Advertisement

WILEY

Working in R&D?
Find useful resources
the Wiley Network.

Journal of Business Finance & Accounting / Volume 36, Issue 5-6 / p. 725-753

Changes to Income Trust Taxation in Canada: Investor Reaction and Dividend Clientele Theory

Fayez A. Elayan, Jingyu Li, Maureen E. Donnelly, Allister W. Young

First published: 17 July 2009
https://doi.org/10.1111/j.1468-5957.2009.02156.x
Citations: 10

Abstract

Abstract: This paper explores the relationship between tax-induced dividend clientele theory and the recent changes to the taxation of income trusts in Canada. On October 31, 2006, the Canadian government announced the Tax Fairness Plan (*TFP*) calling for the elimination of the considerable tax advantage enjoyed by income trusts. Generally, distributions from income trusts are now taxed at rates comparable to those imposed on corporate dividends. We examine market reaction to the *TFP* to address three issues: first, whether the valuation effect of a dividend tax increase is consistent with the traditional or the new view of dividend taxation; secondly, whether the market reaction to tax increases has a differential impact on firm value that is related to the tax preferences of taxable, tax-exempt, and foreign investor tax clienteles; and thirdly, whether firms change their dividend policies in response to the preference of institutional investors (tax-based dividend policy effect) or whether institutional investors are sorting themselves across firms based on their dividend policies (investor sorting effect). Our results provide strong evidence as follows. First, the valuation effect in reaction to the *TFP* announcement is consistent with the traditional view of dividend taxation – i.e. that taxes on dividends reduce the net return to investors, increase the firm's cost of capital and lower the firm's ability to access capital markets, thereby discouraging investment and savings. Secondly, we saw that trusts with a larger percentage of their units held by tax-exempt, low-tax, and foreign investors had a higher decline in value when compared with trusts held mostly by ordinary taxable investors. These results support dividend tax clientele theory. Finally, we observed changes in institutional investor clienteles consistent with the investor sorting effect.

REFERENCES

Aggarwal, L. and J. Mintz (2004), 'Income Trusts and Shareholders Taxation: Getting it Right,' *Canadian Tax Journal*, Vol. **52**, No. 3, pp. 792–818.

Google Scholar

Allen, F. and R. Michaely (2002), ‘ Payout Policy,’ in G. Constantinides, M. Harris and R. Stultz (eds.), *Handbook of Economics and Finance* (Amsterdam : North Holland).

Google Scholar

Allen, F., A.E. Bernardo and I. Welch (2000), ‘A Theory of Dividends based on Tax Clienteles,’ *Journal of Finance*, Vol. **55**, No. 6, pp. 2499–536.

Web of Science® Google Scholar

Amihud Y. and K. Li (2006), ‘The Declining Information Content of Dividend Announcements and Effect of Institutional Holdings,’ *Journal of Financial and Quantitative Analysis*, Vol. **41**, No. 3, pp. 637–60.

Web of Science® Google Scholar

Armitage, S., L. Hodgkinson and G. Partington (2006), ‘The Market Value of UK Dividends From Shares with Differing Entitlements,’ *Journal of Business Finance & Accounting*, Vol. **33**, Nos. 1&2, pp. 220–44.

Web of Science® Google Scholar

Auerbach, A. (1979), ‘Wealth Maximization and the Cost of Capital,’ *Quarterly Journal of Economics*, Vol. **93**, pp. 433–46.

Web of Science® Google Scholar

Auerbach, A. (2003), ‘ Taxation and Corporate Financial Policy,’ in A. Auerbach and M. Feldstine (eds.), *Handbook of Public Economics*, **Volume 3** (Amsterdam : North Holland).

Google Scholar

Auerbach, A. and K.A. Hassett (2005), ‘ The 2003 Dividend Tax Cuts and the Value of the Firm: An Event Study,’ NBER Working Paper No. W11449 (Available at SSRN: http://ssrn.con/abstract=755686).

Google Scholar

Auerbach, A. and K.A. Hassett (2006), ‘ Dividend Taxes and Firm Valuation: New Evidence,’ NBER Working Paper No. W11959 (Available at SSRN: http://ssrn.con/abstract=877464).

Google Scholar

Benartzi, S., R. Michaely and R. Thaler (1997), ‘Do Changes in Dividends Signal the Future of the Past?,’ *Journal of Finance*, Vol. **52**, pp. 1007–34.

