, A. (2002) Economic approaches to doctor/nurse skill mix: problems, pitfalls, and partial solutions. *British Journal of General Practice*, 52 (474), 42–46.

[PubMed](#)  | [Web of Science®](#)  | [Google Scholar](#) 

7 American Academy of Nurse Practitioners (AANP). (2000) *Nurse Practitioners – Providers of Quality Primary Care. Documentation of Cost Effectiveness*. Washington DC: AANP. revised 2000. Available at: [htt](#)

This website utilizes technologies such as cookies to enable essential site functionality, as well as for analytics, personalization, and targeted advertising. You may change your settings at any time or accept the default settings. You may close this banner to continue with only essential cookies. [Privacy Policy](#)

Manage Preferences

Accept All

Reject Non-Essential

9 Hoffman, C. & Graf von der Schulenberg, J. M. (2000) The influence of economic evaluation studies on decisionmaking: a European survey. *Health Policy*, **52**, 179–192.

[PubMed](#) | [Web of Science®](#) | [Google Scholar](#) |

10 Williams, I. & Bryan, S. (2007) Understanding the limited impact of economic evaluation in health care resource allocation: a conceptual framework. *Health Policy*, **80** (1), 135–143.

[PubMed](#) | [Web of Science®](#) | [Google Scholar](#) |

11 Canadian Nurse Association. Cost-effectiveness of the nurse practitioner role. Factsheet. Ottawa: CAN. Available at: <http://www.can-nurses.ca/> (last accessed December 2006).

[Google Scholar](#) |

12 Drummond, M. F., O'Brien, B., Stoddart, G. L. & Torrance, G. W. (1997) *Methods for the Economic Evaluation of Health Care Programmes*, 2nd edn. New York: Oxford University Press.

[Google Scholar](#) |

13 Cochrane Effective Practice and Organisation of Care Review Group (1998) *The Cochrane Effective Practice and Organisation of Care Review Group Data Collection Checklist*. Aberdeen, UK, University of Aberdeen.

[Web of Science®](#) | [Google Scholar](#) |

14 French, J., Bilton, D. & Campbell, F. (2003) Nurse specialist care for bronchiectasis. *Cochrane Database of Systematic Reviews*, **3**, CD004319.

[Google Scholar](#) |

15 Sharples, L. D., Edmunds, J., Bilton, D., Hollingworth, W., Caine, N., Keogan, M. & Exley, A. (2002) A randomised controlled crossover trial of nurse practitioner versus doctor led outpatient care in a bronchiectasis clinic. *Thorax*, **57** (8), 661–666.

This website utilizes technologies such as cookies to enable essential site functionality, as well as for analytics, personalization, and targeted advertising. You may change your settings at any time or accept the default settings. You may close this banner to continue with only essential cookies. [Privacy Policy](#)

Manage Preferences

Accept All

Reject Non-Essential

17 Van Den Hout, W. B., Tijhuis, G. J., Hazes, J. M., Breedveld, F. C. & Vliet Vlieland, T. P. (2003) Cost effectiveness and cost utility analysis of multidisciplinary care in patients with rheumatoid arthritis: a randomised comparison of clinical nurse specialist care, inpatient team care, and day patient team care. *Annals of the Rheumatic Diseases*, 62 (4), 308-315.

[CAS](#) | [PubMed](#) | [Web of Science®](#) | [Google Scholar](#)

18 Tijhuis, G. J., Zwinderman, A. H., Hazes, J. M., Breedveld, F. C. & Vlieland, P. M. (2003) Two-year follow-up of a randomized controlled trial of a clinical nurse specialist intervention, inpatient, and day patient team care in rheumatoid arthritis. *Journal of Advanced Nursing*, 41 (1), 34-43.

[PubMed](#) | [Web of Science®](#) | [Google Scholar](#)

19 Venning, P., Durie, A., Roland, M., Roberts, C. & Leese, B. (2000) Randomised controlled trial comparing cost effectiveness of general practitioners and nurse practitioners in primary care. *British Medical Journal*, 320 (7241), 1048-1053.

