Housing Studies >
Volume 23, 2008 - Issue 2: The Microstructures of Housing Markets

Original Articles

Calculated Affection? Charting the Complex Economy of Home Purchase

Moira Munro & Susan J. Smith

Pages 349-367 | Received 01 Nov 2006, Published online: 11 Aug 2008

Cite this article https://doi.org/10.1080/02673030701875097

Abstra

This pap influencing
housing s is on home
purc e way
prope le compact
city, hou hose
network practice of
price. It hose
volatility an exercise
in irratio

Housing markets cultural economy price agencement

Introduction

Housing market dynamics generally, and price volatility in particular, are a core concern for analysts and policy makers who are monitoring and managing the British housing system (Aoki et al., 2001; Barker, 2004; Miles, 2004). These concerns are multiple and relate to inequalities in housing accessibility and affordability (Bramley & Karley, 2005; Holmans, 2001), the wealth implications of uneven house price appreciation (Smith, 2005; Thomas & Dorling, 2004), and the impacts of housing and mortgage markets on the buoyancy and manageability of the macro economy (Attanasio et al., 2005; Maxwell, 2005).

Housing market dynamics are traditionally accounted for with reference to economic variables, using models at various scales predicated on individuals' more or less rational behaviour (Andrew & Meen, 2003a, 2003b). However, housing markets have proved distinctively unamenable to economic generalisation or precise prediction. Cycles in house prices across Europe, for example, are not co-ordinated, and local price

variation ... t, 1996;

Ashwort ... may in

future be ... neration of

regional ... and by a

new wav ... igley, 2004;

Meen & ... pecified.

There ... g economies

in re ... of property

value an ... chological

logic inf ... hore, 2006;

Shiller, 2 ... omewhat

'closer d ... ch (housing)

economi ... ere are, for

example ... at engage

their hybrid form (the way they are constituted by affective relationships which attach people to the materials and meanings of things, including housing and home).

As a contribution to that wider microstructural project, this paper draws from a social study of local housing market dynamics in a single UK city, Edinburgh, implemented during a phase when Scotland's capital was at the leading edge of what was to become the UK's fourth major post-war 'housing boom'. In particular, the paper concentrates on how and at what price homes are bought, in order to complement a literature which often pays most attention to how properties (and, indeed, other things) are sold. Piecing together the accounts of market professionals and home buyers, the paper makes two key points.

First, the calculative practices that animate housing transactions are examined. An earlier paper describes the way that, as prices rise, market signals can break down as the supply of useful, price-relevant information for intermediaries and their clients falters (Smith et al., 2006). Drawing from the work of Michel Callon, this new paper accounts for the prices that are paid by conceptualising housing markets as collective calculative devices, characterised as much by their performance as by their predictability (Callon, 2007; Callon & Muniesa, 2005). Price is not, from this perspective, an outcome of abstract economic forces; it is a practice that is uncompromisingly social and radically material. The first part of this account is therefore about the way prices

are prac ... ments a shift

in the ce ... ogies

designed ... lay

delibera ...

Second, ... means when

the mar ... edures. In

partic ... t which are

more ... nt of the way

markets ... drivers.

These e ... ture, but

they are ... n 'irrational

exubera ... ndations

laid in C ...

interpret ... On the one

confidence in, and forge attachments to places, in price sensitive ways. On the other hand, the psychology of fear is re-examined, showing how the anxieties that inflate price ‘bubbles’ are only partly inspired by a spirit of speculation. They are more often provoked by desperation—by the risk of detachment from home.

The Study

The research informing this paper was completed in Edinburgh, Scotland, in 1999–2000. It has both quantitative and qualitative components. By analysing a comprehensive database on prices in the City (derived from the Land Registry) the research first showed that between 1996 and 1999, residential property prices in more than half of Edinburgh's post code sectors increased by at least a third. During 1998, prices rose more steeply in the majority of Edinburgh postcodes than they did in the booming South East of England (Bondi et al., 2000). The analysis also exposed a fine-grained geography of trends in house price appreciation, locating those neighbourhoods at the leading edge of the upturn at different levels of the market. This informed the choice of four case study locations: two high-priced neighbourhoods with a mix of substantial flats and family houses (G and N); one medium-priced zone of flats, including both conversions and tenements (M); and a lower-priced tenemental area, experien …

A total o …
participa … rtaken with
recent b … he four case
study ne … nce
formatio … relationships
with h … r-assisted
retri … signed by
the rese … th
professi … licitors,
estate a … pilot study
(7) cond … over a range
of persp … extending
over a s … were

The arguments in the paper are based on whole transcript reviews, together with a systematic analysis of the contents of themes and codes. The findings are illustrated with extracts that were selected to identify the range (although not always the frequency) of ideas across the entire dataset.

