







Home ► All Journals ► Environmental Claims Journal ► List of Issues ► Volume 17, Issue 2 ► New Issues in Environmental Risk Insuran

Environmental Claims Journal > Volume 17, 2005 - Issue 2

55 | 0

Views CrossRef citations to date Altmetric

Articles

New Issues in Environmental Risk Insurance

William H. Howard †

Pages 153-192 | Published online: 11 Feb 2011



Full Article

Figures & data

66 Citations

Metrics

Reprints & Permissions

I Accept

Essential Onl

Show Purpose

Read this article

[†]Comments expressed herein are those of the author and do not necessarily represent the views or opinions of any current or former clients of Cozen O'Connor. This article is intended to educate readers generally on certain issues and is not intended to provide legal or professional advice. Readers should not act or rely on information provided in

this artic

Acknow

We Care About Your Privacy

We and our 843 partners store and/or access information on a device, such as unique IDs in cookies to process personal data. You may accept or manage your choices by clicking below, including your right to object where legitimate interest is used, or at any time in the privacy policy page. These choices will be signaled to our partners and will not affect browsing data. Privacy Policy

We and our partners process data to provide:

Use precise geolocation data. Actively scan device characteristics for identification. Store and/or access information on a device. Personalised advertising and content, advertising and content measurement, audience research and services development.

List of Partners (vendors)

on ozen

Bachelor of

with respect

Phi Beta

Juris Doctor



O'Conno Arts deg

Kappa, f

degree from Case. He has authored other articles and frequently speaks on insurance coverage. He is admitted to the Pennsylvania and Ohio bars, as well as federal courts in those states. Mr. Howard is a member of a number of professional associations, including the American Bar Association, in which he is an active member of the Section of Litigation's Insurance Coverage Litigation Committee, co-chairing its Environmental Coverage Subcommittee.

The author acknowledges, with thanks, the substantial contribution to this article of Margaret A. Mackowsky, a former associate at Cozen O'Connor.

Notes

[†]Comments expressed herein are those of the author and do not necessarily represent the views or opinions of any current or former clients of Cozen O'Connor. This article is intended to educate readers generally on certain issues and is not intended to provide legal or professional advice. Readers should not act or rely on information provided in this article without seeking specific legal advice on matters that concern them.

¹Anthony W. Gentile, Using Insurance to Manage Your Environmental Liabilities, Environmental Insurance: Past, Present and Future, Fourth Annual Advanced ALI-ABA Course of Study, at 369, 371 (June 12–13, 2003).

²See Matt Scroggins, Use of Cover Grows for EIL Exposures; REBEX 2004, Vol. 38, No.

42 Business Insurance at 4 (Oct. 18, 2004), available at 2004 WI 62677641. See also

Dave Le Continui Insurance the mar twenty p

× ansfer **Business** mates that years at a ed with a /el").

3"Brown to use, c Insurance Insurance

deca

lluted land I liability

3, Journal of

⁴See Michael Ha, Growing Demand, Rate Hikes Seen in Environmental Risk Market, National Underwriter Property & Casualty—Risk & Benefits Management Edition (3/17/03), available at 2003 WL 69821936; Environment—Getting Your Hands Dirty?, Post Magazine, at 211 (Feb. 27, 2003), available at 2003 WL 8530571; Paula L. Green, Insurers See Green in Brownfield Risk, Vol. 15, Issue 8 Global Finance, at 37 (Aug. 1, 2001), available at 2001 WL 11673408.

See Ann M. Waeger, Current Insurance Policies for Insuring Against Environmental Risks, Environmental Insurance, Emerging Issues and Latest Developments on the New Coverage and Insurance Cost Recovery, Fifth Annual Advanced ALI-ABA Course of Study, at 389, 396 (June 17-18, 2004) (hereinafter "Waeger"); Roberta G. Gordon, The Emerging Environmental Insurance Market, New Solutions to Environmental Problems in Business & Real Estate Deals 2003, at 698-99 (PLI 2003). Some of the newer, specialized environmental risk insurance coverages available include, but are not limited to, the following:

⁶Zuckerman, Tod I. & Raskoff, Mark C., Environmental Insurance Litigation, Practice Forms, § 7:8 (2004) (hereinafter "Zuckerman") (quoting "Pollution Legal Liability Select Policy" form).