[CAS](#) | [PubMed](#) | [Web of Science®](#) | [Google Scholar](#)

20 Richardson, G., Maynard, A., Cullum, N. & Kindig, D. (1998) Skill mix changes: substitution or service development? *Health Policy*, 45 (2), 119-132.

[CAS](#) | [PubMed](#) | [Web of Science®](#) | [Google Scholar](#)

21 Caine, N., Sharples, L. D., Hollingworth, W., French, J., Keogan, M., Exley, A., Hodgkins, D. & Bilton, D. (2002) A randomised controlled crossover trial of nurse practitioner versus doctor-led outpatient care in a bronchiectasis clinic. *Health Technology Assessment*, 6 (27), 1-71.

[CAS](#) | [PubMed](#) | [Google Scholar](#)

22 Kinley, H., Czoski-Murray, C., George, S., *et al.* (2001) Extended scope of nursing practice: a multicentre randomised controlled trial of appropriately trained nurses and pre-registration house officers in pre-operative assessment in elective general surgery. *Health Technology Assessment*, 5 (20), 1-87.

[CAS](#) | [PubMed](#) | [Google Scholar](#)

This website utilizes technologies such as cookies to enable essential site functionality, as well as for analytics, personalization, and targeted advertising. You may change your settings at any time or accept the default settings. You may close this banner to continue with only essential cookies. [Privacy Policy](#)

Manage Preferences

Accept All

Reject Non-Essential

[CAS](#) | [PubMed](#) | [Web of Science®](#) | [Google Scholar](#)

25 Kamps, A. W., Roorda, R. J., Kimpen, J. L., Overgoor-van de Groes, A. W., Van Helsdingen-Peek, L. C. & Brand, P. L. (2004) Impact of nurse-led outpatient management of children with asthma on healthcare resource utilisation and costs. *The European Respiratory Journal*, 23 (2), 304–309.

[CAS](#) | [PubMed](#) | [Web of Science®](#) | [Google Scholar](#)

26 Harmsen, M., Laurant, M., Van Achterberg, T., Hulscher, M., Wensing, M., Wollersheim, H. & Grol, R. (2006) Taakherschikking in de gezondheidszorg: een systematisch literatuuroverzicht. WOK, Centre for Quality of Care Research, UMC, St Radboud Nijmegen, the Netherlands.

[Google Scholar](#)

27 Glasgow, R. E. (2006) RE-AIMing research for application: ways to improve evidence for family medicine. *Journal of the American Board of Family Medicine*, 19 (1), 11–19.

[PubMed](#) | [Web of Science®](#) | [Google Scholar](#)

28 Sidani, S. & Irvine, D. (1999) A conceptual framework for evaluating the nurse practitioner role in acute care settings. *Journal of Advanced Nursing*, 30 (1), 58–66.

[CAS](#) | [PubMed](#) | [Web of Science®](#) | [Google Scholar](#)

29 Doran, D. I., Sidani, S., Keatings, M. & Doidge, D. (2002) An empirical test of the Nursing Role Effectiveness Model. *Journal of Advanced Nursing*, 38 (1), 29–39.

[CAS](#) | [PubMed](#) | [Web of Science®](#) | [Google Scholar](#)

Citing Literature



This website utilizes technologies such as cookies to enable essential site functionality, as well as for analytics, personalization, and targeted advertising. You may change your settings at any time or accept the default settings. You may close this banner to continue with only essential cookies. [Privacy Policy](#)



Manage Preferences

Accept All

Reject Non-Essential

Manage Cookies

Accessibility

Wiley Research DE&I Statement and Publishing Policies

HELP & SUPPORT

Contact Us

Training and Support

DMCA & Reporting Piracy

Sitemap

OPPORTUNITIES

Subscription Agents

Advertisers & Corporate Partners

CONNECT WITH WILEY

The Wiley Network

Wiley Press Room

Copyright © 1999-2026 John Wiley & Sons, Inc or related companies. All rights reserved, including rights for text and data mining and training of artificial intelligence technologies or similar technologies.

WILEY

This website utilizes technologies such as cookies to enable essential site functionality, as well as for analytics, personalization, and targeted advertising. You may change your settings at any time or accept the default settings. You may close this banner to continue with only essential cookies. [Privacy Policy](#)



Manage Preferences

Accept All

Reject Non-Essential