

Bad Credit, No Problem? Credit and Labor Market Consequences of Bad Credit Reports

WILL DOBBIE, PAUL GOLDSMITH-PINKHAM , NEALE MAHONEY, JAE SONG

First published: 01 June 2020

<https://doi.org/10.1111/jofi.12954>

Citations: 60

ABSTRACT

We study the financial and labor market impacts of bad credit reports. Using difference-in-differences variation from the staggered removal of bankruptcy flags, we show that bankruptcy flag removal leads to economically large increases in credit limits and borrowing. Using administrative tax records linked to personal bankruptcy records, we estimate economically small effects of flag removal on employment and earnings outcomes. We rationalize these contrasting results by showing that, conditional on basic observables, “hidden” bankruptcy flags are strongly correlated with adverse credit market outcomes but have no predictive power for measures of job performance.

Supporting Information

Filename	Description
jofi12954-sup-0001-InternetAppendix.pdf 3.1 MB	Appendix S1: Internet Appendix.
jofi12954-sup-0002-ReplicationCode.zip 692.2 MB	Replication code.

Please note: The publisher is not responsible for the content or functionality of any supporting information supplied by the authors. Any queries (other than missing content) should be directed to the corresponding author for the article.

REFERENCES

Agarwal, Sumit, Souphala Chomsisengphet, Neale Mahoney, and Johannes Stroebel, 2017, Do banks pass through credit expansions to consumers who want to borrow? *The Quarterly Journal of Economics* 133, 129–190.

 | [Web of Science®](#) | [Google Scholar](#) |

Armantier, Olivier, Giorgio Topa, Wilbert van der Klaauw, and Basit Zafar, 2017, An overview of the survey of consumer expectations, Discussion paper, FRBNY Economic Policy Review.

[Google Scholar](#)

B Avery, Robert, Paul S Calem, Glenn B Canner, and Raphael W Bostic, 2003, An overview of consumer data and credit reporting, *Federal Reserve Bulletin* 89, 47.

[Google Scholar](#)

Bartik, Alexander, and Scott Nelson, 2016, Credit reports as resumes: The incidence of pre-employment credit screening, MIT Department of Economics Graduate Student Research Paper 16-01.

[Google Scholar](#)

Bos, Marieke, Emily Breza, and Andres Liberman, 2018, The labor market effects of credit market information, *The Review of Financial Studies* 31, 2005–2037.

[Web of Science®](#) | [Google Scholar](#)

Braucher, Jean, Dov Cohen, and Robert M. Lawless, 2012, Race, attorney influence, and bankruptcy chapter choice, *Journal of Empirical Legal Studies* 9, 393–429.

[Web of Science®](#) | [Google Scholar](#)

CFPB, 2011, The impact of differences between consumer- and creditor-purchased credit scores, Discussion paper, Consumer Financial Protection Bureau.

[Google Scholar](#)

CFPB, 2012, Key dimensions and processes in the U.S. credit reporting system: A review of how the nation's largest credit bureaus manage consumer data, Discussion paper, Consumer Financial Protection Bureau.

[Google Scholar](#)

Clifford, Robert, and Daniel Shoag, 2016, “ No more credit score” employer credit check bans and signal substitution, Working Paper.

[Google Scholar](#)

Cortés, Kristle Romero, Andrew S Glover, and Murat Tasci, 2018, The unintended consequences of employer credit check bans on labor and credit markets, Working paper, Federal Reserve Bank Of Cleveland.

[Google Scholar](#)

Dobbie, Will, Paul Goldsmith-Pinkham, and Crystal S. Yang, 2017, Consumer bankruptcy and financial health, *The Review of Economics and Statistics* 99, 853–869.

[Web of Science®](#) | [Google Scholar](#)

Dobbie, Will, and Jae Song, 2015, Debt relief and debtor outcomes: Measuring the effects of consumer bankruptcy protection, *The American Economic Review* **105**, 1272–1311.

[Web of Science®](#) | [Google Scholar](#)

Finkelstein, Amy, Sarah Taubman, Bill Wright, Mira Bernstein, Jonathan Gruber, Joseph P Newhouse, Heidi Allen, Katherine Baicker, and Oregon Health Study Group, 2012, The Oregon health insurance experiment: Evidence from the first year, *The Quarterly Journal of Economics* **127**, 1057–1106.

