

232 | 6 | 25
Views | CrossRef citations to date | Altmetric

Guest Editorial


Black Swan or Black Turkey? The State of Economic Knowledge and the Crash of 2007–2009


Laurence B. Siegel

Pages 6-10 | Published online: 31 Dec 2018

 Cite this article  <https://doi.org/10.2469/faj.v66.n4.4>

 CFA Institute members: [sign in to access the Financial Analysts Journal](#).

 Sample our Mathematics & Statistics journals, sign in here to start your FREE access for 14 days

 Full Article

 Figures & data

 Citations

 Metrics

 Reprints & Permissions

Read the

We Care About Your Privacy

We and our 891 partners store and access personal data, like browsing data or unique identifiers, on your device. Selecting I Accept enables tracking technologies to support the purposes shown under we and our partners process data to provide. Selecting Reject All or withdrawing your consent will disable them. If trackers are disabled, some content and ads you see may not be as relevant to you. You can resurface this menu to change your choices or withdraw consent at any time by clicking the Show Purposes link on the bottom of the webpage. Your choices will have effect within our Website. For more details, refer to our Privacy Policy. [Here](#)

We and our partners process data to provide:

Use precise geolocation data. Actively scan device

 I Accept

Reject All

Show Purpose



GUEST EDITORIAL

Laurence B. Siegel
Research Foundation of CFA Institute
 Charlottesville, Virginia
Ounavarra Capital LLC
 New York City

Black Swan or Black Turkey? The State of Economic Knowledge and the Crash of 2007–2009

Nassim Nicholas Taleb has an elegant explanation for the global financial crisis of 2007–2009: It's a black swan.¹ A black swan is a very bad event that is not easily foreseeable—because prior examples of it are not in the historical data record—but that happens anyway. My explanation is more prosaic: The crisis was a black turkey, an event that is everywhere in the data—it happens all the time—but to which one is willfully blind. Table 1 presents large negative returns on major asset classes around the world over roughly the last century; from that perspective, the 57 percent decline in the S&P 500 Index is hardly unique. There is no mystery to be explained: Markets fluctuate, often violently, and sometimes assets are worth a fraction of what you paid for them.

Yet the market declines of 2007–2009 are sometimes accused of overturning various bodies of more or less established knowledge in financial economics and macroeconomics. Let's examine these accusations.

Table 1. Black Turkeys All Over the Place

Asset Class	Period	Peak-to-Trough Decline
U.S. stocks (real total return)	1911–1920	51%
U.S. stocks (DJIA, daily)	1929–1932	89
Long U.S. Treasury bonds (real total return)	1941–1981	67

Efficient Market Hypothesis

The efficient market hypothesis (EMH) is a specific proposition about market prices (that they always reflect all available information) and not an assertion that a market economy is an efficient way to organize society (an entirely separate question). The EMH is not realistic, but it is a starting point that enables us to derive many valuable insights in finance, including the capital asset pricing model and the Black–Scholes option pricing model. Although a few diehards may still assert that markets are efficient, the contrary evidence of more than 40 years is overwhelming.

Most financial economists consider the EMH valuable because it places the burden of proof on the analyst who would beat the market. The test of the analyst's ability to make forecasts superior to the market-consensus forecasts is the subsequent alpha, correctly calculated to remove all beta influences.

Thus, the EMH resembles the presumption of the defendant's innocence in a criminal trial. Nobody really thinks that all or even most criminal defendants are innocent, yet it is hard to imagine a fair starting point other than the presumption of innocence. The burden of proof must be on the prosecutor to "prove" the defendant guilty.

As a realistic description of nature, the EMH has long been subject to serious challenges. Perhaps the most vivid is the crash of 19 October 1987, when the U.S. equity market fell by 22 percent in one day and some non-U.S. markets fell even more—for example, Hong Kong declined by 45 percent. In the language of the EMH, only two explanations for such a decline are possible:



¹ Nassim
 Random

² As I see
 sense ar
 Merton M

New York:

ophical
 Sharpe,
 rs.

Markowitz's normative algorithm should be called optimization or mean-variance optimization.

³ Harry M. Markowitz, *Portfolio Selection: Efficient Diversification of Investments* (New York: John Wiley & Sons, 1959).

⁴ Paul Krugman, "How Did Economists Get It So Wrong?" *New York Times* (2 September 2009): www.nytimes.com/2009/09/06/magazine/06Economic-t.html?_r=1; retrieved 29 May 2010.

⁵ John H. Cochrane, "How Did Paul Krugman Get It So Wrong?" (2009): <http://modeledbehavior.com/2009/09/11/john-cochrane-responds-to-paul-krugman-full-text>; retrieved 29 May 2010.

⁶ Narayana R. Kocherlakota, "Modern Macroeconomic Models as Tools for Economic Policy" (2010): www.minneapolisfed.org/publications_papers/pub_display.cfm?id=4428; retrieved 29 May 2010.

⁷ Even the low measured volatility of the two decades preceding the crash is suspect. Christina Romer, chair of President Obama's Council of Economic Advisers, studied modern macroeconomic data using methods from the more volatile pre-World War II period and concluded that the "Great Moderation" was essentially a data error: Rather than reflecting any actual change, it arose from the changing methods used to measure the volatility of the economy. *American Economic Review* 76, no. 3 (June 1986): 958-72.



Log

> Acc

Log i

> Log

Restore content access

➤ Restore content access for purchases made as guest


Purchase options *

Save for later

PDF download + Online access

- 48 hours access to article PDF & online version
- Article PDF can be downloaded
- Article PDF can be printed


EUR 48.00

 Add to
cart

Issue Purchase

- 30 days online access to complete issue
- Article PDFs can be downloaded
- Article PDFs can be printed

EUR 175.00

 Add to
cart

* Local tax will be added as applicable

Related



Information for

- Authors
- R&D professionals
- Editors
- Librarians
- Societies

Opportunities

- Reprints and e-prints
- Advertising solutions
- Accelerated publication
- Corporate access solutions

Open access

- Overview
- Open journals
- Open Select
- Dove Medical Press
- F1000Research

Help and information

- Help and contact
- Newsroom
- All journals
- Books

Keep up to date

Register to receive personalised research and resources by email

 Sign me up



Copyright © 2024

Accessibility

Registered in England
5 Howick Place

John Wiley & Francis Group
a John Wiley & Francis business