⁷Anthony W. Gentile, Using Insurance to Manage Your Environment Liabilities, Environmental Insurance, Emerging Issues and Latest Developments on the New Coverage and Insurance Cost Recovery, at 471, 476 (June 17-18, 2004).

¹⁰ Frazei × B), 2004 WL

⁹George , Issue 1 reinafter

"Flani 11Waes

⁸ Id. § 7:7, at 7-62.

¹²Zucke

132004 V

¹⁴ Id. at

```
<sup>15</sup> Id. at *5.
<sup>16</sup>858 A.2d 39 (2004).
<sup>17</sup>See id. at 45.
<sup>18</sup>Flanigan, Jan. 1, 2004 Risk Management, supra ("More Options, Contractor's Liability
Coverage").
<sup>19</sup>Waeger, supra, at 408.
<sup>20</sup> Id. at 397.
<sup>21</sup>Zuckerman, supra, § 7:8 at 7-69 (quoting "Pollution Legal Liability Select Policy"
form).
<sup>22</sup>Zuckerman, supra, § 7:8 at 7-69 ("Pollution Legal Liability Select Policy" form,
"Insuring Agreements") (emphasis added).
<sup>23</sup> Id. § 7:8 at 7-79 (quoting "Pollution Legal Liability Select Policy" form).
<sup>24</sup>See, e.g., Boerman v. American Empire Surplus Lines Ins. Co., 50 Fed. Appx. 248,
2002 WL 31472440 (6th Cir. 2002).
<sup>25</sup>718 F. Supp. 839 (W.D. Wash. 1989) (unpublished decision).
<sup>26</sup> Id. at 841. (citation omitted).
                                                                                            ×
<sup>28</sup> Id. at
<sup>29</sup>See Ca
                                                                                                 App. Div.
1999).
30 No.
                                                                                                 ion).
<sup>32</sup> Id. at
<sup>33</sup>154 F.3
<sup>34</sup> Id. at 1052.
```

```
<sup>35</sup>22 F.3d 339 (1st Cir. 1994).
<sup>36</sup> Id. at 340.
<sup>37</sup>718 F. Supp. 839 (W.D. Wash. 1989).
<sup>38</sup>No. 04-10047 (D. Mass.) (Complaint filed June 15, 2004), reported in 3 No. 20
Mealey's Ins. Pleadings, at 12 (Jul. 27, 2004).
<sup>39</sup>See also 18 No. 35 Mealeyc's Litig. Rep. Ins., at 10 (Jul. 20, 2004).
<sup>40</sup>Zuckerman, supra, § 7:8 at 7-80 ("Pollution Legal Liability Select Policy" form).
<sup>41</sup>See Gulf Underwriters Ins. Co. v. Gordian Environmental LLC, No. M-04-402 (S.D. Tex.)
(Complaint filed Nov. 18, 2004), reported in 4 No. 5 Mealey's Ins. Pleadings, at 15 (Dec.
7, 2004).
<sup>42</sup>See id.
<sup>43</sup>No. Civ. A. 02-3009, 2003 WL 715755 (E.D.La. Feb. 26, 2003).
<sup>44</sup>939 P.2d 483 (Colo. App. 1997).
<sup>45</sup> Id. at 490.
<sup>46</sup> Id.
<sup>47</sup>The court noted that, unlike the pollution liability policy at issue, the CGL policy did
                    sice of law clause. Therefore, the court applied Colorade law to
not conta
                                                                                        X
                                                                                             id. at 490.
determin
                                                                                            generally
Furthern
                                                                                            2 (Colo.
enforcea
App. 199
                                                                                             insurance
policies,
<sup>49</sup>1996
<sup>50</sup> Id. at
<sup>51</sup> Id.
```

```
<sup>52</sup>Zuckerman, supra, § 7:8 at 7-80 to 7-81 (quoting "Pollution Legal Liability Select
Insurance Policy" form).
<sup>53</sup>695 N.Y.S.2d 562 (N.Y. App. Div. 1999).
<sup>54</sup>718 F. Supp. 839 (W.D. Wash. 1989).
<sup>55</sup> Id. at 845.
<sup>56</sup>Zuckerman, supra, § 7:8 at 7-71 to 72 (quoting "Pollution Legal Liability Select Policy"
form).
<sup>57</sup>939 P.2d 483 (Colo. App. 1997).
<sup>58</sup> Id. at 491.
<sup>59</sup> Id.
<sup>60</sup>718 F.Supp. 839 (W.D. Wash. 1989).
<sup>61</sup> Id. at 845 n. 8.