Practising Price: Towards an Economy of Calculation

Price has iconic status in markets. It is the mechanism around which markets hinge; it is indeed the rationale for using markets as a medium of exchange. Explaining the temporal and spatial dynamics of price is a foundational challenge for housing economics, which has, nevertheless, always found it difficult to account for the geographical variability in house prices or for local differences in price volatility. To the extent that volatile housing markets are imperfect or inefficient from an economic perspective, asymmetries in information in and around price tend to be viewed as a prime culprit. This explanation might be especially salient in settings like Edinburgh where the other major source of market imperfection—the inability of (weak) institutions to enforce contracts—is effectively controlled for. This is because in Edinburgh (as is typical for Scotland, though in contrast to England) solicitors play a crucial intermediating role—they are active in both the buying and the selling process,
and brin p-seated
conventi ch includes
informal als who
renege c cepted, it is
effective tion. So
while inf t what from
one (eco f information
betw ociological)
point among the
people, m. To
explore because it
attends stitute
markets .

While ho s not

Article contents
Related research

Edinburgh this stability is always in question since there are three ‘prices’ from the outset: a professional valuation; the advertised (offers-over or upset) price; and the purchase (bid) price. Discussion with market professionals suggests that in a volatile setting, none of these market signals corresponds in any systematic or predictable way to the intrinsic qualities of dwellings, and also that they bear no fixed relationship to each other (Smith et al., 2006). This raises the question: how are these different figures arrived at, what does the eventual purchase price mean or represent, and what does this tell us about housing market dynamics? Here is something of an answer, in two parts.

Value: The Official Statistic

If any statistic anchors the market for housing it is the ‘value’ of property. This is especially true in the Scottish system, where valuations are usually secured by buyers before, rather than after, the sale price is agreed. Valuations are therefore not only a benchmark for mortgage lending (which is particularly important where prices are rising and buyers increase their borrowing), but also an anchor for price negotiations. Nine professional surveyors active in central Edinburgh were interviewed in an open-ended way. Their job is to assess the value of properties as they change hands. A key prompt was: ‘how do you know what value to attach to a property when the market is changing ... nform quite
neatly t ... ed for a
market t ... n the notion
that pric ... nd services
(for a fin ... obviously,
with the ... study
emphasi ... s of
informat

First, ... ’:

... g … you
... property.

... ular time.

It's really a question of … being totally up to date with the market place. (Sp1)

Second, they stress the relevance of assembling a portfolio of previous sale prices; prices of dwellings that are close—in time, space and quality—to the property being valued. The importance of this is asserted in all the transcripts; it is rooted in the belief in, and experience of, valuation as a 'science' or practice of comparison.

> Properties are valued by comparing them with the most recent sale of a similar property type. (S1)

> The basis of your evaluation is comparison. (Sp1)

> You look at the comparisons. (S5)

Electronic databases provide the objective yardstick for this part of the practice of price. While it has become common over the last few years for software sorted information (on homes for sale, neighbourhood characteristics and recent sale prices) to be readily available nationally, and used to inform housing market transactions (Burrows & Ellison, 2004), Scotland generally, and Edinburgh in particular, have had this facility in some form or another for a much longer duration. At the time of this study there were two distinctive centrally compiled, electronically held, professionally
shared a … e ESPC
(Edinbur … stry
(formerl … ous sales
informat … oint for
every va … rint out of
what all … segment of
that stre

Ther … automated
valuatio … devote
more sp … at the time
of the cu … market
intellige … mely the
role of e … go out', to
inspect t … nt with the

true for a basic level survey, where there is little time to linger, as it is for the more thorough structural surveys ordered by a minority of potential buyers who require a more intensive physical evaluation.

These three procedures provide the ingredients of a valuation which, above all, is done ‘by the book’; the whole exercise is “governed by the red book, our manual, the RICS (Royal Institute of Chartered Surveyors) bible”. This text is itself material testimony to the precision, consistency and objectivity of professional valuation; it is part of the truism that there is a relatively objective or reasonably ‘correct’ price for a given bundle of property attributes at a particular place and time. ‘The book’ expresses, regulates and seals the reputation of the valuation process. It interacts with the regulatory effects of other textual materials, including “all the manuals we get from the various lenders” (S4).

So, while valuation may not be a precise science, it is regarded by those who perform it as the considered judgement of a trained eye; a practice “using all the information available” (S1) to place a figure on the price of property. This process is, moreover, in theory, robust to outside influence. It is impartial as well as objective: “we're surveying and valuing on behalf of clients, as instructed by solicitors … we feel no obligation to anybody in these circumstances” (S3). It is also consistent across all market dynamics: the way the market's gone “has made absolutely no difference to the way we do our job” (S3

All of thi … kian
economi … le indicator
of price, … se, by now
well esta … oped; that
there are … nd inherent
in ma … among
train … lue, and this
slipperin … ‘values’
might or … n the
market … “what the
property … far from
engagin … are
themsel … example,

helped unsettle the role of valuations as a market signal and changed the current of information exchange in some rather surprising ways.

