

Financial Analysts Journal >  
Volume 66, 2010 - Issue 4

207 | 5 | 25  
Views | CrossRef citations to date | Altmetric

Guest Editorial

# Black Swan or Black Turkey? The State of Economic Knowledge and the Crash of 2007–2009

Laurence B. Siegel

Pages 6-10 | Published online: 31 Dec 2018

🗨️ Cite this article   🔗 <https://doi.org/10.2469/faj.v66.n4.4>

🌐 CFA Institute members: [sign in to access the Financial Analysts Journal](#).

Sample our  
Economics, Finance,  
Business & Industry Journals  
>> [Sign in here](#) to start your access  
to the latest two volumes for 14 days

📄 Full Article

📊 Figures & data

🗨️ Citations

📊 Metrics

📄 Reprints & Permissions

Read this article

## We Care About Your Privacy

We and our 845 partners store and/or access information on a device, such as unique IDs in cookies to process personal data. You may accept or manage your choices by clicking below, including your right to object where legitimate interest is used, or at any time in the privacy policy page. These choices will be signaled to our partners and will not affect browsing data. [Privacy Policy](#)

We and our partners process data to provide:

Use precise geolocation data. Actively scan device characteristics for identification. Store and/or access information on a device. Personalised advertising and content, advertising and content measurement, audience research and services development.

[List of Partners \(vendors\)](#)

✕  
I Accept

Essential Only

Show Purpose



## GUEST EDITORIAL

Laurence B. Siegel  
*Research Foundation of CFA Institute*  
 Charlottesville, Virginia  
*Ounavarra Capital LLC*  
 New York City

## Black Swan or Black Turkey? The State of Economic Knowledge and the Crash of 2007–2009

Nassim Nicholas Taleb has an elegant explanation for the global financial crisis of 2007–2009: It's a black swan.<sup>1</sup> A black swan is a very bad event that is not easily foreseeable—because prior examples of it are not in the historical data record—but that happens anyway. My explanation is more prosaic: The crisis was a black turkey, an event that is everywhere in the data—it happens all the time—but to which one is willfully blind. Table 1 presents large negative returns on major asset classes around the world over roughly the last century; from that perspective, the 57 percent decline in the S&P 500 Index is hardly unique. There is no mystery to be explained: Markets fluctuate, often violently, and sometimes assets are worth a fraction of what you paid for them.

Yet the market declines of 2007–2009 are sometimes accused of overturning various bodies of more or less established knowledge in financial economics and macroeconomics. Let's examine these accusations.

**Table 1. Black Turkeys All Over the Place**

Asset Class	Period	Peak-to-Trough Decline
U.S. stocks (real total return)	1911–1920	51%
U.S. stocks (DJIA, daily)	1929–1932	89
Long U.S. Treasury bonds (real total return)	1941–1981	67
U.S. stocks	1973–1974	49
U.K. stocks (real total return)	1972–1974	74
Gold	1980–1985	62
Oil	1980–1986	71
Japanese stocks	1990–2009	82
U.S. stocks (S&P 500)	2000–2002	49
U.S. stocks (NASDAQ)	2000–2002	78
U.S. stocks (S&P 500)	2007–2009	57

## Efficient Market Hypothesis

The efficient market hypothesis (EMH) is a specific proposition about market prices (that they always reflect all available information) and not an assertion that a market economy is an efficient way to organize society (an entirely separate question). The EMH is not realistic, but it is a starting point that enables us to derive many valuable insights in finance, including the capital asset pricing model and the Black–Scholes option pricing model. Although a few diehards may still assert that markets are efficient, the contrary evidence of more than 40 years is overwhelming.

Most financial economists consider the EMH valuable because it places the burden of proof on the analyst who would beat the market. The test of the analyst's ability to make forecasts superior to the market-consensus forecasts is the subsequent alpha, correctly calculated to remove all beta influences.

Thus, the EMH resembles the presumption of the defendant's innocence in a criminal trial. Nobody really thinks that all or even most criminal defendants are innocent, yet it is hard to imagine a fair starting point other than the presumption of innocence. The burden of proof must be on the prosecutor to "prove" the defendant guilty.

