



Q

Feminist Economics >

Volume 19, 2013 - Issue 3: Critical and Feminist Perspectives on Financial and Economic Crises

2,722 87 Views CrossRef citations to date Altmetric

Articles

Race, Gender, Power, and the US Subprime Mortgage and Foreclosure Crisis: A Meso Analysis

Gary Dymski ➡, Jesus Hernandez & Lisa Mohanty Pages 124-151 | Published online: 03 May 2013

Solution Cite this article Attps://doi.org/10.1080/13545701.2013.791401



Abstract

This study addresses two largely unanswered questions about the United States subprime crisis: why were minority applicants, who had been excluded from equal access to mortgage credit prior to the spread of subprime loans, superincluded in subprime mortgage lending? And why didn't the flood of mortgage credit in the 2000s housing boom – an oversupply of credit suggesting supercompetition – reduce the proportion of minority and women borrowers burdened with unpayable subprime mortgages? This contribution develops a meso analysis showing how banking strategies were shaped by and reinforced patterns of racial and gender inequality, permitting lenders in evolving financial markets to offer new loan instruments to previously excluded loan applicants, and to exercise social power over – and thus extract rent from – these borrowers.

Keywords:

Race	subprime mortgages	discrimination	foreclosure	power	meso analysis
JEL Co	des:				
G21	D02 B41				

ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

The authors acknowledge the helpful comments of Arthur Paris, Jessica Gordon Nembhard, Stephanie Seguino, and of the anonymous referees of this journal on preliminary drafts of this paper. Any remaining errors are the authors' responsibility.

Notes

Only two of these references mention racial or gender discrimination per se; and these papers caution that definitive evidence of this sort of discrimination has not been shown.

Further, the terms "subprime" and "crisis" appeared jointly in 272 NBER working papers; only ten of these (3.7 percent) also used the word "discrimination" at least once. The terms "foreclosure" and "crisis" appeared jointly in 103 papers, with only seven (6.8 percent) also using the word "discrimination" at least once.

This argument has been forcefully debunked – see, for example, Elizabeth Laderman and Carolina Reid (2008) – and is not discussed further here. Nonetheless, Levine (2010) makes an argument about the influence of the CRA that is very similar to Wallison's (2009).

The term "segregation" is used here to denote geographic areas in which a disproportionate percentage of residents are racial minorities.

California Reinvestment Coalition [CRC], Community Reinvestment Association of North Carolina, Empire Justice Center, Massachusetts Affordable Housing Alliance, Neighborhood Economic Development Advocacy Project, Ohio Fair Lending Coalition, and Woodstock Institute (2010). For 1998–2002 loans, these authors found that a 1 percent decrease in housing price appreciation was associated with a 7 percent increase in foreclosures and a 3 percent decrease in distressed prepaid loans.

For further elaboration on the legal context of discrimination law, and for summaries of empirical research on credit market and housing market discrimination, see Gary A. Dymski (2006) and Devah Pager and Hana Shepherd (2008).

Joseph E. Stiglitz and Andrew Weiss (1981) show how banks might rationally redline minority neighborhoods if race is correlated with repayment risk.

Goolsbee (2007) describes the positive social and economic impacts of subprime lending.

Carolyn B. Aldana and Gary A. Dymski (<u>2004</u>) illustrate these patterns for Los Angeles County, California, in the 1990s.

HMDA data are used. Figure 1 presents an interrupted time-series because HMDA data are not available as continuous time-series. Raw HMDA data require "scrubbing" before they can be reliably reported, and different analysts use different conventions when scrubbing. Figure 1 uses exclusively data reported in Glenn B. Canner and Wayne Passmore (1994), Robert B. Avery, Kenneth P. Brevoort, and Glenn B. Canner (2006, 2008), and Robert B. Avery, Neil Bhutta, Kenneth P. Brevoort, and Glenn B. Canner (2010).

This structural situation virtually invites fraud; and according to the FCIC's (2010) thorough report, fraud permeated many aspects of the subprime lending and securitization process.

Several rate sheets used by large California mortgage companies in 2006 show the incentives at work. For example, raising the initial start rate by 0.5 percent would result in a 1 percent "rebate" to the loan broker – on a \$ 300,000 loan, this would work out to a bonus of \$ 3,000.

Avis Jones-DeWeever (2009) presents race and gender disparities for 2007 subprime loan ratios very similar to those shown here for 2005.

Note that applicants' average income levels are relatively flat by race and ethnicity across racial and ethnic residential concentration categories. That is, statistics shown in Figures 3 and 4 are not proxying for income differentials. This near-unanimity of view may be changing. A recent Federal Reserve Bank of St. Louis working paper concludes that "despite decades of policies to eliminate racial discrimination and redlining, minorities are paying more for their loans and borrowers in historically credit-disadvantaged neighborhoods still do not have equal access to credit markets" (Andra C. Ghent, Rubén Hernández-Murillo, and Michael T. Owyang 2011: 32).