The slipperiness of price is hinted at in a developing literature on behavioural valuation, which also acknowledges a disjunction between the theory and practice of valuing (Diaz et al., 2002) and which pays attention in particular to the contribution appraisers make to the 'stickiness' of prices in thin markets where turnover is slow (McAllister et al., 2003). In Edinburgh the problem is slightly different. Here valuers were taken by surprise as the pace of the market picked up; notably, as turnover increased, the technological and material infrastructure of pricing (particularly the updating of the databases) lagged behind the demand for price-relevant information. In particular, Land Registry data which (eventually) contain a comprehensive record of all sales does not materialise sale values quickly enough for them to feed into valuations: "it's eight months out of date, so it's useless" (S5). Responding to this, in a setting where "you need a lot of information; as much as you can get", valuers tended to set up 'shadow' price banks either from their own resources: "we obviously keep a database of every property that we've seen" (S1), or by patching in other data: "most solicitors are very good, they will phone us up [with price information following a sale], so we just write a note on the file for future reference" (S5). But critically, it seems that for the day-to-day of valuation, talk is as important as technology, in a process that helps tie, smooth or anchor v

other".

feedback".

we'll all help

a solicitor

or". (S2)

> "If you're the first surveyor to the door … you'll probably just go with what you feel the market has done up to that date. But if you're the last one in, and you see there's a strong demand for this house, then I think you'll probably be a little more bullish in your valuation". (S1)

> …to an extent that they may overturn the basic tenets of 'the book'

> "One thing we've found is that the condition and repair in the property doesn't seem to be important any more". (S4)
> "Half the time you're ignoring condition because the market ignores condition". (S5)

There are, then, relational qualities to valuation, (in which, as will shortly be seen, buyers and their advocates are also implicated, as Wolverton & Gallimore (1999) anticipate). In practice values are interdependent: they are contingent on, and feed into, a spiral of prices, in a context where "the rules [of the game] change each year" (S1). So, although the principle may be one of detached rationality, in practice "you go on instinct, really" (S2), in a setting where only one thing's for sure: "you never get it right in a rising market" (S5). The upshot of all this is that while there is undoubtedly a materiality to property values, this resides not just in the object being priced, nor in the software systems and hardware arrangements used to store and circulate price, but also in tl … d market actors w …

Guy & H … derstandings of prope … to reify a narrow r … vestment decision … calculative techniq … licators impl … rds a materia … which takes myriad p … r to think of price as … verb. With that in m … xt section, which co … that produce …

Article contents
Related research

The ‘asking’ price for residential property sales in Edinburgh is usually a benchmark which potential buyers are expected to respond to by lodging ‘offers over’ in a closed auction (Gibb, 1992). This is quite different from ‘English’-style ‘sequence of negotiation’ systems that not only involve more protracted bargaining but generally start from a presumption that the sale price will be somewhat below the advertised or asking price. For the Scottish case, it has already been shown how, as house price appreciation gathered momentum, ‘offers over’ or ‘upset’ prices failed to keep pace; in fact they frequently fell nominally as well as relatively (Smith et al., 2006). In their role as sellers' advocates,2 solicitors and estate agents found this downward drift of upset prices puzzling, perhaps quirky, maybe irritating, possibly bad practice, but on the whole manageable. They did, nevertheless, find themselves trapped into doing likewise by the consensus that “you can't get too bullish on your [upset] price because of the knock-on effect that that will have on the level of interest” (Sol4). So although they retained the sense that there may be a ‘realistic’ price at which properties should be offered (about 10 per cent below the expected sale price), they subscribed, at the same time, to the view that by listing this price, “the people who are looking to buy will assume that this is the same price as other people's artificially low [price]” (Sol7). In the end, this produced a system in which even selling agents realised that “too many agents are erring on the side of a low asking” (Sol5).

‘Under-q he here,
althoug an the direct
trade-of ure (Knight,
2002; Ya doubtedly
initiated owds, the
practice age a
‘bidding t is hard to
pick u udy, it is
clea enhance it;
as inclin

he Thursday
s bidding

Second, dant. There

indicator of market slow-down. Instead, as a benchmark for buyers, upset prices simply became meaningless. Surveyors, who once expected to value properties within 5 per cent, and at the most, 10 per cent of the upset price stopped referring to the asking price at all:

> I: Does the upset price have any bearings on your deliberations at all?
>
> R: None, none whatsoever. (S1)

Likewise, solicitors acting for buyers, who would once have known that upsets were about 10 per cent below the effective 'reserve', adopted a new first principle, namely: "ignore the asking price" (Sol7).

This, it might be argued, would open the door to a more 'rational' system, in which selling prices would more closely reflect impartial professional valuations. However, what the study also found is that, as time went on, valuations themselves became less and less useful as a signal for sale price, and more and more a practice influenced by that price. Solicitors talk, for example, of getting 'a feeling' for whether specific surveyors value high or low, and in a market where credit constraints are coming into play: "the temptation's always to move to a valuer who maybe values slightly on the higher side of average" (Sol5). Surveyors equally talk of the way solicitors select

surveyor ... ot a
conserv ... surveyor
who's g ... nces are
tight, it ... they'll say
'he's the ... ble question
of valua ... in touch
with soli ... at a surveyor
says" (S ... me up with
the ... rmation
interme ...

