

# Financial Compensation for Victims of Catastrophes: A Law and Economics Perspective

MICHAEL G. FAURE

First published: 13 June 2007

<https://doi.org/10.1111/j.1467-9930.2007.00258.x>

Citations: 16

✉ Address correspondence to Dr. Michael G. Faure, Maastricht University, P.O. Box 616, 6200 MD Maastricht, the Netherlands. Telephone: 0031-43-3883028. E-mail: [michael.faure@facburfdr.unimaas.nl](mailto:michael.faure@facburfdr.unimaas.nl).

I am grateful to the anonymous referee, to Ben Depoorter, Gerrit de Geest, Ton Hartlief, Roger Van den Bergh, and the participants in the Midterm meeting of the Erasmus Program in Law and Economics in Bologna, as well to participants in workshops at the centre d'analyse économique (CEA) of the faculty of Economics of the University of Aix-Marseille, at the Centre for Risk and Insurance of Nottingham University Business School, at the ETH at the University of Zürich and at the von Sonnenfels Center for the Study of Public Law and Economics in Vienna for useful comments on an earlier version of this article.

## Abstract

*This article examines the various approaches legislators may use to compensate victims of catastrophes. Traditional law and economics of insurance literature, with respect to government relief and insurance solutions towards financial compensation, is used to analyze (highly diverging) approaches in Europe and the United States. First, the importance of liability (insurance) is discussed in cases where a liable injurer can be identified; second, the possibilities of first-party insurance are examined, whereby various regulatory solutions (particularly the French model of providing mandatory coverage for catastrophes) is critically discussed. The (first-party) insurance solution is compared with public intervention, and a distinction is made between ad hoc government relief on an ex-post basis and structural compensation funds. The solutions applied and discussed in many countries are critically analyzed for their ability to provide adequate compensation at low costs and their effects on incentives for prevention and for developing private (insurance) solutions.*

## REFERENCES

Abraham, Kenneth S. (2004) "United States of America. Liability for Acts of Terrorism Under US Law." In *Terrorism, Tort Law and Insurance: A Comparative Survey*, edited by B. A. Koch, 176–88. New York: Springer.

[Google Scholar](#)

Ammerlaan, Karin, and Willem VanBoom (2003) "De Nederlandse herverzekeringsmaatschappij voor terrorismeschaden en de rol van de overheid bij het vergoeden van terreurschade," *Nederlands Juristenblad* 78: 2330–39.

[Google Scholar](#)

Bier, Vicky (2006) "Hurricane Katrina as a Bureaucratic Nightmare." In *On Risk and Disaster. Lessons from Hurricane Katrina*, edited by R. J. Daniels, D. F. Kettl & H. Kunreuther, 243–54. Philadelphia: Univ. of Pennsylvania Press.

[Web of Science®](#) | [Google Scholar](#)

---

Bishop, William (1983) "The Contract-Tort Boundary and the Economics of Insurance," *Journal of Legal Studies* 12: 241–66.

[Web of Science®](#) | [Google Scholar](#)

---

Bloembergen, Auke R. (1992) "Een schadefonds geweldmisdrijven?" In *Bloembergen's werk*, edited by A. R. Bloembergen, 167–78. Deventer: Kluwer.

[Google Scholar](#)

---

Cutler, David M., and Richard J. Zeckhauser (1999) "Reinsurance for Catastrophes and Cataclysms." In *The Financing of Catastrophe Risk*, edited by K. A. Froot, 233–69. Chicago: Univ. of Chicago Press.

[Google Scholar](#)

---

Daniels, Ronald J., Donald F. Kettl, and Howard Kunreuther (2006) *On Risk and Disaster. Lessons from Hurricane Katrina*. Philadelphia: Univ. of Pennsylvania Press.

[Google Scholar](#)

---

Endres, Alfred, Cornelia Ohl, and Bianca Rundshagen (2003) "'Land unter!' Ein institutionenökonomische Zwischenruf," *List Forum für Wirtschafts- und Finanzpolitik* 29: 284–94.

[Google Scholar](#)

---

Endres, Alfred, and Brigitte Staiger (1996) "Ökonomische Aspekte des Umwelthaftungsrecht." In *Umwelthaftung, Risikosteuerung und Versicherung*, edited by M. Ahrens, & J. Simon, 79–93. Berlin: Erich Schmidt Verlag.

[Google Scholar](#)

---

Epstein, Richard A. (1985) "Product Liability as an Insurance Market," *Journal of Legal Studies* 14: 645–69.

[Web of Science®](#) | [Google Scholar](#)

---

Epstein, Richard A. (1995) *Simple Rules for a Complex World*. Cambridge, MA: Harvard Univ. Press.

