

Financial market analysis can go mad (in the search for irrational behaviour during the South Sea Bubble)¹

GARY S. SHEA

First published: 18 October 2007

<https://doi.org/10.1111/j.1468-0289.2007.00379.x>



Abstract

An investigation into the legal and political history of South Sea Company subscription finance shows that the subscription contracts had default options built into them, as was typically the case in eighteenth-century subscription financing. Company records and contemporary pamphlet literature show that people understood the subscription finance mechanics that were stated in law. A fair presentation of South Sea share value data also supports this view. We thus conclude that the analyses published in this journal by Dale, Johnson, and Tang were irretrievably flawed and present a substantially incorrect history of the markets for South Sea shares.

Supporting Information

Supplementary Appendix III. Data sources – a comparative analysis of Freke, Castaing and South Sea directors’ dealings through brokers

Filename	Description
EHR_379_sm_Supplementary_Appendix_III.pdf 177.7 KB	Supporting info item

Please note: The publisher is not responsible for the content or functionality of any supporting information supplied by the authors. Any queries (other than missing content) should be directed to the corresponding

This website utilizes technologies such as cookies to enable essential site functionality, as well as for analytics, personalization, and targeted advertising. You may change your settings at any time or accept the default settings. You may close this banner to continue with only essential cookies. [Privacy Policy](#)

Manage Preferences

Accept All

Reject Non-Essential

Anon., An answer to the reasons for making void and annulling fraudulent and usurious contracts, &c (1721). URL <http://galenet.galegroup.com/servlet/MOME>.

[Google Scholar](#) 

Anon., The case of contracts for South Sea Stock, in general, since the taking of the third subscription, at 1000 per cent (1720). URL <http://galenet.galegroup.com/servlet/ECCO>.

[Google Scholar](#) 

Anon., The case of the purchasers of the first and second subscriptions to the South-Sea Company, at 4 to 500 per cent and of the stock at 7 to 800 per cent and upwards in ready money (1721). URL <http://galenet.galegroup.com/servlet/ECCO>.

[Google Scholar](#) 

Anon., The case of the sellers of the third and fourth money-subscriptions (1721). URL <http://galenet.galegroup.com/servlet/ECCO>.

[Google Scholar](#) 

Anon., A full confutation of the subscribers' pretensions to the receipts for the first payment, etc. (1721). URL <http://galenet.galegroup.com/servlet/MOME>.

[Google Scholar](#) 

Anon., Further reasons offer'd and fresh occasions given for making void and annulling fraudulent and usurious contracts, etc. (1721). URL <http://galenet.galegroup.com/servlet/ECCO>.

[Google Scholar](#) 

Anon., A letter to a friend, in vindication of the directors of the South-Sea Company, in answer to the speech of E--st-ce B--g--11 esq; etc. (1721).

This website utilizes technologies such as cookies to enable essential site functionality, as well as for analytics, personalization, and targeted advertising. You may change your settings at any time or accept the default settings. You may close this banner to continue with only essential cookies. [Privacy Policy](#)

Manage Preferences

Accept All

Reject Non-Essential

Anon., Reasons for making void and annulling those fraudulent and usurious contracts, etc. (1721). URL <http://galenet.galegroup.com/servlet/ECCO>.

[Google Scholar](#) 

Anon., Queries, whether the South Sea contracts for time, and now pending unperformed, ought to be annulled or not (1721). URL <http://galenet.galegroup.com/servlet/MOME>.

[Google Scholar](#) 

Anon., Restitution: a law of the land, in relation to the third and fourth money subscriptions into the South-Sea Company (1721). URL <http://galenet.galegroup.com/servlet/ECCO>.

[Google Scholar](#) 

Anon. (or Defoe, D., attr. disputed), A true state of the contracts relating to the third money-subscription taken by the South-Sea Company (1721). URL <http://galenet.galegroup.com/servlet/ECCO>.

[Google Scholar](#) 

Anon., A vindication of E-----ce B-g--l, esq. etc. (1721). URL <http://galenet.galegroup.com/servlet/MOME>.

[Google Scholar](#) 

Blunt, J. (attr.), A true state of the South-Sea scheme, as it was first form'd, &c. with several alterations made in it, before the Act of Parliament pass'd etc. (1722). URL <http://galenet.galegroup.com/servlet/ECCO>.

[Google Scholar](#) 

Boyer, A., *The political state of Great Britain*, vols. 19-22 (17201). URL <http://galenet.galegroup.com/servlet/ECCO>.

