A Citation-Based Test for Discrimination at Economics and Finance Journals

Scott Smart & Joel Waldfogel

SHARE 𝕏 in f ✦ ☰ ✉ 🔗

Discrimination is notoriously difficult to document. Convincing tests for discrimination require good measures of the legitimate determinants of the outcome of interest, for example wages and productivity. While few contexts provide data adequate to the task of measuring discrimination, copious bibliographic data on the impact of academic research make possible tests of discrimination in the editorial process. This study develops a test for possible bias þ with respect to author gender, prestige of author's institution, article content (theory vs. empiricism), and whether the author has ties to the editor þ using a new approach based on an analysis of citations. We treat citations as a measure of article quality and ask whether papers by certain groups receive systematically different numbers of citations. The key to our approach is the observation that editors do not simply accept or reject papers. For accepted papers, editors determine articles' order within journal issue and length based on their quality assessments. We show that these 'editorial treatment' decisions are highly correlated with citations. Thus, we infer bias against a particular group of authors if their published articles have more citations, conditional editorial treatment, than other articles. Surprisingly, we document systematic editorial bias in favor of authors located outside of top institutions.

Acknowledgements and Disclosures ⌄

Citation and Citation Data ⌄

Related

TOPICS

Labor Economics
Labor Discrimination
Other
Law and Economics

More from the NBER

In addition to working papers, the NBER disseminates affiliates' latest findings through a range of free periodicals — the NBER Reporter, the NBER Digest, the Bulletin on Health, and the Bulletin on Entrepreneurship — as well as online conference reports, video lectures, and interviews.

2025, 17th Annual Feldstein Lecture, N. Gregory Mankiw, "The Fiscal Future"

FELDSTEIN LECTURE

PRESENTER: N. GREGORY MANKIW

N. Gregory Mankiw, Robert M. Beren Professor of Economics at Harvard University, presented the 2025 Martin Feldstein...

2025, Methods Lecture, Raj Chetty and Kosuke Imai, "Uncovering Causal Mechanisms: Mediation Analysis and Surrogate Indices"

METHODS LECTURES

PRESENTERS: [RAJ CHETTY](#) & [KOSUKE IMAI](#)

SlidesBackground materials on mediationImai, Kosuke, Dustin Tingley, and Teppei Yamamoto. (2013). "Experimental Designs...

2025, International Trade and Macroeconomics, "Panel on The Future of the Global Economy"

PANEL DISCUSSION

PRESENTERS: [OLEG ITSKHOKI](#), [PAUL R. KRUGMAN](#) & [LINDA TESAR](#)

Supported by the Alfred P. Sloan Foundation grant #G-2023-19633, the Lynde and Harry Bradley Foundation grant #20251294...

Accessibility Policy
Diversity Policy
Privacy Policy

FOLLOW