Web of Science® Google Scholar

Benhardt, D., A. Douglas and F. Robertson (2005), 'Testing Dividend Signaling Models,' *Journal of Empirical Finance*, Vol. **12**, pp. 77–98

Google Scholar

Bernheim, B.D. and A. Wantz (1995), 'A Tax-based Test of the Dividend Signaling Hypothesis,' *American Economic Review*, Vol. **85**, pp. 532–51.

Web of Science® Google Scholar

Bhattacharya, S. (1979), 'Imperfect Information, Dividend Policy and the 'Bird in the Hand' Fallacy,' *Bell Journal of Economics*, Vol. **10**, pp. 259–70.

Web of Science® Google Scholar

Binay, M. (2000), ' Do Dividend Clientele Exist? Institutional Investor Reaction to Dividend Events,' Working Paper (University of Texas, Austin).

Google Scholar

Bradford, D. (1981), 'The Incidence and Allocation Effect of a Tax on Corporate Distributions,' *Journal of Public Economics*, Vol. **15**, No. 1, pp. 1–22.

Web of Science® Google Scholar

Brav A., J Graham, C.R. Harvey and R. Michaely (2005), 'Payout Policy in the 21st Century,' *Journal of Financial Economics*, Vol. **77**, No. 3, pp. 483–527.

Web of Science® Google Scholar

Chen, X. and J. Sun (2006), ' Tax-Exempt Institutions, Non-Tax-Exempt Institutions, and Dividend Clientele,' Working Paper (http://www.ssrn.com).

Google Scholar

Chetty, R. and E. Saez (2004), ' Dividend Taxes and Corporate Behavior: Evidence from the 2003 Dividend Tax Cut,' CEPR Working Paper No. 4722 (Available at SSRN: http://ssrn.com/abstract=646704).

Google Scholar

Corrado, C.J. (1989), 'A Nonparametric Test for Abnormal Security-Price Performance in Event Studies,' *Journal of Financial Economics*, pp. 285–396.

Google Scholar

DeAngelo, H., L. DeAngelo and D. Skinner (1996), 'Reversal of Fortune Dividend Signaling and the Disappearance of Sustained Earning Growth,' *Journal of Financial Economics*, Vol. **40**, pp. 342–71.

Web of Science® | Google Scholar

DeAngelo, H. and R.M. Stulz (2004), ‘ Dividend Policy, Agency Costs, and Earned Equity,’ Working Paper (http://www.ssrn.com).

Google Scholar

Desai, M.A. and J. Li (2007), ‘Institutional Tax Clienteles and Payout Policy,’ *National Bureau of Economic Research*, Working Paper (http://www.nber.org/papers/w13283).

Google Scholar

Desai, M.A. and L. Jin (2007), ‘ Institutional Tax Clienteles and Payout Policy,’ National Bureau of Economic Research Working Paper .

Google Scholar

Dhanani, A. (2005), ‘Corporate Dividend Policy: The Views of British Financial Managers,’ *Journal of Business Finance & Accounting*, Vol. **32**, Nos. 7&8, pp. 1625–72.

Web of Science® | Google Scholar

Dietz, M.D. (2005), ‘ Capital Income Taxation, New Firms Creation, and the Size Distribution of Firms,’ Working Paper (University of St.Gallen, and University of California , San Diego).

Google Scholar

Easterbrook, F.H. (1984), ‘Two Agency Cost Explanations of Dividends,’ *American Economic Review*, Vol. **74**, pp. 650–59.

Web of Science® | Google Scholar

Edgar, T. (2004), ‘The Trouble with Income Trusts,’ *Canadian Tax Journal*, Vol. **52**, No. 3, pp. 819–52.

Google Scholar

Giaccotto, C. and J.M. Sfirdis (1996), ‘Hypothesis Testing in Event Studies: The Case of Variance Changes,’ *Journal of Financial Economics*, Vol. **33**, No. 1, pp. 3–56.

Google Scholar

Gillet, R., M. Lapointe and P. Raimbourg (2008), ‘Dividend Policy and Reputation,’ *Journal of Business Finance & Accounting*, Vol. **35**, Nos. 3&4, pp. 516–40.

Web of Science® | Google Scholar

Grinstein, Y. and R. Michaely (2005), 'Institutional Holdings and Payout Policy,' *Journal of Finance*, Vol. **60**, No. 3, pp. 1389–426.