It is well ... n required to
transact ... f price in
turn-of-t ... nce of
valuatio ... ved round
the art ... buyers "the

right to say “you should be emptying the piggy bank now” (Sol2). Practising price is when the supposed expert says to a client “what's the most you can offer?” (Sol5). The key point is that, in the end, bid prices migrated from being an advocate's recommendation to expressing a buyer's inclination: the calculative energies of the market were actively and effectively redistributed away from what limited price information was circulating among intermediaries, towards the deliberative strategies of home buyers. This was experienced in two ways. On the one hand, buyers (especially those in the lower priced neighbourhoods) felt excluded from privileged circuits of information, sensing they were on their own, playing against not just a hostile market but also an unforthcoming professional body: “it's a very closed shop on their side of things” (L10), they “have it stitched up” (L11) and “they like to hold that bit of information back to give them a bit of power” (L4). On the other hand, those higher income (and typically more experienced) buyers who were more actively seeking advice found that the professionals they consulted were as much at a loss as they were: “nobody knew where the property market was going and what prices would be … So in terms of deciding what price to offer, we basically worked that out ourselves” (M07).

Interestingly, the literature on micro-economics has least to say about buyer strategies, especially in the context of a loss to the system of usable price information. Therefore,
the Edin … en's teeth
were in … dly, three
types of

The first … the
professio… spread
across th… that the
majority … ll as more or
less … d directly
with th… ame pre-
emptive … endor
directly. … just
chancing … ed bidding
arena. T… urprised ‘to
win’, and … ery rare

Article contents
Related research

A second group of 27 buyers, over one-third of the sample, held onto the notion that surveyed values provide some kind of anchor for price. Some used this quite explicitly to limit their bids: “we decided we would only put it in at the valuation; we wouldn't go crazy” (M01). While only six bought actually on value the rest did manage to keep the price within 10 per cent of that figure. This was sometimes achieved by following solicitors' recommendations. Often, though, the level of the bid was set despite rather than because of advocates' views. For the most part the tendency was to hold back: “The solicitor wanted me to go a bit higher than I did” (M03), and even explicitly to attribute keeping offers ‘within reasonable bounds’ to having “used my own judgement on how much over the valuation to offer” (G01). This group kept purchase prices close to professional valuations with the philosophy that: “I knew what my top figure was … I will not go above. End of story” (L08).

The third group of 21 buyers paid an average of just over 15 per cent (ranging between 10 and 32 per cent) above valuation for their home. This group, who again span all four price bands in the study, are most likely to report experiencing a complete vacuum of useful price information, in a setting where even valuations seemed to have no useful function. They were haunted by ‘the spectre’ of buyers who, if they really want the property, can price others out of the market. So in the absence of any clear steer on what an appropriate market price might be, this group “just decided to bid what we could af … plex story to tell (see … the way professi … and drums’, ‘empty t … the maximu … shed for ‘a silly bid’ … something we want …

Wha … ossible bids and ex … of calculati … t “it's just a lottery n … focused less on wher … nning number … directly with pro … £300 000 and so o … even £100

> The final figure was: my husband was 40 this year, my father was 60 this year and my sister was 30 and made 40 60 30. (G06)

> We put in the 25p that we had been sent by the property adviser for good luck and we asked all our best friends to pick a number. (L05)

There are anchor points for bid prices in the databases of the Land Registry and the ESPC, in the formulae applied by valuers and in local professional knowledge. But in the end, buying prices are practised in a social world: they are details of the flow as well as an element of the fixity in what Callon might call the agencement of the housing system (Callon, 2006; Hardie & MacKenzie, 2007). 'Tinkering' is part and parcel of this, it absorbs substantial calculative energies, and it influences housing outcomes. Hence, it is suggested that some of the difficulties in charting the economy of local housing markets might be addressed if such markets are understood not as distributive mechanisms in the economic sense but as agencements in the sociological sense: as assemblages of people, tools, equipment, technical devices, algorithms, and so on which are actively arranged but which partly arrange themselves. Adopting this approach, this analysis has shown how prices are practised when traditional information signals and old certainties falter. This draws attention to the tactics deployed by potential buyers and their professional advisors in a bid to 'win' at auction. In particular, it shows how the formalities of calculating price hinge on the precision of

the 'little … e question
of how b … the
following … hat nudges
some pr…

Home … s

When … at they
think pr… of inflation
as a fren… ched from
economi… conomic
conditio… the present
study (B… n
measura… f demand: a

restricted supply, particularly for bigger homes. These fundamentals might have been a necessary condition for prices to appreciate, but they were not sufficient as a trigger. In this, there are parallels with Case & Shiller's (1988) account of some late 1980s US cities, which (using postal survey results) indicated that "sudden real estate booms have, at least in part, a social, rather than rational or economic, basis" (p. 1) resulting in "a market for residential real estate that is very different from the one traditionally discussed and modelled in the literature" (p. 24).

