

Comparing the Post-Earnings Announcement Drift for Surprises Calculated from Analyst and Time Series Forecasts

JOSHUA LIVNAT, RICHARD R. MENDENHALL

First published: 23 January 2006

<https://doi.org/10.1111/j.1475-679X.2006.00196.x>

Citations: 512

The authors gratefully acknowledge the preliminary and unrestated Compustat quarterly data provided by Charter Oak Investment Systems Inc. The authors are also grateful for the contribution of Thomson Financial for providing forecast data available through the Institutional Brokers Estimate System, as part of a broad academic program to encourage earnings expectations research. The authors also thank Shai Levi, an anonymous reviewer, and the editor for their comments on earlier versions of this paper.

ABSTRACT

Post-earnings announcement drift is the tendency for a stock's cumulative abnormal returns to drift in the direction of an earnings surprise for several weeks following an earnings announcement. We show that the drift is significantly larger when defining the earnings surprise using analysts' forecasts and actual earnings from I/B/E/S than when using a time series model based on Compustat earnings data. Neither Compustat's policy of restating earnings nor the inclusion of "special items" in reported earnings contribute significantly to the disparity in drift magnitudes. Rather, our results suggest that this disparity is attributable to differences between analyst forecasts and those of time-series models—or at least to factors correlated with these differences. Further, we document that analyst forecasts lead to return patterns around future earnings announcements that differ from those observed when using time-series models, suggesting that the two types of surprises may capture somewhat different forms of mispricing.

REFERENCES

Abarbanell, J., AND V. Bernard. Tests of Analysts' Overreaction/Underreaction to Earnings Information as an Explanation for Anomalous Stock Price Behavior. *Journal of Finance* 47 (1992): 1181–207.

[Web of Science®](#) | [Google Scholar](#)

Abarbanell, J., AND R. Lehavy. Differences in Commercial Database Reported Earnings: Implications for Empirical Research." Working paper, University of North Carolina, 2002.

[Google Scholar](#)

Abarbanell, J., AND R. Lehavy. Biased Forecasts or Biased Earnings? The Role of Reported Earnings in Explaining Apparent Bias and Over/Underreaction in Analysts' Earnings Forecasts. *Journal of Accounting and Economics* 36 (2003): 105–46.

[Web of Science®](#) | [Google Scholar](#)

Affleck-Graves, J., AND R. R. Mendenhall. The Relation Between the Value Line Enigma and Post-Earnings-Announcement Drift. *Journal of Financial Economics* 31 (1992): 75–96.

[Web of Science®](#) | [Google Scholar](#)

Ball, R., AND E. Bartov. How Naïve Is the Stock Market's Use of Earnings Information? *Journal of Accounting and Economics* 21 (1996): 319–37.

[Web of Science®](#) | [Google Scholar](#)

Ball, R., AND P. Brown. An Empirical Evaluation Of Accounting Income Numbers. *Journal of Accounting Research* 6 (1968): 159–77.

[Web of Science®](#) | [Google Scholar](#)

Ball, R.; S. P. Kothari; AND R. L. Watts. Economic Determinants of the Relation Between Earnings Changes and Stock Returns. *The Accounting Review* 68 (1993): 622–38.

[Web of Science®](#) | [Google Scholar](#)

Bartov, E.; S. Radhakrishnan; AND I. Krinsky. Investor Sophistication and Patterns in Stock Returns after Earnings Announcements. *The Accounting Review* 75 (2000): 43–63.

[Web of Science®](#) | [Google Scholar](#)

Bernard, V. L., AND J. K. Thomas. Post-Earnings-Announcement Drift: Delayed Price Response or Risk Premium? *Journal of Accounting Research* 27 (Supplement 1989): 1–36.

[CAS](#) | [Google Scholar](#)

Bernard, V. L., AND J. K. Thomas. Evidence that Stock Prices Do Not Fully Reflect the Implications of Current Earnings for Future Earnings. *Journal of Accounting and Economics* 13 (1990): 305–40.

[Web of Science®](#) | [Google Scholar](#)

Bhushan, R. An Informational Efficiency Perspective on the Post-Earnings Announcement Drift. *Journal of Accounting and Economics* 18 (1994): 45–65.

[Web of Science®](#) | [Google Scholar](#)

Bradshaw, M. T., AND R. G. Sloan. GAAP Versus The Street: An Empirical Assessment Of Two Alternative Definitions Of Earnings. *Journal of Accounting Research* 40 (2002): 41–66.

[Web of Science®](#) | [Google Scholar](#)

Brennan, M. J. A Perspective on Accounting and Stock Prices. *The Accounting Review* 66 (1991): 67–79.

[Web of Science®](#) | [Google Scholar](#)

Burgstahler, D; J. Jiambalvo; AND T. Shevlin. Do Prices Fully Reflect the Implications of Special Items for Future Earnings? *Journal of Accounting Research* 40 (2002): 585–612.

[Web of Science®](#) | [Google Scholar](#)

Chan, L. K. C.; N. Jegadeesh; AND J. Lakonishok. Momentum Strategies. *Journal of Finance* 51 (1996): 1681–713.

[PubMed](#) | [Web of Science®](#) | [Google Scholar](#)

Collins, D. W., AND P. Hribar. Earnings-Based and Accrual-Based Market Anomalies: One Effect of Two? *Journal of Accounting and Economics* 29 (2000): 101–23.