[Google Scholar](#)

---

Epstein, Richard (1996) "Catastrophic Responses to Catastrophic Risks," *Journal of Risk and Uncertainty* 12: 287–308.

Faure, Michael (1995) "Economic Models of Compensation for Damage Caused by Nuclear Accidents: Some Lessons for the Revision of the Paris and Vienna Conventions," *European Journal of Law and Economics* 2: 21–43.

[Google Scholar](#)

---

Faure, Michael (2002) "Environmental Damage Insurance in Theory and Practice." In *An Introduction to the Law and Economics of Environmental Policy: Issues in Institutional Design*, edited by T. Swanson, 283–328. Boston: JAI Press.

[Google Scholar](#)

---

Faure, Michael (2006) "Comparative and Policy Conclusions." In *Financial Compensation for Victims of Catastrophes: A Comparative Legal Approach*, edited by M. Faure & T. Hartlief, 389–452. Vienna: Springer.

[Google Scholar](#)

---

Faure, Michael, and David Grimeaud (2003) "Financial Assurances Issues of Environmental Liability." In *Deterrence, Insurability and Compensation in Environmental Liability. Future Developments in the European Union*, edited by M. Faure, 35–36. New York: Springer.

[Google Scholar](#)

---

Faure, Michael, and Ton Hartlief (1996) "Compensation Funds versus Liability and Insurance for Remediating Environmental Damage," *Review of European Community and International Environmental Law (RECIEL)* 5: 321–26.

[Google Scholar](#)

---

Faure, Michael, and Ton Hartlief (2002) *Nieuwe risico's en vragen van aansprakelijkheid en verzekering*. Deventer: Kluwer.

[Google Scholar](#)

---

Faure, Michael, and Ton Hartlief (2003) *Insurance and Expanding Systemic Risks*. Paris: OECD.

[Google Scholar](#)

---

Michael Faure, and Ton Hartlief (eds.) (2006) *Financial Compensation for Victims of Catastrophes: A Comparative Legal Approach*. Vienna: Springer.

[Google Scholar](#)

---

Faure, Michael, and Roger Van den Bergh (1995) "Restrictions of Competition on Insurance Markets and the Applicability of EC Anti-Trust Law," *Kyklos* 48: 65–85.

[Web of Science®](#) | [Google Scholar](#)

---

Frey, Bruno S., and Alois W. Stutzer (2002) *Happiness & Economics*. Princeton, NJ: Princeton Univ. Press.

[Google Scholar](#)

---

Frey, Bruno S., and Alois W. Stutzer (2004) *Happiness Research: State and Prospects*. Working Paper—Institute for Empirical Research in Economics. Available at <http://www.iew.unizh.ch/wp/iewwp.190.pdf>.

[Google Scholar](#)

---

Kenneth A. Froot (ed.) (1999) *The Financing of Catastrophe Risk*. Chicago: Univ. of Chicago Press.

[Web of Science®](#) | [Google Scholar](#)

---

Gollier, Christian (2005) "Some Aspects of the Economics of Catastrophe Risk Insurance." In OECD, *Catastrophic risks and insurance*, 13–30. Paris: OECD.

[Google Scholar](#)

---

Gron, Anne (1999) "Insurer Demand for Catastrophe Reinsurance." In *The Financing of Catastrophe Risk*, edited by K. A. Froot, 23–44. Chicago: Univ. of Chicago Press.

[Google Scholar](#)

---

Gron, Anne, and Alan O. Sykes (2002) "A Role for Government," *Regulation* 25: 44–51.

[Google Scholar](#)

---

Harrington, Scott E. (2000) "Rethinking Disaster Policy," *Regulation—The Cato Review of Business and Government* 23 (1): 40–46.

[Google Scholar](#)

---

Hartlief, Ton (2003) "De meerwaarde van het aansprakelijkheidsrecht." In *Einde van het aansprakelijkheidsrecht?*, edited by T. Hartlief & S. Klosse, 58–59. Den Haag: Boom.

[Google Scholar](#)

---

Huber, Michael, and Tola Amodu (2006) "United Kingdom." In *Financial Compensation for Victims of Catastrophes: A Comparative Legal Approach*, edited by M. Faure & T. Hartlief, 261–301. Vienna: Springer.

[Web of Science®](#) | [Google Scholar](#)

---

Huls, Ernst H. (2002) "Schadefondsen bij rampen." In *Aansprakelijkheid en schadeverhaal bij rampen*, edited by A. Akkermans & E. Edward, 209–10. Nijmegen: Ars Aequi Libri.