Enlarging on the 'social' factors which complicate the conventional economic account, Case & Shiller talk about a market 'largely driven by expectations', and inhabited by speculative but irrational investor figures whose knowledge of fundamentals is limited, and whose tendency to buy above the asking price may essentially be a mistake. Subsequently, Shiller has leaned increasingly towards psychological accounts of price volatility, most recently extending his successful account of the irrational exuberance implicated in the boom and bust of the stock market, into housing (Shiller, 2005). This behavioural finance perspective draws welcome attention to the emotional energy in markets, and helpfully unpacks the psychology of price. Thus it provides a starting point for the following discussion of why it is that at least some buyers responded to a deficit of price information by paying more, rather than by withdrawing, waiting or undercutting the market (which others, not amongst the successful buyers who were intervie

Answers ... play as hard
evidence ... nic
imperati ... rgh
narrative ... e quite
decisive ... onomic
drivers a ... ships
betw

Perforr

A centra ... ice
uncertai ... to search,
bid and ... by
professi ... predictable

values and prices previously paid provide only one kind of price-relevant information circulating within, and animating, the microstructures of housing markets. This section shows how part of the information vacuum for Edinburgh buyers was filled by what is described as an ecology of hope. Hopefulness is a quality of increasing interest to those concerned with the anticipation and creation of the future (Anderson, 2006). There is less interest in this idea in either conventional economics or behavioural finance, although Miyazaki (2003) details the unexpected ways in which traders' hopes and dreams can infuse the conduct and content of financial futures markets. In relation to housing markets, an ecology of hope is part of an emotional geography attaching home seekers to the materials and meanings of the city; hope is a quality mobilising the affective ties that bind households to the structures of neighbourhoods, to the architectures of housing, and to the (potential) homeliness of individual properties.

An ecology of hope is partly anchored in a narrative of confidence in the financial, political and cultural health of the city, which threads through the accounts of market professionals and infuses the buying regime. This ecology is forged above all by a belief in, and a determination to realise, Edinburgh's particularity; its exceptionalism. This exceptionalism is economic, political, cultural and historic. So Edinburgh is experienced as "the place to be" (EA3), with a "confident vibrant economy" (EA1) that makes residential property "a global commodity in investment terms" (S6). Then there is a
sense of ... f a recently
devolved ... a hopeful
sense of ... s this great
love affa ... ip forged
between ... bond with
Georgian ... tures whose
solidity ... o) make are
detac

Mainly, ... f a
distincti ... ls accounts
of why it ... Southern
England ... city as a
whole, t ...). Narratives
like this ... surveyors,
buying

Article contents
Related research

> After the worst of the recession, we had a levelling off of some of the properties at the top end of the market … But, I mean, it only lasted six months. (S2)

> Anybody holding on to a house for … maybe a couple of years will not lose out. (Sol5)

> [last time] I didn't lose out whereas everyone else in the UK had, so I was fairly confident [this time] … because of that history. (M12)

If this were the whole story, then this performance of the Edinburgh housing scene might fit the script for an episode of ‘irrational exuberance’. It might suggest that Shiller (2005) is right to lament the over-investment in property that comes from buying into what might be nothing more than a confidence myth, as people succumb to “the herd behaviour that can spread through millions or even billions of people” engaging with the sorry tale of “how errors of human judgement can infect even the smartest people thanks to over-confidence, lack of attention to details and excessive trust in the judgement of others” (p. xii).

However, tales of the (unique) city are only one element of the emotional attachment of people to properties. Professionals may pin their hopes on the exceptionalism of the local hou … n affective bond to … umented in Christie … rewards as the dem … for housing, but also … aviour of unruly c … ublic, whose ‘feeling … interpreted less as t … f emotional intel…

One in t… heir ‘feeling rules’ w… to pay a premium … Three things a…

First, fee… deduced.

> I felt instinctively—I felt the house was right, and it was perfect. (G02)

> As soon as we went to it, it was, like, ‘this is the one’. (N09)

> We just liked it. There's no rhyme nor reason … you don't really know why you know … [it's] just a feeling a house gives you. (M08)

> The one I ended up with was the only one I really thought, that I sort of walked in and thought ‘yes I could live here, it seems like home’. (L16)

It is, of course, possible that these comments help people rationalise a decision they have already taken. However, the search narratives in the study suggests that positive feelings of attachment are not only essential—‘the feeling has got to be right’ (G06)—but also rare, and thus decisive: “We viewed around 40 properties over two months, but when I saw this property I just absolutely loved it” (L05).

The second ‘feeling rule’, then, is that positive emotional attachments to specific properties are sufficiently rare that they are as much a driver for bidding high as a form of ex post facto justification for paying over the odds. One buyer paid more than 10 per cent over the valuation for their home because: “I was waiting for this house that I had some feelings for” (G10). Moreover, not having this rare feeling is a key reason for hesitating: “it's just that I wasn't sold on it, whereas my other flat, I knew that I
despera … lace at all”
(M17). I … the
property … a price
below th …

Third, th … owned home
are the … a labour of
love. A …

… live”. (N06)

Within each of these ‘feeling rules’ the comments alert us to the fact that often decisions are negotiated within households, rather than being taken by an individual (Levy et al., 2008). This has the potential to raise the emotional stakes; the home sought is about love and family, the closest ties that bind.

