



## THE GOVERNANCE OF CEO INCENTIVES IN ENGLISH NHS HOSPITAL TRUSTS

Joan Ballantine, John Forker, Margaret Greenwood

First published: 17 October 2008

<https://doi.org/10.1111/j.1468-0408.2008.00459.x>

Citations: 18

✉ **Address for correspondence:** John Forker, School of Management, University of Bath, Bath BA2 7AY, UK.  
e-mail: [J.J.Forker@bath.ac.uk](mailto:J.J.Forker@bath.ac.uk)

### Abstract

Institutional arrangements for the governance of CEO pay and turnover in English NHS Hospital Trusts replicate best practice for listed companies but with the additional feature of centrally imposed performance measurement. In this paper we investigate the impact of this unique combination of incentives on the relationship between CEO pay/turnover and Trust financial and operating performance in the period 1998–2005. We identify a strong association between poor Trust performance and CEO turnover but find little evidence that remuneration committees relate pay to performance in the best performing Trusts. Our findings raise questions about the economic rationale for remuneration committees in the governance of NHS Hospital Trusts.

### REFERENCES

Ballantine, J.A., J.J. Forker and M.J. Greenwood (2007), 'Earnings Management in English NHS Hospital Trusts', *Financial Accountability & Management*, Vol. 23, No. 4, pp. 421–40.

[Google Scholar](#)

Brickley, J.A. (2003), 'Empirical Research on CEO Turnover and Firm-performance: A Discussion', *Journal of Accounting and Economics*, Vol. 36, Nos. 1–3, pp. 227–33.

[Web of Science®](#) | [Google Scholar](#)

Brickley, J.A. and R.L. Van Horn (2002), 'Managerial Incentives in Non-profit Organizations: Evidence from Hospitals', *Journal of Law and Economics*, Vol. XLV, pp. 225–49.

[Google Scholar](#)

Brickley, J.A. R.L. Van Horn and G.J. Wedig (2003), 'Board Structure and Executive Compensation in Nonprofit Organizations: Evidence from Hospitals' (October 1), Organizational Economics of Health Care Conference 2003 (Available at SSRN: <http://ssrn.com/abstract=468423> or DOI: DOI: 10.2139/ssrn.468423).

[Google Scholar](#)

---

Cahan, S.F., F. Chua and R.O. Nyamori (2005), 'Board Structure and Executive Compensation in the Public Sector: New Zealand Evidence', *Financial Accountability & Management*, Vol. 21, No. 4, pp. 437-65.

[Google Scholar](#)

---

Clatworthy, M.A., H.J. Mellett and M.J. Peel (2000), 'Corporate Governance under 'New Public Management': An Exemplification', *Corporate Governance: an International Review*, Vol. 8, No. 2, pp. 166-76.

[Web of Science®](#) | [Google Scholar](#)

---

Canyon, M.J. (1998), 'Directors Pay and Turnover: An Application to a Sample of Large UK Firms', *Oxford Bulletin of Economics and Statistics*, Vol. 60, No. 4, pp. 485-507.

[Web of Science®](#) | [Google Scholar](#)

---

Coughlin, A.T. and R.M. Schmidt (1985), 'Executive Compensation Management Turnover and Firm Performance: An Empirical Examination', *Journal of Accounting and Economics*, Vol. 7, Nos. 1-3, pp. 43-66.

[Web of Science®](#) | [Google Scholar](#)

---

Department of Health (1994), *Corporate Governance in the NHS: Code of Conduct*, Code of Accountability (Department of Health).

[Google Scholar](#)

---

Department of Health (1999), *The NHS Performance Assessment Framework* (NHS Executive, HMSO).

[Google Scholar](#)

---

Department of Health (2000), *The NHS Plan: A Plan for Investment, a Plan for Reform* (HMSO Cm 4818-I).

[Google Scholar](#)

---

Department of Health (2001), *The Report of the Public Inquiry into Children's Heart Surgery at the Bristol Royal Infirmary 1984-1995, Learning from Bristol* (London, Cm 5207).

[Google Scholar](#)

---

Department of Health (2002a), *Delivering the NHS Plan: Next Steps on Investment, Next Steps on Reform* (HMSO Cm 5503).

[Google Scholar](#)

---

Department of Health (2002b), *Raising Standards Across the NHS: A Programme of Rewards and Support for all NHS Trusts* (Department of Health).

[Google Scholar](#)

---

Department of Health (2003), *Raising Standards, Improving Performance in the NHS* (Department of Health).

[Google Scholar](#)

---

Department of Health (200203), *Definition of Management Costs in NHS Trusts: 2*.

[Google Scholar](#)

---

Dowling, B. and R. Richardson (1997), 'Evaluating Performance-related Pay for Managers in the National Health Service', *The International Journal of Human Resource Management*, Vol. 8, No. 3, pp. 348-66.

[Google Scholar](#)

---

Eldenbug, L., B. Hermalin, M. Weisbach and M. Wosinska (2004), 'Governance, Performance Objectives, and Organizational Form: Evidence from Hospitals', *Journal of Corporate Finance*, Vol. 10, No. 4, pp. 527-48.