Related Research Data Housing-Finance Intervention and Private Incentives: Helping Minorities and the Poor Source: Journal of money credit and banking Race, ethnicity and subprime home loan pricing Source: Journal of Economics and Business SUBPRIME MORTGAGE SEGMENTATION IN THE AMERICAN URBAN SYSTEM Source: Tijdschrift voor Economische en Sociale Geografie From the Subprime to the Exotic: Excessive Mortgage Market Risk and Foreclosures Source: Journal of the American Planning Association The cultural affinity hypothesis and mortgage lending decisions Source: The Journal of Real Estate Finance and Economics The Economics of Discrimination Source: Unknown Repository A Critical Approach to the Subprime Mortgage Crisis in the United States: Rethinking the Public Sector in Housing Source: City and Community Quantifying Discrimination: The Role of Race and Gender in the Awarding of Subprime Mortgage Loans Source: SSRN Electronic Journal The Disappearance of Race in Mortgage Lending* Source: Economic Geography The Feminist Political Economy of the Rent-Seeking Society: An Investigation of Gender Inequality and Economic Growth Source: Journal of Economic Issues A Symposium on the Subprime Crisis Source: City and Community Prejudice as Group Position: Microfoundations of a Sociological Approach to Racism and Race Relations Source: Journal of Social Issues The Changing Face of Inequality in Home Mortgage Lending

Source: Social Problems Revisiting Class: Thinking from Gender, Race, and Organizations Source: Social Politics International Studies in Gender State & Society Labor Markets as Gendered Institutions: Equality, Efficiency and Empowerment Issues Source: World Development Redlining Revisited: Mortgage Lending Patterns in Sacramento 1930-2004 Source: International Journal of Urban and Regional Research The Sociology of Discrimination: Racial Discrimination in Employment, Housing, Credit, and Consumer Markets Source: Annual Review of Sociology Race Prejudice as a Sense of Group Position Source: The Pacific Sociological Review The external costs of foreclosure: The impact of single-family mortgage foreclosures on property values Source: Housing Policy Debate American home: predatory mortgage capital and neighbourhood spaces of race and class exploitation in the united states Source: Geografiska Annaler Series B Human Geography Stratification economics: The role of intergroup inequality Source: Journal of Economics and Finance Credit and Banking Structure: Asian and African-American Experience in Los Angeles Source: The American Economic Review Race, Gender, and Statistical Representation: Predatory Mortgage Lending and the US **Community Reinvestment Movement** Source: Environment and Planning A Economy and Space How White Attitudes Vary with the Racial Composition of Local Populations: Numbers Count Source: American Sociological Review Why the Community Reinvestment Act Cannot be Blamed for the Subprime Crisis Source: City and Community Guest editors' introduction Source: Housing Policy Debate The Global Crisis and the Governance of Power in Finance Source: Unknown Repository Cities Destroyed (Again) For Cash: Forum on the U.S. Foreclosure Crisis Source: Urban Geography The 2008 HMDA Data: The Mortgage Market during a Turbulent Year Source: Federal Reserve Bulletin Housing and urban development Source: Unknown Repository

The 2006 HMDA Data Source: Federal Reserve Bulletin Mortgage Redlining: Race, Risk, and Demand Source: The Journal of Finance An Autopsy of the U.S. Financial System Source: Unknown Repository The Consequences of Mortgage Credit Expansion: Evidence from the 2007 Mortgage **Default Crisis** Source: Unknown Repository The Consequences of Mortgage Credit Expansion: Evidence from the U.S. Mortgage **Default Crisis** Source: SSRN Electronic Journal Making Sense of the Subprime Crisis Source: SSRN Electronic Journal The 2009 HMDA Data: The Mortgage Market in a Time of Low Interest Rates and **Economic Distress** Source: Federal Reserve Bulletin Financial Transformation and the Metropolis: Booms, Busts, and Banking in Los Angeles Source: Environment and Planning A Economy and Space The Consequences of the Dependence of Quality on Price Source: Unknown Repository Higher-Priced Home Lending and the 2005 HMDA Data Source: Federal Reserve Bulletin Geographies of the financial crisis Source: Area Subprime Mortgage Pricing: The Impact of Race, Ethnicity, and Gender on the Cost of Borrowing Source: Brookings-Wharton Papers on Urban Affairs This Time Is Different Source: Unknown Repository Subprime Mortgages, Foreclosures, and Urban Neighborhoods Source: The B E Journal of Economic Analysis & Policy Control Rights and Capital Structure: An Empirical Investigation Source: SSRN Electronic Journal The 2007 HMDA Data Source: Federal Reserve Bulletin Credit Rationing in Markets with Imperfect Information Source: Unknown Repository Compensation and Incentives in the Mortgage Business Source: The Economists Voice

Racial Segregation and the American Foreclosure Crisis Source: American Sociological Review Discrimination in the Credit and Housing Markets: Findings and Challenges Source: Unknown Repository Race, Redlining, and Subprime Loan Pricing Source: SSRN Electronic Journal

Related research 1

	People also read	Recommended articles	Cited by 87
--	------------------	----------------------	----------------

Information for	Open access	
Authors	Overview	
R&D professionals	Open journals	
Editors	Open Select	
Librarians	Dove Medical Press	
Societies	F1000Research	
Opportunities	Help and information	
Reprints and e-prints	Help and contact	
Advertising solutions	Newsroom	
Accelerated publication	All journals	
Corporate access solutions	Books	

Keep up to date

Register to receive personalised research and resources by email





Copyright © 2025 Informa UK Limited Privacy policy Cookies Terms & conditions Accessibility

Registered in England & Wales No. 01072954 5 Howick Place | London | SW1P 1WG