[Google Scholar](#) 

Dudell, F. The speech made by Justice Dudell, serjeant at law, in a general court of the South-Sea Company, in

This website utilizes technologies such as cookies to enable essential site functionality, as well as for analytics, personalization, and targeted advertising. You may change your settings at any time or accept the default settings. You may close this banner to continue with only essential cookies. [Privacy Policy](#)

Manage Preferences

Accept All

Reject Non-Essential

Carlos, A. M., Moyen, N., and Hill, J., 'Royal African Company share prices during the South Sea Bubble', *Explorations in Economic History*, 39 (2002), pp. 61-87.

[Web of Science®](#) | [Google Scholar](#)

Castaing, J., The course of the exchange (1720).

[Google Scholar](#)

Cochrane, J. H., 'Book review of *Famous first bubbles: the fundamentals of early manias* by Peter M. Garber', *Journal of Political Economy*, 109 (2001), pp. 1150-4.

[Web of Science®](#) | [Google Scholar](#)

Cox, J. C. and Rubinstein, M., *Options markets* (Englewood Cliffs, N.J. 1985).

[Google Scholar](#)

Dale, R. S., *The first crash: lessons from the South Sea Bubble* (Princeton, 2004).

[Google Scholar](#)

Dale, R. S., Johnson, J. E. V., and Tang, L., 'Financial markets can go mad: evidence of irrational behaviour during the South Sea Bubble', *Economic History Review*, LVIII (2005), pp. 233-71.

[Web of Science®](#) | [Google Scholar](#)

Dalrymple, D., Time bargains tryed by the rules of equity and principles of the civil law (1720). URL <http://galenet.galegroup.com/servlet/ECCO>.

[Google Scholar](#)

DuBois, A. *The English business company after the Bubble Act 1720-1800* (New York 1938)

This website utilizes technologies such as cookies to enable essential site functionality, as well as for analytics, personalization, and targeted advertising. You may change your settings at any time or accept the default settings. You may close this banner to continue with only essential cookies. [Privacy Policy](#)

Manage Preferences

Accept All

Reject Non-Essential

Garber, P. M., *Famous first bubbles: the fundamentals of early manias* (Cambridge, Mass., 2000).

[Google Scholar](#) 

Harris, R., *Industrializing English law: entrepreneurship and business organization, 1720–1844* (Cambridge, 2000).

[Google Scholar](#) 

Hoppit, J., 'The myths of the South Sea Bubble', *Transactions of the Royal Historical Society*, 12 (2002), pp. 141–65.

[Web of Science®](#)  | [Google Scholar](#) 

Hutcheson, A., A collection of calculations and remarks relating to the South-Sea scheme & stock, which have already been published, with an addition of some others, which have not been made public till now (1720). URL <http://galenet.galegroup.com/servlet/ECCO>.

[Google Scholar](#) 

Hutcheson, A., Some computations and remarks relating to the subscribers, and the proprietors of the publick debts and a letter relating thereto to the sub-governor, deputy-governor, and directors of the South-Sea Company (1721). URL <http://galenet.galegroup.com/servlet/ECCO>.

[Google Scholar](#) 

Meres, J., The equity of parliaments, and publick faith; vindicated. In answer to The crisis of property, and address'd to the annuitants (1720). URL <http://galenet.galegroup.com/servlet/ECCO>.

[Google Scholar](#) 

Neal, L., *The rise of financial capitalism: international capital markets in the age of reason* (Cambridge, 1990).

[Google Scholar](#) 

This website utilizes technologies such as cookies to enable essential site functionality, as well as for analytics, personalization, and targeted advertising. You may change your settings at any time or accept the default settings. You may close this banner to continue with only essential cookies. [Privacy Policy](#)

Manage Preferences

Accept All

Reject Non-Essential

ABOUT WILEY ONLINE LIBRARY

[Privacy Policy](#)

[Terms of Use](#)

[About Cookies](#)

[Manage Cookies](#)

[Accessibility](#)

[Wiley Research DE&I Statement and Publishing Policies](#)

HELP & SUPPORT

[Contact Us](#)

[Training and Support](#)

[DMCA & Reporting Piracy](#)

[Sitemap](#)

OPPORTUNITIES


[Subscription Agents](#)

[Advertisers & Corporate Partners](#)

CONNECT WITH WILEY

[The Wiley Network](#)

[Wiley Press Room](#)

This website utilizes technologies such as cookies to enable essential site functionality, as well as for analytics, personalization, and targeted advertising. You may change your settings at any time or accept the default settings. You may close this banner to continue with only essential cookies. [Privacy Policy](#) 

[Manage Preferences](#)

[Accept All](#)

[Reject Non-Essential](#)