[Web of Science®](#) | [Google Scholar](#)

---

Ellwood, S. (2003), 'Bridging the GAAP Across the UK Public Sector', *Accounting and Business Research*, Vol. 33, No. 2, pp. 105-21.

[Google Scholar](#)

---

Ellwood, S. and S. Newbury (2006), 'A Bridge Too Far: A Common Conceptual Framework for Commercial and Public Benefit Entities', *Accounting and Business Research*, Vol. 36, No. 1, pp. 19-32.

[Google Scholar](#)

---

Ezzamel, E. and R. Watson (2002), 'Pay Comparability Across and Within UK Boards: An Empirical Analysis of the Cash Pay Awards to CEOs and Other Board Members', *Journal of Management Studies*, Vol. 39, No. 2, pp. 207-32.

[Web of Science®](#) | [Google Scholar](#)

---

Fama, E. and M. Jensen (1983a), 'Separation of Ownership and Control', *Journal of Law and Economics*, Vol. 26, No. 2, pp. 301-25.

[Web of Science®](#) | [Google Scholar](#)

Fama, E. and M. Jensen (1983b), 'Agency Problems and Residual Claims', *Journal of Law and Economics*, Vol. 26, No. 2, pp. 327-49.

[Web of Science®](#) | [Google Scholar](#)

---

Financial Reporting Council (2006), 'The Combined Code on Corporate Governance' (<http://www.frc.org.uk/corporate/combinedcode.cfm>).

[Google Scholar](#)

---

Goddard, A. (2005), 'Accounting and NPM in UK Local Government - Contributions Towards Governance and Accountability', *Financial Accountability & Management*, Vol. 21, No. 2, pp. 191-218.

[Google Scholar](#)

---

Griffiths Report (1983), 'NHS Management Inquiry' (DHSS).

[Google Scholar](#)

---

Hallock, K., R. Madalozzo and R. Clayton (2006), 'CEO Pay for Performance Heterogeneity: Examples Using Quantile Regression', Working Paper (Cornell University, [http://www.people.cornell.edu/pages/kfh7/het\\_paper\\_012506.pdf](http://www.people.cornell.edu/pages/kfh7/het_paper_012506.pdf)).

[Google Scholar](#)

---

Hermalin, B.E. and M.S. Weisbach (2003), 'Boards of Directors as an Endogenously Determined Institution: A Survey of the Economic Literature', *FRBNY Economic Policy Review*, Vol. 9 (April), No. 1, pp. 7-26.

[Google Scholar](#)

---

Hilmer, F.G. (1993), *Strictly Boardroom: Improving Governance to Enhance Company Performance* (Melbourne The Business Library).

[Google Scholar](#)

---

Hilmer, F.G. and R.I. Tricker (1994), 'An Effective Board', in R.I. Tricker (eds.), *International Corporate Governance: Text, Readings and Cases* (Prentice Hall, New York, NY), pp. 285-96.

[Google Scholar](#)

---

Hodges, R. and H. Mellett (2004), 'Reporting PFI in Annual Accounts: A User's Perspective', *Public Money and Management*, Vol. 24, No. 3, pp. 153-58.

[Web of Science®](#) | [Google Scholar](#)

Hodges, R. and H. Mellett (2006), 'Accounting Regulation in the UK: One Nation, Two Sectors', Cardiff Accounting and Finance Working Papers ([http://www.cf.ac.uk/carbs/research/working\\_papers/accounting\\_finance/A2006\\_1.pdf](http://www.cf.ac.uk/carbs/research/working_papers/accounting_finance/A2006_1.pdf)).

[Google Scholar](#)

---

Hodges, R., M. Wright and K. Keasey (1996), 'Corporate Governance in the Public Services: Concepts and Issues', *Public Money and Management* (April-June), pp. 7-13.

[Web of Science®](#) | [Google Scholar](#)

---

Hood, C. (1991), 'A Public Management for All Seasons', *Public Administration*, Vol. 69, No. 1, pp. 3-19.

[Web of Science®](#) | [Google Scholar](#)

---

Hood, C. (1995), 'The "New Public Management" in the 1980s: Variations on a Theme', *Accounting, Organizations and Society*, Vol. 20, Nos. 2/3, pp. 93-109.

[Web of Science®](#) | [Google Scholar](#)

---

Jackson, C., B.G. Main, J. Pymm and V. Wright (2006), 'The Remuneration Committee Process - some questions regarding remuneration committee decision making' (<http://homepages.ed.ac.uk/mainbg/Files/LSE2012%20October%20Lecture%20background%20paper.pdf>).

[Google Scholar](#)

---

Jensen, M.C. and W.H. Meckling (1976), 'Theory of the Firm: Managerial Behaviour, Agency Costs and Ownership Structure', *Journal of Financial Economics*, Vol. 3, pp. 305-60.

[CAS](#) | [Web of Science®](#) | [Google Scholar](#)

---

Jones, C. (2002), 'The Attitudes of British National Health Service Managers and Clinicians Towards the Introduction of Benchmarking', *Financial Accountability & Management*, Vol. 18, No. 2, pp. 163-88.