[Google Scholar](#)

Kahnemann, Daniel, and Amos Tversky (1979) "Prospect Theory: An Analysis of Decision Under Risk," *Econometrica* 47: 263–91.

[Web of Science®](#) | [Google Scholar](#)

---

Kaplow, Louis (1991) "Incentives and Government Relief for Risk," *Journal of Risk and Uncertainty* 4: 167–75.

[Web of Science®](#) | [Google Scholar](#)

---

Kaplow, Louis, and Steven Shavell (2001) "Fairness Versus Welfare," *Harvard Law Review* 114: 967–1388.

[Web of Science®](#) | [Google Scholar](#)

---

Kleindorfer, Paul R., and Howard C. Kunreuther (1999) "Challenges Facing the Insurance Industry in Managing Catastrophic Risks." In *The Financing of Catastrophe Risk*, edited by K. A. Froot, 149–89. Chicago: Univ. of Chicago Press.

[Google Scholar](#)

---

Bernhard A. Koch, and Helmut Koziol (eds.) (2002) *Unification of Tort Law: Strict Liability*. New York: Kluwer Law International.

[Google Scholar](#)

---

Kunreuther, Howard (1968) "The Case for Comprehensive Disaster Insurance," *Journal of Law and Economics* 11: 133–63.

[Web of Science®](#) | [Google Scholar](#)

---

Kunreuther, Howard (1978) *Disaster Insurance Protection: Public Policy Lessons*. New York: Wiley.

[Google Scholar](#)

---

Kunreuther, Howard (1996) "Mitigating Disaster Losses Through Insurance," *Journal of Risk and Uncertainty* 12: 171–87.

[Web of Science®](#) | [Google Scholar](#)

---

Kunreuther, Howard (2006) "Has the Time Come for Comprehensive Natural Disaster Insurance?" In *On Risk and Disaster. Lessons from Hurricane Katrina*, edited by R. J. Daniels, D. F. Kettl & H. Kunreuther, 175–201. Philadelphia: Univ. of Pennsylvania Press.

[Web of Science®](#) | [Google Scholar](#)

---

Kunreuther, Howard, Neill Doherty, and Anne Kleffner (1992) "Should Society Deal with the Earthquake Problem?" *Regulation—The Cato Review of Business and Government*, 15 (2).

[Google Scholar](#)

---

Kunreuther, Howard, and Paul Freeman (2001) "Insurability, Environmental Risks and the Law." In *The Law and Economics of the Environment*, edited by A. Heyes, 302–318. Cheltenham: Edward Elgar.

[Google Scholar](#)

---

Kunreuther, H., R. Hogarth, and J. Meszaros (1993) "Insurer Ambiguity and Market Failure," *Journal of Risk and Uncertainty* 9: 71–87.

[Web of Science®](#) | [Google Scholar](#)

---

Lafay, Fabien, Michel Cannarsa, and Olivier Moréteau (2006) "France." In *Financial Compensation for Victims of Catastrophes: A Comparative Legal Approach*, edited by M. Faure & T. Hartlief, 81–118. Vienna: Springer.

[Google Scholar](#)

---

Landes, William M., and Richard A. Posner (1984) "Tort Law as a Regulatory Regime for Catastrophic Personal Injuries," *Journal of Legal Studies* 13: 417–34.

[Web of Science®](#) | [Google Scholar](#)

---

Landes, William M., and Richard A. Posner (1987) *The Economic Structure of Tort Law*. Cambridge, MA: Harvard Univ. Press.

[Google Scholar](#)

---

Guy Levie, and Herman Cousy (eds.) (1994) *La politique européenne de concurrence en matière d'assurances*. Brussels: Bruylant.

[Google Scholar](#)

---

Joanne Linnerooth-Bayer, Ragner E. Löfstedt, and Gunnar Sjöstedt (eds.) (2001) *Transboundary Risk Management*. London: Earthscan.

[Google Scholar](#)

---

Ulrich Magnus (ed.) (2003) *The Impact of Social Security Law on Tort Law*. New York: Springer.

[Google Scholar](#)

---

Magnus, Ulrich (2006) "Germany." In *Compensation for Victims of Catastrophes: A Comparative Legal Approach*, edited by M. Faure & T. Hartlief, 119–44. Vienna: Springer.

[Web of Science®](#) | [Google Scholar](#)

---

Monti, Alberto (2001) "Environmental Risk: A Comparative Law and Economics Approach to Liability and Insurance," *European Review of Private Law* 9: 51–79.