It is feasible to argue that the passions of home buying, as set out above, are cynically manipulated by the sales side of the market. This, for example, is the basis of Bourdieu's (2005) account of new residential property development in France. However, all the properties bought in the Edinburgh study are ‘second hand’, and for reasons that cannot be elaborated here, property ‘staging’ is not as developed in this market as in those whose selling agents are primarily estate agents rather than solicitors. The emotional attachment that ‘feeling rules’ signify often hinges around the unique features of a dwelling: even outwardly similar terraces and tenements bear the traces of change and embellishment from generations of previous owners. There is certainly potential for these features to be manipulated into an economy of qualities (Callon et al., 2002). However, the data in this study indicate held that this particularity is as likely to be about qualities that are not generally regarded as price relevant (how a space feels, whether a corner has character) as it is about the commonly understood drivers of financial value.

So, the Edinburgh case study offers a different take on the herd instinct that
economi … re prices
seem to … they are
shaped i … ormation.
Price is … gs. In short,
it testifie … g of
irrationa …

Casi…

Hope is … ons. An
equally … n
behavio … kind of risk:
the risk … home buyers
caught i … pain of
regret’ …

Now it is very likely that the ethopolitics of neo-liberalism are refiguring the investment element of owner occupation to play up its speculative role (Smith, 2008). Certainly thoughts of capital gain and comments on 'good investment' are evident in the transcripts. Equally though there is a sense of caution: buyers even in the early phase of what was to become a major housing boom were concerned about price rises being inexorable but unsustainable. The impulse to 'buy early and pay high' was expressed less as a bid for inclusion in price appreciation, and more as fear of exclusion both from the fact of housing and the meaning of home. This is as true in the higher price bands (where "you're afraid that, you know, prices are going to go up, and you're not going to get anywhere for what you can afford" N14) as it is at the bottom end of the market (where "I was aware that things were sort of starting to move upward and I would probably need to hurry up and find somewhere" L16). Other upward price pressures included avoiding transactions costs ("the very thought of 6 or 7 surveys fills me with dread" G15) and search fatigue ("Can't bear looking any more" G05). But the main driver of prices is fear, not of financial loss, but rather of detachment from home: "the dream of me getting a place of my own was slipping" (L18). The transcripts are scattered with anxieties provoked by the risk of severing a relationship, or missing out on emotional bond, with an object of affection, and again, with the potential for that hurt to be inflicted on the whole household. These at any rate are the emotional experiences that people most readily associate with their pricing decisions; "It's very nerve w… …et this place" (L05).

So, conf… …home buyers f… …s an insuranc… …s inflating the Edin… …culation, and are fu… …st for finan…

It was sh… …ative energies… …t few digits of a bid… …en setting the large… …d is summed up by th… …property simply t…

> We probably paid over the odds, but we didn't have to fight other people. We knew we were guaranteed getting it … we paid the value which nobody would be able to pay, you know, normally. (G14)

While buyers were aware and fearful that at the broad level they were "guessing with sums they would never gamble with", in this style of market paying 'a lot' can actually be seen as less of a gamble than working around what might be a reasonable or fair market price. The above quotation continues:

> you don't save yourself money in the long run trying to be careful … the odds are really, totally, stacked against you. (G14)

From this perspective, paying a 'silly' price is a logical tactic to reduce uncertainty and minimise the risk of losing at auction. Paying a large premium over the upset price or valuation may not appear to be rational, but it is part of a logical strategy to reduce risks. Intriguingly, then, in the Edinburgh example the fears that drive prices accelerated the spiral of inflation not so much because they nudged people into a speculative frenzy, but rather because they urged people to play safe. When housing markets feel less like an arena for measured investment and more like a gambling casino, this effective way to manage risk is to exit. This might be by not playing at all, or it could, as in this example, be by paying enough to change the game. Where the risk of lo xperienced emotion deed.

Conclu

There ar literature, and t t here to enla g the network gh housing market. nse to the exhortat from studying actual calculati chel Callon's Muniesa,

Article contents | Related research

goods calculable and offering them for sale, but the study here used it to examine the distributed calculative practices around bidding and buying, in order to chart the (social and material) practice of price in the acquisition of owned homes. Finally, the approach is an attempt to use this sociological and material framework to expand the psychological drivers of behavioural finance into a more comprehensive engagement with emotional economy, at a time when both these frameworks seem poised to enhance the world of housing studies.

The specifics of the Edinburgh experience suggests that this style of analysis can illuminate the local dynamics of housing markets in several ways. First, it draws attention to the uneven spread of calculative energies across the technologies, lay competencies, professional capabilities, materials and relationships comprising housing markets. The struggles associated with calculative asymmetries between buyer and seller, what Callon (2007) calls "the confrontation of socio-technical agencements", are an obvious point of interest here (as Bourdieu, 2005 has recently shown). However, in the Edinburgh example, an equally intriguing, and for the time and place of that market more apposite, theme is the distribution of calculation among the agents and materials networked into buying.