[Google Scholar](#)

---

Llewellyn, S. and D. Northcott (2005), 'The Average Hospital', *Accounting, Organizations and Society*, Vol. 30, No. 6, pp. 555-83.

[Web of Science®](#) | [Google Scholar](#)

---

Main, B.G., C. Jackson, J. Pymm and V. Wright (2007), 'Questioning the Remuneration Committee Process' (<http://homepages.ed.ac.uk/mainbg/>).

[Google Scholar](#)

Marsden, D.W. and S. French (1998), 'What a Performance: Performance-Related Pay in the Public Services', Centre for Economic Performance Special Report, London School of Economics (Available under Publications, Special Papers online from <http://cep.lse.ac.uk>).

[Google Scholar](#)

---

Marsden, D.W. S. French and K. Kubo (2000), 'Why Does Performance Pay Demotivate? Financial Incentives Versus Performance Appraisal', Centre for Economic Performance, LSE (Available under Publications, CEP Discussion Papers Only, online from <http://cep.lse.ac.uk>).

[Google Scholar](#)

---

Marsden, D.W. S. French and K. Kubo (2001), 'Does Performance Pay De-Motivate and Does It Matter? Centre for Economic Performance, LSE (Available under Publications, CEP Discussion Papers Only, online from <http://cep.lse.ac.uk>).

[Google Scholar](#)

---

Murphy, K. (1985), 'Corporate Performance and Managerial Remuneration'. An Empirical Analysis', *Journal of Accounting and Economics*, Vol. 7, pp. 11–42.

[CAS](#) | [PubMed](#) | [Web of Science®](#) | [Google Scholar](#)

---

National Health Service and Community Care Act (1990), Office of Public Sector Information.

[Google Scholar](#)

---

National Health Service Trusts (Membership and Procedure) Regulations (1990), Statutory Instrument No. 2024.

[Google Scholar](#)

---

Newberry, S. (2001), 'Public Sector Accounting; A Common Reporting Framework?', *Australian Accounting Review*, Vol. 11, No. 1, pp. 2–7.

[Google Scholar](#)

---

Newberry, S. (2002), 'The Conceptual Framework Sham', *Australian Accounting Review*, Vol. 12, No. 3, pp. 47–49.

[Google Scholar](#)

---

Ogden, S. and R. Watson (2004), 'Remuneration Committees and CEO Pay in the UK Privatised Water Industry', *Socio-Economic Review*, Vol. 2, No. 1, pp. 33–63.

[Google Scholar](#)

Safford, J. and D. MacGregor (1998), 'Employment in the Public and Private Sectors', *Economics Trends*, No. 532, pp. 22-33.

[Google Scholar](#)

Spira, L.F. and R. Bender (2004), 'Compare and Contrast: Perspectives on Board Committees', *Corporate Governance: An International Journal*, Vol. 12, No. 4, pp. 489-99.

[CAS](#) | [Web of Science®](#) | [Google Scholar](#)

Sunder, S. (1997), *Theory of Accounting and Control* (Southwestern College Publishing, Cincinnati).

[Google Scholar](#)

Sunder, S. (1999), 'A Theory of Accounting and Controls for Organisations Producing Public- Versus Private-Goods', Inaugural Presidential Research Lecture, Annual Meeting of the American Accounting Association.

[Google Scholar](#)

Tricker, R.I. (1984), *Corporate Governance: Practices, Procedures, and Powers in British Companies and Their Boards of Directors* (Gower Press, London).

[Google Scholar](#)

Warner, J.B., J.R. Watts and K. Wruck (1988), 'Stock Prices and Top Management Changes,' *Journal of Financial Economics*, Vol. 20, pp. 461-92.

[Web of Science®](#) | [Google Scholar](#)

Weisbach, M. (1988), 'Outside Directors and CEO Turnover,' *Journal of Financial Economics*, Vol. 20, pp. 432-60.

[Web of Science®](#) | [Google Scholar](#)

Winchester, D. and S. Bach (1999), 'Britain: the Transformation of Public Employment Relations', Ch. 2 in S. Bach, L. Bordogna, G. Della Rocca and D. Winchester (eds.), *Public Service Employment Relations in Europe: Transformation, Modernization or Inertia?* (Routledge: London).

[Google Scholar](#)

## **ABOUT WILEY ONLINE LIBRARY**

[Privacy Policy](#)

[Terms of Use](#)

[About Cookies](#)

[Manage Cookies](#)

[Accessibility](#)

[Wiley Research DE&I Statement and Publishing Policies](#)

[Developing World Access](#)

## **HELP & SUPPORT**

[Contact Us](#)

[Training and Support](#)

[DMCA & Reporting Piracy](#)

## **OPPORTUNITIES**

[Subscription Agents](#)

[Advertisers & Corporate Partners](#)

## **CONNECT WITH WILEY**

[The Wiley Network](#)

[Wiley Press Room](#)

Copyright © 1999-2024 John Wiley & Sons, Inc or related companies. All rights reserved, including rights for text and data mining and training of artificial intelligence technologies or similar technologies.

**WILEY**