

[Working Papers](#)

# Comparing the Economic and Conventional Approaches to Financial Planning

Jagadeesh Gokhale, Laurence J. Kotlikoff & Mark J. Warshawsky

SHARE



WORKING PAPER 7321

DOI 10.3386/w7321

ISSUE DATE August 1999

The conventional approach to retirement and life insurance planning, which is used throughout the financial planning industry, differs markedly from the economic approach. The conventional approach asks households to specify how much they want to spend before retirement, after retirement, and in the event of an untimely death of the head or spouse. It then determines the amounts of saving and life insurance needed to achieve these targets. The economic approach is based on the life-cycle model of saving. Its goal is to smooth households' living standards over their life cycles and to ensure comparable living standards for potential survivors. In the economic approach, spending targets are endogenous. They are derived by calculating the most the household can afford to consume in the present given that it wants to preserve that living standard in the future.

Although spending targets under the conventional approach can be adjusted in an iterative process to approximate those derived under the economic approach, there are practical limits to doing so. This is particularly the case for households experiencing changing demographics or facing borrowing constraints. This paper illustrates the different saving and insurance recommendations provided by economic financial planning software and the practical application of traditional financial planning software. The two

software programs are Economic Security Planner (ESPlanner), developed by Economic Security Planning, Inc., and Quicken Financial Planner (QFP), developed by Intuit. Each program is run on 24 cases, 20 of which are stylized and 4 of which are actual households. The two software programs recommend dramatically different levels of saving or life insurance in each of the 24 cases. The different saving recommendations primarily reflect ESPlanner's adjustment for household demographics and borrowing constraints. The different life insurance recommendations reflect these same factors as well as ESPlanner's accounting for contingent household plans and for Social Security's survivor benefits. The less detailed tax and Social Security retirement benefit calculations used in our implementation of QFP also explain some of the differences between the two programs.

Download a PDF

[Information on access](#)

Acknowledgements and Disclosures



Download Citation



Published Versions

Kotlikoff, Laurence J. (ed.) Essays on Saving, Bequests, Altruism, and Life-Cycle Planning. MIT Press, 2001.

Related

TOPICS

Microeconomics  
Market Structure and Distribution

## More from NBER

---

In addition to [working papers](#), the NBER disseminates affiliates' latest findings through a range of free periodicals — the [NBER Reporter](#), the [NBER Digest](#), the [Bulletin on Retirement and Disability](#), the [Bulletin on Health](#), and the [Bulletin on Entrepreneurship](#) — as well as online [conference reports](#), [video lectures](#), and [interviews](#).



15<sup>th</sup> Annual Martin Feldstein Lecture:

### **The Next Flight of the Bumblebee: The Path to Common Fiscal Policy in the Eurozone**

Mario Draghi, former President, European  
Central Bank and former Prime Minister, Italy  
Summer Institute, 2023

**2023, 15th Annual Feldstein Lecture, Mario Draghi, "The Next Flight of the Bumblebee: The Path to Common Fiscal Policy in the Eurozone"**

#### LECTURE

Dr. Mario Draghi, who served as President of the European Central Bank and Prime Minister of Italy, presented the 2023...



Methods Lecture:

## **Linear Panel Event Studies**

Jesse M. Shapiro, Harvard University and NBER

Liyang Sun, CEMFI

July 28, 2023

**2023 Methods Lectures, Jesse Shapiro and Liyang (Sophie) Sun, "Linear Panel Event Studies"**

### LECTURE

Overview: Linear panel event studies are increasingly used to estimate and plot causal effects of changes in policies...



Panel Discussion:

## **Long-Term Dynamics of the Employment-to-Population Ratio**

Karen Glenn, Social Security Administration

Stephen Goss, Social Security Administration

Nicole Maestas, Harvard University and NBER

Julie Topoleski, Congressional Budget Office

July 26, 2023



**2023, SI Economics of Social Security, Panel Discussion, "Long-Term Dynamics of the Employment-to-Population Ratio"**

Supported by the Alfred P. Sloan Foundation, the National Science Foundation, and the Lynde and Harry Bradley...

## **National Bureau of Economic Research**

### Contact Us

1050 Massachusetts Avenue  
Cambridge, MA 02138  
617-868-3900  
info@nber.org  
webaccessibility@nber.org

### HOME PAGE

Accessibility Policy

Diversity Policy

Privacy Policy

Standards of Conduct

### FOLLOW