62 Id. § 7:8 at 7-72 (quoting "Pollution Legal Liability Select Policy" form).
<sup>63</sup>2001 WL 872944 (E.D. Pa. May 15, 2001).
<sup>64</sup> Id. at *1.
<sup>65</sup> Id. at *2.
<sup>66</sup> Id. at
                                                                                                   ×
<sup>67</sup>Zucke
<sup>68</sup>1997
<sup>70</sup>199
<sup>71</sup> Id. at
<sup>72</sup> Id.
<sup>73</sup>943 F. Supp. 441 (D.N.J. 1996), aff'd, 127 F. 3d 1095 (3d Cir. 1997).
```

```
<sup>74</sup>See id. at 453.
<sup>75</sup> Id.
<sup>76</sup> Id.
<sup>77</sup> Id. at 458 (emphasis in original).
<sup>78</sup>See, e.g., Yankee Caithness Joint Venture, L.P. v. Planet Ins. Co., 1996 WL 426359 at *1
(S.D.N.Y. July 30, 1996)(noting differences between Nevada and New York law regarding
the availability of punitive damages).
<sup>79</sup>See, e.g., TerraMatrix, Inc. v. U.S. Fire Ins. Co., 939 P.2d 483, 490 (Colo. App. 1997)
(applying New York law to decide obligations under a pollution liability insurance policy
pursuant to that policy's choice of law provision, but Colorado law to determine
obligations under CGL insurance policy).
<sup>81</sup> Id. at *1.
<sup>80</sup>No. 94 Civ. 8939 (KMW), No. 1996 WL 426359 (S.D.N.Y. July 30, 1996).
82148 S.W.3d 109 (Tex. 2004).
<sup>83</sup>See id. at 113-14.
<sup>84</sup>Zuckerman, supra, § 7:8 at 7-76.
<sup>85</sup>147 Wash. 2d 148, 52 P.3d 494 (2002) (en banc).
86712 Sc
                                                                                      ×
<sup>87</sup>See id
<sup>88</sup> Id. at
89Seg
                                                                                           .D. Pa.
1989
                                                                                          514 Supp.
486, 487
                                                                                          0. V.
Goshenh
                                                                                           E 3D § 218.3
(1999 &
<sup>90</sup>E.g., C
                                                                                           2002).
```

```
<sup>91</sup>642 N.W.2d 80 (Minn. Ct. App. 2002).
<sup>92</sup> Id. at 87 (emphasis in original).
<sup>93</sup> Id. at 88 (citations omitted).
<sup>94</sup>600 N.E. 2d 176 (Mass. App. 1992).
<sup>96</sup> Id., 600 N.E. at 180-81 (citations omitted).
<sup>95</sup> Id. at 180 (citations omitted).
<sup>97</sup>No. L-97311-88 (N.J. Super., Union County, May 25, 1993), reported in 7 No. 34
Mealey's Litig. Rep. Ins., at 6 (Jul. 13, 1993).
<sup>98</sup>Zuckerman, supra, § 7:1 at 7-10 to 7-11 (quoting "Commercial General Liability
Coverage Form").
<sup>99</sup> Id. § 7:8 at 7-76 (quoting "Pollution Legal Liability Select Policy" form).
<sup>100</sup> Id. § 7:9 at 7-86 to 7-87 (quoting "Cleanup Cost Cap Insurance Policy" form).
<sup>101</sup>Commerce and Industry Insurance Company "Contractors Pollution Liability Policy,"
Form 68089 (6/97), at p. 10 of 13 (American International Group, Inc. 1997).
<sup>102</sup>1996 WL 328011 (N.D. III. June 11, 1996).
<sup>103</sup> Id. at *1.
<sup>104</sup>See io
                                                                                           X
<sup>105</sup>No. 0
                                                                                               o. 15
Mealey's
<sup>106</sup>See a
107<sub>N</sub>
                                                                                               tig. Rep.
Ins., at
<sup>108</sup> Id.
<sup>109</sup>See a
                                                                                               px. 851,
2002 WI
                                                                                               al district
```

