



An empirical comparison of published replication research in accounting, economics, finance, management, and marketing

Raymond Hubbard , Daniel E. Vetter

Show more 

 Share  Cite

[https://doi.org/10.1016/0148-2963\(95\)00084-4](https://doi.org/10.1016/0148-2963(95)00084-4)

[Get rights and content](#)

Abstract

The results of a large-scale content analysis of 18 leading business journals covering the 22-year time period 1970 to 1991 show published replication and extension research is uncommon in the business disciplines. For example, such research typically constitutes less than 10% of published empirical work in the accounting, economics, and finance areas, and 5% or less in the management and marketing fields. Further, when such work is undertaken the results usually conflict with existing findings. This raises the prospect that empirical results in these areas may be of limited value for guiding the development of business theory and practice. Strategies for cultivating a replication research tradition to facilitate knowledge development in the business disciplines are suggested.

References (60)

Robert Rosenthal

The “File Drawer Problem” and Tolerance for Null Results

Psychol. Bull. (May 1979)

David M. Levy *et al.*

Testing the Replication Hypothesis When the Data Set Is Subject to Gross Error

Econ. Letters (1990)

Larry H.P. Lang *et al.*

Managerial Performance, Tobin's q and the Gains from Successful Tender Offers

J. Financial Econ. (September 1989)

Mike Allen *et al.*

Replication and Meta-Analysis: A Necessary Connection

J. Soc. Behav. Personality (1993)

Orley Ashenfelter

Editorial Statement

Am. Econ. Rev. (September 1986)

Charles P. Bird *et al.*

30 Years Later: Attitudes Toward the Employment of Older Workers

J. Appl. Psychol. (August 1986)

Mark Blaug

The Methodology of Economics: Or How Economists Explain

(1992)

David Brinberg *et al.*

Validity and the Research Process

(1985)

Stephen W. Brown *et al.*

Building a Replication Tradition in Marketing

R.J. Bullock *et al.*

Analyzing Meta-Analysis: Potential Problems, an Unsuccessful Replication, and Evaluation Criteria

J. Appl. Psychol. (February 1985)



View more references

Cited by (174)

[Business and management research: Low instances of replication studies and a lack of author independence in replications](#)

2022, Research Policy

Show abstract

[Reproducibility and replicability crisis: How management compares to psychology and economics – A systematic review of literature](#)

2021, European Management Journal

Show abstract

[Lean production and operational performance: The influence of organizational culture](#)

2021, International Journal of Production Economics

Show abstract

[Modeling word-of-mouth usage: A replication](#)

2021, Journal of Business Research

[Show abstract](#) ✓

[Trustworthiness in e-commerce: A replication study of competing measures](#)

2021, Journal of Business Research

[Show abstract](#) ✓

[People as products: Exploring replication and corroboration in the dimensions of theory, method and context](#)

2021, Journal of Business Research

[Show abstract](#) ✓



[View all citing articles on Scopus](#)

Recommended articles (6)

Research article

[Do investors care about credit ratings? An analysis through the cycle](#)

Journal of Financial Stability, Volume 9, Issue 4, 2013, pp. 545-555

[Show abstract](#) ✓

Research article

[An interrogation of accounting–marketing interface in UK financial services organisations: Mixing cats with dogs?](#)

Australasian Marketing Journal (AMJ), Volume 24, Issue 3, 2016, pp. 214-225

[Show abstract](#) ✓

Research article

[Hidden vs. known gender effects in experimental asset markets](#)

Economics Letters, Volume 156, 2017, pp. 7-9

[Show abstract](#) ✓

Research article

[Boundary-layer features and regional transport process of an extreme haze pollution event in Nanjing, China](#)

Atmospheric Pollution Research, Volume 9, Issue 6, 2018, pp. 1088-1099

[Show abstract](#) ✓

Research article

DIY corpora for Accounting & Finance vocabulary learning

English for Specific Purposes, Volume 57, 2020, pp. 1-12

[Show abstract](#) ✓

Research article

Role of Technology in Accounting and E-accounting

Procedia - Social and Behavioral Sciences, Volume 152, 2014, pp. 852-855

[Show abstract](#) ✓

[View full text](#)

Copyright © 1996 Published by Elsevier Inc.



ELSEVIER

Copyright © 2022 Elsevier B.V. or its licensors or contributors.
ScienceDirect® is a registered trademark of Elsevier B.V.

RELX™