As a realistic description of nature, the EMH has long been subject to serious challenges. Perhaps the most vivid is the crash of 19 October 1987, when the U.S. equity market fell by 22 percent in one day and some non-U.S. markets fell even more—for example, Hong Kong declined by 45 percent. In the language of the EMH, only two explanations for such a decline are possible:

1. The price was fair (reflecting all available information) before, during, and after the crash; that is, the fundamental value of U.S. stocks declined by 22 percent in one day.
2. The price was unfair at some point in time—either before the crash (the price was too high), after the crash (the price was too low), or



Notes

<sup>1</sup> Nassim Nicholas Taleb, *The Black Swan: The Impact of the Highly Improbable* (New York: Random House, 2007).

<sup>2</sup> As I see it, the sense and the Merton model

New York:

ophical  
 Sharpe,  
 rs.

Markowitz's normative algorithm should be called optimization or mean-variance optimization.

<sup>3</sup> Harry M. Markowitz, *Portfolio Selection: Efficient Diversification of Investments* (New York: John Wiley & Sons, 1959).

<sup>4</sup> Paul Krugman, "How Did Economists Get It So Wrong?" *New York Times* (2 September 2009): [www.nytimes.com/2009/09/06/magazine/06Economic-t.html?\\_r=1](http://www.nytimes.com/2009/09/06/magazine/06Economic-t.html?_r=1); retrieved 29 May 2010.

<sup>5</sup> John H. Cochrane, "How Did Paul Krugman Get It So Wrong?" (2009): <http://modeledbehavior.com/2009/09/11/john-cochrane-responds-to-paul-krugman-full-text/>; retrieved 29 May 2010.

<sup>6</sup> Narayana R. Kocherlakota, "Modern Macroeconomic Models as Tools for Economic Policy" (2010): [www.minneapolisfed.org/publications\\_papers/pub\\_display.cfm?id=4428](http://www.minneapolisfed.org/publications_papers/pub_display.cfm?id=4428); retrieved 29 May 2010.

<sup>7</sup> Even the low measured volatility of the two decades preceding the crash is suspect. Christina Romer, chair of President Obama's Council of Economic Advisers, studied modern macroeconomic data using methods from the more volatile pre-World War II period and concluded that the "Great Moderation" was essentially a data error: Rather than reflecting any actual change, it arose from the changing methods used to measure the volatility of the real economy. See Christina D. Romer, "Is the Stabilization of the Postwar Economy a Figment of the Data?" *American Economic Review*, vol. 76, no. 3 (June 1986):314-334.

×

Log i

> Acc

Log i

> Log

# Restore content access

➤ Restore content access for purchases made as guest


## Purchase options \*

Save for later

### PDF download + Online access

- 48 hours access to article PDF & online version
- Article PDF can be downloaded
- Article PDF can be printed


USD 53.00

 Add to cart

### Issue Purchase

- 30 days online access to complete issue
- Article PDFs can be downloaded
- Article PDFs can be printed

USD 162.00

 Add to cart

\* Local tax will be added as applicable

## Related



Black S

Na  
The  
Publishe

DISSEC

Jochen

Critical Review

Published online: 11 Jan 2010



Mark Blyth  
Critical Review  
Published online: 11 Jan 2010

Information for

- Authors
- R&D professionals
- Editors
- Librarians
- Societies

Opportunities

- Reprints and e-prints
- Advertising solutions
- Accelerated publication
- Corporate access solutions

Open access

- Overview
- Open journals
- Open Select
- Dove Medical Press
- F1000Research

Help and information

- Help and contact
- Newsroom
- All journals
- Books

Keep up to date

Register to receive personalised research and resources by email

-  Sign up
-  
-  



Copyright © 2010 John Wiley & Sons, Inc. All rights reserved. Published online in Wiley InterScience (www.interscience.wiley.com). DOI: 10.1002/9781118134463.ch10

Access to this journal is restricted to subscribers. For more information on this journal, please visit the journal website at [www.interscience.wiley.com](http://www.interscience.wiley.com)

Registered with the Copyright Clearance Center, Inc., 222 Rosewood Drive, Danvers, MA 01923. Registered with the Copyright Licensing Agency, 90 Tottenham Court Road, London W1P 0LP, UK. Registered with the Copyright Licensing Agency, 90 Tottenham Court Road, London W1P 0LP, UK. Registered with the Copyright Licensing Agency, 90 Tottenham Court Road, London W1P 0LP, UK.