[Google Scholar](#)

---

Monti, Alberto, and Filippo Andrea Chiaves (2006) "Italy." In *Financial Compensation for Victims of Catastrophes: A Comparative Legal Approach*, edited by M. Faure & T. Hartlief, 145–94. Vienna: Springer.

[Web of Science®](#) | [Google Scholar](#)

---

Moreteau, Olivier, and Fabien Lafay (2004) "France. Liability for Acts of Terrorism Under French Law." In *Terrorism, Tort Law and Insurance. A Comparative Survey*, edited by B. A. Koch, 29–56. New York: Springer.

[Google Scholar](#)

---

Nell, M. (2002) "Gesellschaftliches Risikomanagement für Hochwasserschäden. Beitrag zum Zeitgespräch: brauchen wir eine Zwangsversicherung gegen Elementarschäden?," *Wirtschaftsdienst* **82** (10): 582–85.

[Google Scholar](#)

---

OECD (2005) *Catastrophic Risks and Insurance*. Paris: OECD.

[Google Scholar](#)

---

Posner, Richard A. (2003) *Economic Analysis of Law*, 6th ed. New York: Aspen.

[Google Scholar](#)

---

Posner, Richard A. (2004) *Catastrophe. Risk and Response*. Oxford, UK: Oxford Univ. Press.

[Google Scholar](#)

---

Pozzo, Barbara (1996) "The Liability Problem in Modern Environmental Statutes," *European Review of Private Law* **4**: 112–29.

[Google Scholar](#)

---

Priest, George (1987) "The Current Insurance Crisis and Modern Tort Law," *Yale Law Journal* **96**: 1521–90.

[Web of Science®](#) | [Google Scholar](#)

---

Priest, George (1996) "The Government, the Market and the Problem of Catastrophic Loss," *Journal of Risk and Uncertainty* **12**: 219–37.

[Web of Science®](#) | [Google Scholar](#)

---

Rabin, Robert L., and Suzanne A. Bratis (2006) "United States." In *Financial Compensation for Victims of Catastrophes, a Comparative Legal Approach*, edited by M. Faure & T. Hartlief, 303–59. Vienna: Springer.

[Google Scholar](#)

---

Richard Revesz, and Richard Stewart (eds.) (1995) *Analysing Superfund, Economics, Science and the Law*. Washington, DC: Resources for the Future.

[Google Scholar](#)

---

Richardson, B. J. (2000) "Financial Institutions for Sustainability," *Environmental Liability* 2: 52–64.

[Google Scholar](#)

---

Schäfer, Hans-Bernd, and A. Schönenberger (2000) "Strict Liability Versus Negligence." In Civil Law and Economics. *Encyclopaedia of Law and Economics*, vol. 2, 597–624. (Cheltenham: Edward Elgar).

[Google Scholar](#)

---

Schoemaker, Paul J. H., and Howard C. Kunreuther (1979) "An Experimental Study of Insurance Decisions," *Journal of Risk and Insurance* 46: 603–18.

[Web of Science®](#) | [Google Scholar](#)

---

Schwartz, A., and L. Wilde (1979) "Intervening in Markets on the Basis of Imperfect Information: A Legal and Economic Analysis," *Univ. of Pennsylvania Law Review* 127: 630–82.

[Web of Science®](#) | [Google Scholar](#)

---

Schwarze, Reimund, and Gert Wagner (2002) "Hochwasser Katastrophe in Deutschland: über Soforthilfe hinaus denken," *DIW, Wochenbericht* 35 (2): 596–600. Available at <http://www.diw.de>.

[Google Scholar](#)

---

Schwarze, Reimund, and Gert Wagner (2004) "In the Aftermath of Dresden. New Directions in German Flood Insurance" *Geneva Papers on Risk and Insurance* 29 (2): 154–68.

[Web of Science®](#) | [Google Scholar](#)

---

Shavell, Steven (1979) "On Moral Hazard and Insurance," *Quarterly Journal of Economics* 93: 541–62.

[Web of Science®](#) | [Google Scholar](#)

---

Shavell, Steven (1980) "Strict Liability versus Negligence," *Journal of Legal Studies* 9: 1–25.

[Web of Science®](#) | [Google Scholar](#)

---

Shavell, Steven (1984a) "Liability for Harm versus Regulation of Safety," *Journal of Legal Studies* 13: 357–74.

[Web of Science®](#) | [Google Scholar](#)

---



Shavell, Steven (1984b) "A Model of the Optimal Use of Liability and Safety Regulation," *Rand Journal of Economics* 15: 271–80.

[Web of Science®](#) | [Google Scholar](#)

---

Shavell, Steven (1986) "The Judgment-Proof Problem," *International Review of Law and Economics* 6: 43–58.

