

< [Working Papers](#)

# A Citation-Based Test for Discrimination at Economics and Finance Journals

Scott Smart & Joel Waldfogel

SHARE



WORKING PAPER 5460

DOI 10.3386/w5460

ISSUE DATE February 1996

Discrimination is notoriously difficult to document. Convincing tests for discrimination require good measures of the legitimate determinants of the outcome of interest, for example wages and productivity. While few contexts provide data adequate to the task of measuring discrimination, copious bibliographic data on the impact of academic research make possible tests of discrimination in the editorial process. This study develops a test for possible bias with respect to author gender, prestige of author's institution, article content (theory vs. empiricism), and whether the author has ties to the editor by using a new approach based on an analysis of citations. We treat citations as a measure of article quality and ask whether papers by certain groups receive systematically different numbers of citations. The key to our approach is the observation that editors do not simply accept or reject papers. For accepted papers, editors determine articles' order within journal issue and length based on their quality assessments. We show that these 'editorial treatment' decisions are highly correlated with citations. Thus, we infer bias against a particular group of authors if their published articles have more citations, conditional editorial treatment, than other articles. Surprisingly, we document systematic editorial bias in favor of authors located outside of top institutions.

Download a PDF

[Information on access](#)

## Acknowledgements and Disclosures



## Citation and Citation Data



## Related

### TOPICS

Labor Economics  
Labor Discrimination  
Other  
Law and Economics

## More from the NBER

In addition to [working papers](#), the NBER disseminates affiliates' latest findings through a range of free periodicals — the [NBER Reporter](#), the [NBER Digest](#), the [Bulletin on Health](#), and the [Bulletin on Entrepreneurship](#) — as well as online [conference reports](#), [video lectures](#), and [interviews](#).



Martin Feldstein Lecture, Summer Institute 2025  
**The Fiscal Future**

N. Gregory Mankiw, Harvard University and NBER  
July 10, 2025

**2025, 17th Annual Feldstein Lecture, N. Gregory Mankiw, "The Fiscal Future"**

FELDSTEIN LECTURE

PRESENTER: N. GREGORY MANKIW

N. Gregory Mankiw, Robert M. Beren Professor of Economics at Harvard University, presented the 2025 Martin Feldstein...



Methods Lecture, Summer Institute 2025  
**Uncovering Causal Mechanisms:  
Mediation Analysis and  
Surrogate Indices**

Raj Chetty, Harvard University and NBER  
Kosuke Imai, Harvard University  
July 24, 2025



**2025, Methods Lecture, Raj Chetty and Kosuke Imai, "Uncovering Causal Mechanisms: Mediation Analysis and Surrogate Indices"**

PRESENTERS: [RAJ CHETTY](#) & [KOSUKE IMAI](#)

SlidesBackground materials on mediationImai, Kosuke, Dustin Tingley, and Teppei Yamamoto. (2013). "Experimental Designs...

A blue rectangular poster with three circular headshots of panelists on the left. The text on the right reads: "International Trade and Macroeconomics, Summer Institute 2025", "Panel on The Future of the Global Economy", "Oleg Itskhoki, Harvard University and NBER", "Paul Krugman, City University of New York and NBER", "Linda Tesar, University of Michigan and NBER", and "July 8, 2025".

International Trade and Macroeconomics, Summer Institute 2025  
**Panel on The Future of the Global Economy**  
Oleg Itskhoki, Harvard University and NBER  
Paul Krugman, City University of New York and NBER  
Linda Tesar, University of Michigan and NBER  
July 8, 2025

**2025, International Trade and Macroeconomics, "Panel on The Future of the Global Economy"**

PANEL DISCUSSION

PRESENTERS: [OLEG ITSKHOKI](#), [PAUL R. KRUGMAN](#) & [LINDA TESAR](#)

Supported by the Alfred P. Sloan Foundation grant #G-2023-19633, the Lynde and Harry Bradley Foundation grant #20251294...

**National Bureau of Economic Research**

[Contact Us](#)

1050 Massachusetts Avenue

Cambridge, MA 02138

[617-868-3900](tel:617-868-3900)

[info@nber.org](mailto:info@nber.org)

[webaccessibility@nber.org](mailto:webaccessibility@nber.org)

[HOMEPAGE](#)

[Accessibility Policy](#)

[Diversity Policy](#)

[Privacy Policy](#)

FOLLOW



© 2026 NATIONAL BUREAU OF ECONOMIC RESEARCH. ALL RIGHTS RESERVED.