[PubMed](#) | [Web of Science®](#) | [Google Scholar](#)

FRB, 2007, Report to the congress on credit scoring and its effects on the availability and affordability of credit, Discussion paper, Board of Governors of the Federal Reserve System (US).

[Google Scholar](#)

Friedberg, Leora, Richard M Hynes, and Nathaniel Pattison, 2017, Who benefits from bans on employer credit checks? Working paper, Southern Methodist University.

[Google Scholar](#)

Gross, David B., and Nicholas S. Souleles, 2002, Do liquidity constraints and interest rates matter for consumer behavior? Evidence from credit card data, *Quarterly Journal of Economics* **117**, 149–185.

[Web of Science®](#) | [Google Scholar](#)

Gross, Tal, Matthew J Notowidigdo, and Jialan Wang, 2014, Liquidity constraints and consumer bankruptcy: Evidence from tax rebates, *Review of Economics and Statistics* **96**, 431–443.

[Web of Science®](#) | [Google Scholar](#)

Gross, Tal, Matthew J. Notowidigdo, and Jialan Wang, 2018, The marginal propensity to consumer over the business cycle, NBER Working paper.

[Google Scholar](#)

Herkenhoff, Kyle, Gordon Phillips, and Ethan Cohen-Cole, 2016, The impact of consumer credit access on employment, earnings and entrepreneurship, NBER Working paper.

[Google Scholar](#)

Holm, Sture, 1979, A simple sequentially rejective multiple test procedure, *Scandinavian Journal of Statistics* **6**, 65–70.

[Web of Science®](#) | [Google Scholar](#)

Kovbasyuk, Sergey, and Giancarlo Spagnolo, 2018, Memory and markets, EIEF Working Paper Series 1606.

[Google Scholar](#)

Lee, Donghoon, and Wilbert Van der Klaauw, 2010, An introduction to the frbny consumer credit panel, FRBNY Staff Report.

[Google Scholar](#)

Mahoney, Neale, 2015, Bankruptcy as implicit health insurance, *The American Economic Review* 105, 710–746.

[PubMed](#) | [Web of Science®](#) | [Google Scholar](#)

Musto, David K., 2004, What happens when information leaves a market? Evidence from post-bankruptcy consumers, *The Journal of Business* 77, 725–748.

[Web of Science®](#) | [Google Scholar](#)

National Public Radio, 2012, Bad credit reports affect job applicants, *National Public Radio*. <http://www.npr.org/2009/08/11/111769999/low-credit-scores-affect-job-applicants>.

[Google Scholar](#)

New York Times, 2013, Employers pull applicants credit reports, *The New York Times*. <http://www.nytimes.com/2013/05/12/business/employers-pull-applicants-credit-reports.html>.

[Google Scholar](#)

Shorr, Scott, 1994, Personal information contracts: How to protect privacy without violating the first amendment, *Cornell Law Review* 80, 1756.

[Web of Science®](#) | [Google Scholar](#)

SHRM, 2010, Background checking: The implications of credit background checks on the decision to hire or not to hire, Discussion paper, Society for Human Resource Management.

[Google Scholar](#)

Staten, Michael, 2014, Risk-based pricing in consumer lending, Discussion paper, Center for Capital Markets.

[Google Scholar](#)

Steinberg, Joseph, 2014, Your privacy is now at risk from search engines—even if the law says otherwise, *Forbes*. <https://www.forbes.com/sites/josephsteinberg/2014/06/02/your-privacy-is-now-at-risk-from-search-engines-even-if-the-law-says-otherwise/#45cb55885709>.

White, Michelle, 2007, Bankruptcy reform and credit cards, *Journal of Economic Perspectives* 21, 175-199.

Citing Literature



[Download PDF](#)

ABOUT WILEY ONLINE LIBRARY

- [Privacy Policy](#)
- [Terms of Use](#)
- [About Cookies](#)
- [Manage Cookies](#)
- [Accessibility](#)
- [Wiley Research DE&I Statement and Publishing Policies](#)
- [Developing World Access](#)

HELP & SUPPORT

- [Contact Us](#)
- [Training and Support](#)
- [DMCA & Reporting Piracy](#)

OPPORTUNITIES

- [Subscription Agents](#)
- [Advertisers & Corporate Partners](#)

CONNECT WITH WILEY

- [The Wiley Network](#)
- [Wiley Press Room](#)