[Web of Science®](#) | [Google Scholar](#)

Dechow, P. M. Accounting Earnings and Cash Flows as Measures of Firm Performance: The role of Accounting Accruals. *Journal of Accounting and Economics* 18 (1994): 3–42.

[Web of Science®](#) | [Google Scholar](#)

Doyle, J.; R. Lundholm; AND M. Soliman. The Extreme Future Stock Returns Following Extreme Earnings Surprises."Working paper, University of Utah , 2003.

[Google Scholar](#)

Fama, E. F. Market Efficiency, Long-Term Returns, And Behavioral Finance. *Journal of Financial Economics* 49 (1998): 283–306.

[Web of Science®](#) | [Google Scholar](#)

Foster, G.; C. Olsen; AND T. Shevlin. Earnings Releases, Anomalies and the Behavior of Security Returns. *The Accounting Review* 59 (1984): 574–603.

[Web of Science®](#) | [Google Scholar](#)

Francis, J; R. LaFond; P. Olsson; AND K. Schipper. Accounting Anomalies and Information Uncertainty."Working paper, Duke University , 2004.

[Google Scholar](#)

Jacob, J; T. Lys; AND J. Sabino. Autocorrelation Structure of Forecast Errors from Time-Series Models: Implications for Post-Earnings Announcement Drift Studies. *Journal of Accounting and Economics* 28 (2000): 329–58.

[Web of Science®](#) | [Google Scholar](#)

Jones, C. P., AND R. H. Litzenberger. Quarterly Earnings Reports and Intermediate Stock Price Trends. *Journal of Finance* 25 (1970): 143–8.

[CAS](#) | [PubMed](#) | [Web of Science®](#) | [Google Scholar](#) |

Joy, O. M.; R. H. Litzenberger; AND R. W. McEnally. The Adjustment of Stock Prices to Announcements of Unanticipated Changes in Quarterly Earnings. *Journal of Accounting Research* 15 (1977): 207–25.

[Web of Science®](#) | [Google Scholar](#) |

Latane, H. A., AND C. P. Jones. Standardized Unexpected Earnings—1971-1977. *Journal of Finance* 34 (1979): 717–24.

[Web of Science®](#) | [Google Scholar](#) |

Latane, H. A.; O. M. Joy; AND C. P. Jones. Quarterly Data, Sort-Rank Routines, and Security Evaluation. *The Journal of Business* 43 (1970): 427–38.

[Web of Science®](#) | [Google Scholar](#) |

Liang, L. Post-Earnings Announcement Drift and Market Participants' Information Processing Biases. *Review of Accounting Studies* 8 (2003): 321–45.

[Web of Science®](#) | [Google Scholar](#) |

Livnat, J. Post-Earnings-Announcement Drift: The Role of Revenue Surprises and Earnings Persistence."Working paper, New York University , 2003a.

[Google Scholar](#) |

Livnat, J. Differential Persistence of Extremely Negative and Positive Earnings Surprises: Implications for the Post-Earnings-Announcement Drift."Working paper, New York University , 2003b.

[Google Scholar](#) |

Mendenhall, R. R. Arbitrage Risk and Post-Earnings-Announcement Drift. *Journal of Business* 77 (2004): 875–94.

[Web of Science®](#) | [Google Scholar](#) |

Narayanamoorthy, G. Conservatism and Cross-Sectional Variation in the Post-Earnings-Announcement Drift."Working paper, Yale School of Management , 2003.

[Google Scholar](#) |

Payne, J. L., AND W. B. Thomas. The Implications of Using Stock-Split Adjusted I/B/E/S Data in Empirical Research. *The Accounting Review* 78 (2003): 1049–67.

[Web of Science®](#) | [Google Scholar](#)

Penman, S. H. Abnormal Returns to Strategies Based on the Timing of Earnings Reports. *Journal of Accounting and Economics* 6 (1984): 165–83.

[Web of Science®](#) | [Google Scholar](#)

Rendleman, R. J.; C. P. Jones; AND H. A. Latane. Empirical Anomalies Based on Unexpected Earnings and the Importance of Risk Adjustments. *Journal of Financial Economics* 10 (1982): 269–87.

[Web of Science®](#) | [Google Scholar](#)

Vuong, Q. H. Likelihood Ratio Tests for Model Selection and Non-Nested Hypotheses. *Econometrica* 57 (1989): 307–33.

[Web of Science®](#) | [Google Scholar](#)

Citing Literature



[Download PDF](#)

ABOUT WILEY ONLINE LIBRARY

[Privacy Policy](#)

[Terms of Use](#)

[About Cookies](#)

[Manage Cookies](#)

[Accessibility](#)

[Wiley Research DE&I Statement and Publishing Policies](#)

[Developing World Access](#)

HELP & SUPPORT

[Contact Us](#)

[Training and Support](#)

[DMCA & Reporting Piracy](#)

OPPORTUNITIES

[Subscription Agents](#)

CONNECT WITH WILEY

The Wiley Network

Wiley Press Room

Copyright © 1999-2025 John Wiley & Sons, Inc or related companies. All rights reserved, including rights for text and data mining and training of artificial intelligence technologies or similar technologies.

WILEY