Web of Science® | Google Scholar

Hayward, P.D. (2002), 'Income Trusts: A Tax Efficient Product or the Product of Tax Inefficiency?,' *Canadian Tax Journal*, Vol. **50**, No. 5, pp. 529–69.

Google Scholar

House of Commons, Canada (2007), ' Taxing Income Trusts: Reconcilable or Irreconcilable Differences?,' *Report of the Standing Committee on Finance, February 2007*, 39th Parliament, 1st Session.

Google Scholar

Jensen, M.C. (1986), 'Agency Costs of Free Cash Flow, Corporate Finance, and Takeovers,' *American Economic Review*, Vol. **76**, pp. 323–29.

Web of Science® | Google Scholar

Jog, V. and L. Wang (2004), 'The Growth of Income Trusts in Canada and the Economic Consequences,' *Canadian Tax Journal*, Vol. **52**, No. 3.

Google Scholar

John, K. and J. Williams (1985), 'Dividends, Dilution, and Taxes: A Signaling Equilibrium,' *Journal of Finance*, Vol. **40**, pp. 1053–70.

Web of Science® | Google Scholar

King, M. (1977), *Public Policy and the Corporation* (London : Chapman and Hall).

Google Scholar

Klassen, K. and D. Mescall (2006), ' Valuation of Income Trusts: An Exploration of Clienteles and Implicit Taxes,' Working Paper (School of Accountancy, University of Waterloo).

Google Scholar

Korinek, A. and J.E. Steglitz (2008), ' Dividend Taxation and Intertemporal Tax Arbitrage,' Working Paper (University of Maryland and Columbia University , http://www.ssrn.com).

Google Scholar

Li, K. and X. Zhao (2006), ' Analyst Coverage and Dividend Policy,' Working Paper (University of British Columbia).

Google Scholar

McKenzie K.J. (2006), 'Income Taxes, Integration, and Income Trusts,' *Canadian Tax Journal*, Vol. **54**, No. 3, pp. 633–56.

Google Scholar

McKenzie K.J. and A. Thompson (1996), ' The Economic Effects of Dividend Taxation,' *Technical Committee on Business Taxation*, Working Paper 96–7 (Ottawa , Ontario : Department of Finance, Canada).

Google Scholar

Miller, M.H. (1977), 'Debt and Taxes,' *Journal of Finance*, pp. 261–75.

Web of Science® Google Scholar

Miller, M.H. and F. Modigliani (1961), 'Dividend Policy, Growth and the Valuation of Shares,' *Journal of Business*, Vol. **34**, pp. 411–33.

Web of Science® Google Scholar

Miller, M.H. and K. Rock (1985), 'Dividend Policy Under Asymmetric Information,' *Journal of Finance*, Vol. **40**, pp. 1031–51.

Web of Science® Google Scholar

Mintz, J. (2003), ' Withholding Taxes on Income Paid to Non-residents: Removing a Canadian-US Border Irritant,' *C.D. Howe Institute Backgrounder* (Toronto , Canada).

Google Scholar

Nissim, D. and A. Ziv (2001), 'Dividend Changes and Future Profitability,' *Journal of Finance*, Vol. **56**, pp. 2111–33.

Web of Science® Google Scholar

Poterba, J.M. and L.H. Summers (1985), ' The Economic Effect of Dividend Taxation,' in E. Altman and M. Subrahmanyam (eds.), *Recent Advances in Corporate Finance* (Homewood , IL : Richard Irwin), pp. 227–84.

Google Scholar

Zodrow, G. (1991), 'On the 'Traditional' and the 'New' Views of Dividend Taxation,' *National Tax Journal*, Vol. **44**, pp. 497–509.

Web of Science® Google Scholar

Citing Literature

Download PDF

ABOUT WILEY ONLINE LIBRARY

Privacy Policy
Terms of Use
About Cookies
Manage Cookies
Accessibility
Wiley Research DE&I Statement and Publishing Policies
Developing World Access

HELP & SUPPORT

Contact Us
Training and Support
DMCA & Reporting Piracy

OPPORTUNITIES

Subscription Agents
Advertisers & Corporate Partners

CONNECT WITH WILEY

The Wiley Network
Wiley Press Room

Copyright © 1999-2025 John Wiley & Sons, Inc or related companies. All rights reserved, including rights for text and data mining and training of artificial intelligence technologies or similar technologies.

WILEY