court's ruling, in a case seeking coverage for pollution damage, that California law requires horizontal exhaustion before an excess insurer is required to defend or indemnify its insured).

¹¹⁰For a discussion and detailed analysis of insurance allocation issues, see William Shelley, Richard C. Mason and Nancy C. Thome, Fundamentals of Insurance Coverage Allocation, 14 No. 9 Mealey's Litig. Rep. Ins., at 13 (Jan. 5, 2000).

¹¹¹See Sharon Steel Corp. v. Aetna Cas. & Sur. Co., 931 P.2d 127, 140 n. 19 ("Methods used by other jurisdictions include apportionment based on equal shares; apportionment based upon the premiums paid; or apportionment using a 'maximum loss' method").

¹¹²110 F.Supp. 2d 441 (E.D. Va. 2000).

¹¹³ Id. at 445.

¹¹⁴No. C-108-92 (N.J. Super. Middlesex Co.) (Order, Findings of Fact and Conclusions of Law), reported in 14 No. 23 Mealey's Litig. Rep. Ins., at 4 (Apr. 18, 2000).

¹¹⁵ Id.

¹¹⁶No. 86 Civ. 9671 (SWK), 1990 WL 9275 (S.D.N.Y. 1990).

¹¹⁷ Id. at *1.

¹¹⁸644 N.W. 2d 820 (Minn. App. 2002).



- 126 Id. § 7:9 (quoting "Cleanup Cost Cap Insurance Policy" form).
- ¹²⁷125 S. Ct. 577, 1606 Ed.2d 548 (2004).
- 128 Id. at *4. Section 113(f)(1) provides: § 9613. Civil Proceedings

(f) Contribution. (1) Any person may seek contribution from any other person who is liable or potentially liable under section 107(a) [42 U.S. C. § 9607(a)] during or following any civil action under section 106 [42 U.S.C. § 9606] or under section 107(a) [42 U.S.C. § 9607(a)]. Such claims shall be brought in accordance with this section and the Federal Rules of Civil Procedure, and shall be governed by Federal law. In resolving contribution claims, the court may allocate response costs among liable parties using such equitable factors as the court determines are appropriate. Nothing in this subsection shall diminish the right of any person to bring an action for contribution in the absence of a civil action under section 106 [42 U.S.C. § 9606] or section 107 [42 U.S.C. § 9607].

42 U.S.C. § 9613(f)(1).

¹²⁹Cooper Indus., Inc. v Aviall Services, Inc., supra, 125 S. Ct. at 583-84, 160 L. Ed.2d at 559-60.

¹³⁰ Id., 125 S. Ct. at 584-86, 160 L. Ed.2d at 560-62.

¹³¹297 F. Supp. 2d 1227 (E.D. Cal. 2004).



```
<sup>139</sup>See id.
<sup>140</sup>476 S.E.2d 481 (1996).
<sup>141</sup> Id. at 483-84.
<sup>142</sup> Id. at 490 (citations omitted).
<sup>143</sup>943 F. Supp. 441 (D.N.J. 1996), aff'd, 127 F.3d 1095 (3d Cir. 1997).
  Related research 1
                                                                                Cited by
                  Recommended articles
                                                                                             X
```

Information for Open access **Authors** Overview R&D professionals Open journals Editors **Open Select** Librarians **Dove Medical Press** Societies F1000Research Opportunities Help and information Reprints and e-prints Advertising solutions Newsroom Accelerated publication Corporate access solutions Books Keep up to date Register to receive personalised research and resources by email Sign me up Taylor & Francis Group Copyright © 2024 Informa UK Limited Privacy policy Cookies Terms & conditions Accessib X