[Google Scholar](#)

---

Shavell, Steven (1987) *Economic Analysis of Accident Law*. Cambridge, MA: Harvard Univ. Press.

[Google Scholar](#)

---

Skogh, Göran (1982) "Public Insurance and Accident Prevention," *International Review of Law and Economics* 2: 67–80.

[Google Scholar](#)

---

Skogh, Göran (1989) "The Combination of Private and Public Regulation of Safety." In *Essays in Law and Economics. Corporations, Accident Prevention and Compensation for Losses*, edited by M. Faure & R. Van den Bergh, 87–101. Antwerp: Maklu.

[Google Scholar](#)

---

Slovic, P. et al. (1977) "Preferences for Insuring against Probable Small Losses: Insurance Implications," *Journal of Risk and Insurance* 44: 237–58.

[Web of Science®](#) | [Google Scholar](#)

---

Paul Slovic (ed.) (2000) *The Perception of Risk*. London: Earthscan.

[PubMed](#) | [Web of Science®](#) | [Google Scholar](#)

---

Slovic, Paul, Baruch Fischhoff, and Sarah Lichtenstein (2000) "Cognitive Processes and Societal Risk Taking." In *The Perception of Risk*, edited by P. Slovic, 32–50. London: Earthscan.

[Google Scholar](#)

---

Slovic, Paul, Baruch Fischhoff, Sarah Lichtenstein, Bernard Corrigan, and Barbara Combs (2000) "Preference for Insuring Against Probable Small Losses: Insurance Implications." In *The Perception of Risk*, edited by P. Slovic, 51–72. London: Earthscan.

[Google Scholar](#)

---

Slovic, Paul, H. Kunreuther and Gilbert White (2000) "Decision Processes, Rationality and Adjustment to Natural Hazards." In *The Perception of Risk*, edited by P. Slovic, 1–31. London: Earthscan.

[Web of Science®](#) | [Google Scholar](#)

---

Sunstein, Cass R. (2002) *Risk and Reason. Safety, Law, and the Environment*. Cambridge, UK: Cambridge Univ. Press.

[Google Scholar](#)

---

Trebilcock, Michael, and Ralph Winter (1997) "The Economics of Nuclear Accident Law," *International Review of Law and Economics* 17: 215-43.

[Web of Science®](#) | [Google Scholar](#)

---

Van den Bergh, Roger, and Michael Faure (2005) "Compulsory Insurance of Loss to Property caused by Natural Disasters: Competition or Solidarity?" *World Competition* 29 (1): 25-54.

[Google Scholar](#)

---

Van Schoubroeck, Caroline (2002) "Objectieve aansprakelijkheid en verzekeringsplicht bij schade door rampen. Een Belgische case-studie." In *Aansprakelijkheid en schadeverhaal bij rampen*, edited by A. Akkermans & E. Brans, 145-71. Nijmegen: Ars Aequi Libri.

[Google Scholar](#)

---

Viscusi, V. Kip (1991) "The Dimension of the Product Liability Crisis," *Journal of Legal Studies* 20: 147-77.

[Web of Science®](#) | [Google Scholar](#)

---

Von Bar, Christian (2000), *The Common European Law of Torts*, vol. 2. Oxford, UK: Clarendon Press.

[Google Scholar](#)

---

Walter, Jonathan, and Donald Kettle (2006) "The Katrina Breakdown." In *On Risk and Disaster. Lessons from Hurricane Katrina*, edited by R. Daniels, J. Kettl, F. Donald & H. Kunreuther, 255-61. Philadelphia: Univ. of Pennsylvania Press.

[Web of Science®](#) | [Google Scholar](#)

---

Zeckhauser, Richard (1996) "The Economics of Catastrophes," *Journal of Risk and Uncertainty* 12: 113-40.

[Web of Science®](#) | [Google Scholar](#)

## **ABOUT WILEY ONLINE LIBRARY**

[Privacy Policy](#)

[Terms of Use](#)

[About Cookies](#)

[Manage Cookies](#)

[Accessibility](#)

[Wiley Research DE&I Statement and Publishing Policies](#)

[Developing World Access](#)

## **HELP & SUPPORT**

[Contact Us](#)

[Training and Support](#)

[DMCA & Reporting Piracy](#)

## **OPPORTUNITIES**

[Subscription Agents](#)

[Advertisers & Corporate Partners](#)

## **CONNECT WITH WILEY**

[The Wiley Network](#)

[Wiley Press Room](#)

Copyright © 1999-2024 John Wiley & Sons, Inc or related companies. All rights reserved, including rights for text and data mining and training of artificial intelligence technologies or similar technologies.

**WILEY**