Second, this approach offers a rethink of the way information works in relation to price. Price is not, in practice, the dependent variable that conventional economics would like.
It is a m … , for
example … s scarce, the
least sig … more
professi … s and the
most ob … ore crucial
benchm … of economic
evidence … ases and
anal … e of
affect

Finally, t … kets, which,
as Christ … ce signals
break d … havioural
finance … ever, the
data her … century

also about emotional relationships. The calculative practices implicated in house price appreciation might thus more appropriately be labelled 'emotional intelligence' than 'irrational exuberance', and the bubbles that result may be as much a product of desperation as an inclination to speculation.

Acknowledgements

The data cited in the paper are drawn from an ESRC-funded project on The Anatomy of a Housing Boom (award number R000222902); the conceptual work is supported by an ESRC fellowship (Trading Places: The Complex Economy of Housing Markets, award number RES-051-27-0126). The authors would like to thank the social studies of finance group at Edinburgh University for their close reading and constructive comments.

Notes

[1] Quotations are attributed to professionals using the following conventions: Surveyor (S), Solicitor (Sol), Estate Agent (EA); numbers refer to a unique identifier, and p denotes a pilot interview.

[2] Most o … ever, in the Edinburg … e agents.

[3] Quotat … reference (N, M, G

Relat…

Micr… …using Mark…

Sour…

The Strategic Role of Listing Price in Marketing Real Estate: Theory and Evidence

Source: Real Estate Economics

Bubbles in Metropolitan Housing Markets

Source: Unknown Repository

The Definition and Identification of Housing Submarkets

Source: Environment and Planning A Economy and Space

Assembling an Economic Actor: The Agencement of a Hedge Fund

Source: The Sociological Review

Performing (Housing) Markets

Source: Urban Studies

The use of reference points in valuation judgment

Source: Journal of Property Research

The economy of qualities

Source: Economy and Society

Owner-Occupation: At Home with a Hybrid of Money and Materials

Source: Environment and Planning A Economy and Space

Listing Price, Time on Market, and Ultimate Selling Price: Causes and Effects of Listing Price Changes

Source: Real Estate Economics

The I

Sour

Valua

Expe

Sour

ECON ROM

U.S.

S

St

Sour

Sorti zation

Sour

Hous tish

Hous

Sour

Source: Unknown Repository
Appraiser behaviour and appraisal smoothing: some qualitative and quantitative evidence
Source: Journal of Property Research
Towards Infusing Institutions and Agency into House Price Analysis
Source: Urban Studies
Social Behaviour as a Basis for Modelling the Urban Housing Market: A Review
Source: Urban Studies
Housing Transactions and the Changing Decisions of Young Households in Britain: The Microeconomic Evidence
Source: Real Estate Economics
Client Feedback and the Role of the Appraiser
Source: Journal of Real Estate Research
The Contributions of the Economics of Information to Twentieth Century Economics
Source: The Quarterly Journal of Economics
Understanding Urban Development Processes: Integrating the Economic and the Social in Property Research
Source: Urban Studies
Peripheral Vision
Sour
The I
Sour
How
Sour
Biddi
Sour
M
So
Influe hen
Buyi
Sour
Resic n and
New
Sour

Source: Organization Studies

Becoming and Being Hopeful: Towards a Theory of Affect

Source: Environment and Planning D Society and Space

Linking provided by ScholeXplorer

References

1. Abraham , J. M. and Hendershott , P. H. 1996 . Bubbles in metropolitan housing markets . Journal of Housing Research , 7 : 191 – 207 .

Google Scholar

2. Anderson , B. 2006 . Becoming and being hopeful: towards a theory of affect . Environment and Planning D: Society and Space , 24 : 733 – 752 .

Web of Science ® | Google Scholar

3. Andrew , M. and Meen , G. 2003a . House price appreciation, transactions and structural change in the British housing market: a macroeconomic perspective . Real Estate

4. Andre g decisions of you Economics , 31 :

5. Aoki , . Bank of Englar

Googl

6. Ashwo ttish Journal of Poli

Article contents | Related research

Web of Science ® Google Scholar

7. Attanasio , O. , Blow , L. , Hamilton , R. and Leicester , A. 2005 . “ Consumption, House Prices and Expectations. Working paper 271 ” . London : Bank of England .

Google Scholar

8. Banks , J. , Blundell , R. , Oldfield , Z. and Smith , J. P. 2004 . Housing Wealth Over the Life Cycle in the Presence of House Price Volatility , Cambridge, MA : National Bureau of Economic Research .

Google Scholar

9. Barker , K. 2004 . Review of Housing Supply: Final Report , London : HMSO/HM Treasury .

Google Scholar

10. Beunza, D. & Stark, D. (2006) How to recognize opportunities: heterarchical search in a trading room. Paper presented at the EU-DIME international Conference on Communities of Practice, Durham, October

Googl

11. Beunz : towards a mater

12. Bon Housing Bo ac.uk

Googl

13. Bordie lity .

Googl

Article contents Related research

14. Bramley , G. and Karley , N. K. 2005 . How much extra affordable housing is needed in England? . Housing Studies , 20 : 685 – 716 .

