

NO ACCESS Research Article

The Politics And Economics Of Mental Health 'Parity' Laws

Authors: [Richard G. Frank](#), [Chris Koyanagi](#), and [Thomas G. McGuire](#) | [AUTHORS INFO & AFFILIATIONS](#)

July/August 1997 • <https://doi.org/10.1377/hlthaff.16.4.108>



Prologue:

"Politics is the art of the possible," Otto von Bismarck once said. In the political saga described here, the "possible" turned out to be an amendment (Domeneci-Wellstone), originally intended to mandate full parity between mental health and medical/surgical benefits, that mandates instead only partial parity ("the same annual and lifetime limits on plan spending"). In addition, the amendment became part of a totally nonhealth-related appropriations bill instead of its original target, the Kassebaum-Kennedy bill. An irony of this "historic victory," says lead author Richard Frank, is that the final amendment regulates "a market that isn't there anymore."

In this paper Frank and his colleagues Chris Koyanagi and Tom McGuire describe the economic forces that have shaped the traditionally limited coverage of mental health care, the tortuous journey of the new parity amendment, and the challenges of ensuring access to mental health care in today's managed care world. Frank is a professor in the Department of Health Care Policy at Harvard University and a research associate with the National Bureau of Economic Research. He and McGuire are writing a book on mental health/substance abuse finance reform as a result of their joint 1994-1996 Robert Wood Johnson Foundation Investigator Award in Health Policy. Koyanagi is director of legislative policy at the Bazelon Center for Mental Health Law, in Washington, D.C. Her particular areas of responsibility are mental health care financing and children's mental health services. McGuire is a professor of economics at Boston University. He is the recipient of two sequential five-year Research Scientist Awards from the National Institute of Mental Health.

ABSTRACT: The enactment of the Domeneci-Wellstone amendment in September 1996, which calls for the elimination of certain limits on coverage for mental health care under private insurance, is being hailed as a major step forward in the quest for "parity" in mental health coverage. Parity legislation is being introduced in a number of state legislatures and is finding new enthusiasm in Congress. In this paper we consider the efficiency rationale for these laws and examine their likely impact in the era of managed care. We conclude that although such successes represent important political events, they may offer only small gains in the efficiency and fairness of insurance markets.

Topics:

[Mental health](#)[Managed care](#)[Legislation](#)[Mental disorders](#)[Ethics](#)[Access to care](#)[Cost sharing](#)[Costs and spending](#)[Adverse selection](#)[Markets](#)

Get full access to this article

View all available purchase options and get full access to this article.



ALREADY A SUBSCRIBER? SIGN IN AS AN [INDIVIDUAL](#) OR VIA YOUR [INSTITUTION](#)

Notes

1.



Frank R.G., McGuire T.G., "Health Reform and Financing of Mental Health Services: Distributional Consequences," in *Mental Health, United States, 1994*, DHHS Pub. no. (SMA)94-3000, ed., Manderscheid R.W., Sonnenschein M.A. (Washington : U.S. Government Printing Office, 1994).

[Google Scholar](#)

3.

Newhouse J.P. and the Insurance Experiment Group, *Free for All? Lessons from the RAND Health Insurance Experiment* (Cambridge, Mass. : Harvard University Press, 1993).

[Google Scholar](#)

4.

Sturm R., "How Expensive Is Unlimited Mental Health Care Coverage under Managed Care?," Working Paper 107 (Santa Monica, Calif. : Research Center on Managed Care for Psychiatric Disorders, University of California, Los Angeles/RAND, January 1997).

[Google Scholar](#)

[SHOW ALL REFERENCES](#)

[View full text](#) | [Download PDF](#)

HealthAffairs

PUBLISHING



INFORMATION FOR

[Authors](#)
[Institutions](#)
[Reviewers](#)
[Subscribers](#)
[Advertisers](#)
[Media](#)
[Funders](#)

SERVICES & RESOURCES

[Submit Content](#)
[Request For Abstracts](#)
[Subscribe](#)
[Renew](#)
[Manage My Account](#)
[Newsletter Sign Up](#)
[FAQs](#)
[Contact Us](#)

ABOUT

[About Health Affairs Publishing](#)
[Jobs](#)
[Health Equity](#)
[Fellowships](#)
[Terms & Conditions](#)
[Privacy Policy](#)
[Accessibility](#)
[Permissions](#)



Health Affairs Publishing, LLC, is a subsidiary of [Project Hope](#), a nonprofit global health and humanitarian organization. Health Affairs Publishing is editorially independent from Project HOPE.

Health Affairs is an official journal of [AcademyHealth](#).

Copyright 1995 - 2026 by Health Affairs Publishing, LLC, eISSN 2694-233X.

[Terms and conditions](#)[Privacy](#)[Accessibility](#)[Project HOPE](#)