Web of Science ® | Google Scholar

15. Burrows , R. and Ellison , N. 2004 . Sorting places out? Towards a social politics of neighbourhood informatization . Information, Communication and Society , 7 : 321 – 336 .

Google Scholar

16. Callon , M. 2007 . " What does it mean to say that economics is performative? " . In Do Economists Make Markets: On the Performativity of Economics , Edited by: Mackenzie , D. , Muniesa , F. and Siu , L. Princeton NJ : Princeton University Press .

Google Scholar

17. Callon , M. and Muniesa , F. 2005 . Economic markets as calculative collective devices . Organization Studies , 26 : 1229 – 1250 .

Web of Science ® | Google Scholar

18. Callon ... ies .
Econo

19. Case , ... and post-
boom ... ecember

Go

20. Christ ... using
marke

Googl

21. Clarke ... omic

Google Scholar

22. Diaz , J. and Hansz , J. A. 2001 . The use of reference points in valuation judgement . Journal of Property Research , 18 : 141 – 148 .

Google Scholar

23. Diaz , J. , Gallimore , P. and Levy , D. 2002 . Residential valuation behaviour in the United States, the United Kingdom and New Zealand . Journal of Property Research , 19 : 313 – 326 .

Google Scholar

24. Gibb , K. 1992 . Bidding, auctions, and house purchase . Environment and Planning A , 24 : 853 – 869 .

Web of Science ® | Google Scholar

25. Guy , S. and Henneberry , J. 2000 . Understanding urban development processes: integrating the economic and the social in property research . Urban Studies , 39 : 2399 – 2416 .

26. Guy , … ctices, prope… ting on Institu… evelopment Semin…

Go…

27. Hansz … praisal: a transa… – 565 .

28. Hardie…

Web of Science ® Google Scholar

29. Holmans , A. 2001 . Housing Demand and Need in England: 1996–2016 , London : TCPA .

Google Scholar

30. Hwang, M. & Quigley, J. (2004) Economic Fundamentals in Local Housing Markets: Evidence from US Metropolitan Regions. Working Paper W03-005 (Institute of Business and Economic Research)

Google Scholar

31. Kauko , T. 2004 . Towards infusing institutions and agency into house price analysis . Urban Studies , 41 : 1507 – 1519 .

Web of Science ® Google Scholar

32. Kishore, R. (2006) Theory of behavioural finance and its application to property market: a change in paradigm. Paper presented at the 12th Annual Pacific Rim Real Estate Society, Auckland, January

Googl

33. Knight ... ce: causes and e ... 37 .

34. Ley ... exploring fa ... , 23 (2) : 271 –

35. McAlli ... Appraiser behav ... idence .

Article contents Related research

Google Scholar

36. Maxwell , D. 2005 . " Shifting foundations: home ownership and government objectives. Working paper for Housing Across the Lifecycle. Available at www.ippr.org " . London : IPPR .

Google Scholar

37. Meen , D. and Meen , G. 2003 . Social behaviour as a basis for modelling the urban housing market: a review . Urban Studies , 40 : 917 – 935 .

Web of Science ® | Google Scholar

38. Miles , D. 2004 . The UK Mortgage Market: Taking a Longer View , London : HMSO/HM Treasury .

Google Scholar

39. Miyazaki , H. 2003 . " Economy of Dreams: The Production of Hope in Anthropology and Finance. CSES Working Paper No. 15 " . Cornell : Department of Sociology, Cornell University .

Googl

40. O'Neil New York :
Routle

41. Shi d : Princeton
Ur

Googl

42. Smith evance of
Housi

Googl

Article contents | Related research

43. Smith, S. J. (2006) Deliberating (housing) markets: house prices, property values, home rules. Paper presented at the Housing Studies/ CRESC symposium on Housing Studies and Contemporary Research on Socio-Cultural Change: A Chance for Dialogue, Manchester, February

Google Scholar

44. Smith, S. J. (2008) Owner occupation: living with a hybrid of money and materials, Environment and Planning A (forthcoming)

Google Scholar

45. Smith , S. J. , Munro , M. and Christie , H. 2006 . Performing (housing) markets . Urban Studies , 43 : 1 – 18 .

Google Scholar

46. Stephens , M. , Whitehead , C. M. E. and Munro , M. 2005 . Evaluation of English Housing Policy 1976–2005: Overview Report , London : ODPM .

Google Scholar

47. Stiglit… twentieth
centu… November

48. Thoma… Inequality
in Gre…
www…
Go…

49. Watki… s .
Enviro…

50. Watkins, C. (2006) Microeconomic perspectives on the structure and operation of local housing markets. Paper presented to the Housing Studies Association, York

Google Scholar

51. Wolverton , M. L. and Gallimore , P. 1999 . Client feedback and the role of the appraiser . Journal of Real Estate Research , 18 : 415 – 436 .

Google Scholar

52. Yavas , A. and Yang , S. 1995 . The strategic role of listing price in marketing real estate: theory and evidence . Real Estate Economics , 23 : 347 – 368 .

Web of Science ® | Google Scholar